### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### **OFFICIAL REPORT**

Wednesday, 22nd October, 2008

The House met at 2.30 p.m.

[Mr. Speaker in the Chair]

**PRAYERS** 

#### NOTICE OF MOTION

A BILL TO AMEND THE TEA ACT

**Dr. Kones:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to give notice of the following Motion:THAT, aware that the tea sector is facing the worst crisis in recent years which involves dwindling earnings which have forced farmers to uproot the crop in favour of the more lucrative and stable horticultural crops; cognisant that tea exports have been a leading foreign exchange earner for the country; further aware that the small-holder tea farmer is at the mercy of a single marketing agency; KTDA; this House grants leave to introduce a Bill to amend the Tea Act, Cap.343, in order to make the industry more lucrative, vibrant and the agency more responsive to small-holder tea farmers.

#### **QUESTION BY PRIVATE NOTICE**

SAFEGUARDING KENYANS' INTERESTS IN ECONET ROLL-OUT

- **Mr. K. Kilonzo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to ask the Minister for Information and Communications the following Question by Private Notice:-
- (a) Could the Minister confirm that Econet Wireless Kenya Limited plans to roll out mobile telephone services in the country without the involvement of Kenya National Federation of Cooperatives, despite the latter having been part of the consortium that was awarded the licence?
- (b) What urgent steps is the Minister taking to ensure that the interest of the millions of Kenyans in the co-operative movement is safeguarded in the venture?

#### **CONSIDERED RULING**

MR. K. KILONZO'S QUESTION BY PRIVATE
NOTICE TOUCHES ON MATTERS
THAT ARE SUB-JUDICE

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, hon. Members! In respect to the Question by the hon. Member for Mutito, I have a ruling to make which the Speaker had promised he would give today. You will

recall that on Tuesday, 14th October, 2008, the hon. Member for Mutito, Mr. K. Kilonzo, rose on a point of order to seek a Ministerial Statement from the Minister for Co-operative Development and Marketing on the status of the shareholding of Kenyan farmers in the third mobile company, Econet Wireless Kenya Limited, which is said to be about to roll-out mobile telephone services in the country. The hon. Minister promised to

On Thursday, 16th October, 2008, the Member for Mutito, Mr. K. Kilonzo, sought to ask the Minister for Information and Communications a Question by Private Notice. The Question asked the Minister to confirm that Econet Wireless Limited plans to roll out mobile telephone services in the country without the involvement of the Kenya National Federation of Co-operatives

despite the latter having been part of the consortium that was awarded the licence.

On the same Thursday, the hon. Assistant Minister for Information and Communications, Mr. George Khaniri, sought the Chair's direction and ruling on whether he should answer the Question by Mr. K. Kilonzo as he considered that the matter was *sub judice* under Standing Order No.74. The Assistant Minister tabled in the House the plaint in High Court, Milimani Commercial Courts Civil Suit No.560 of 2006, Kenya National Federation of Co-operatives Limited *versus* Econet Wireless Kenya Limited and three others. The Minister for Co-operative Development and Marketing also sought to know if he may proceed to issue the Ministerial Statement on Econet Wireless Kenya Limited and the Kenya National Federation of Co-operatives. The Chair promised to read the tabled plaint together with the Question and the Ministerial Statement sought and give a ruling on whether the matters are *sub judice* on Wednesday the 22nd October, 2008.

Hon. Members, I have now carefully read the 15-page plaint and verified affidavit in High Court, Milimani Commercial Courts Civil Suit No.560 of 2006, Kenya National Federation of Cooperatives Limited *versus* Econet Wireless Kenya Limited and three others. The *sub judice* rule is a long established parliamentary rule. It is one that safeguards the cardinal principle of separation of powers between the Legislature and the Judiciary. Both Parliament and the Judiciary are careful not to act so as to cause conflict between them. It seeks to avoid prejudicing a case that is pending for determination before a court of law. This protects the rights of all parties to the dispute.

The *sub judice* rule prescribes that Parliament shall not discuss a matter that is the subject of a case pending before the courts. Standing Order No.37 paragraph 10 states as follows:-

"Reference shall not be made in a Question to any particular matter which is *sub judice*."

Standing Order No.74 states as follows:-

issue the Statement on Thursday, 16th October, 2008.

"No Member shall refer to any particular matter which is *sub judice* or to any matter which is in its nature secret."

It is noteworthy that at Westminster, successive Speakers have exercised their discretion to allow matters to be discussed although they might fall within the strict terms of the *sub judice* rule where they have considered that no substantial risk of prejudicing court proceedings will arise. In the present case, it is clear to me that the matters raised in both the point of order and Question by Private Notice by the hon. Member for Mutito, Mr. K. Kilonzo, are substantially the same matters as are raised in the aforesaid suit in High Court, Milimani Commercial Courts Civil Suit No.560 of 2006.

It appears to me that the questions raised by the hon. Member cannot be answered without commenting on the merits of what the court has been asked to adjudicate. The questions by the hon. Member concern some of the very matters which the court has before it for determination. I, therefore, rule that both the point of order and Question by Private Notice by the Member for Mutito, Mr. K. Kilonzo, raise matters that are *sub judice*. The same are out of order, and the Ministers for Co-operative Development and Marketing and Information and Communications

shall not respond to them.

Nevertheless, the matters raised by the hon. Member are important and it is the expectation of this House that the courts seized of these matters shall, in the public interest, expedite their disposal.

Thank you.

Mr. K. Kilonzo: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I want to thank you for your ruling. I would not want to be seen to be questioning your ruling or contradicting it. The poor farmers are crying to this august House that they are being fleeced. They are looking at this House to protect them. While I do not want us to discuss the contents or the merits and demerits of the matter, would I be in order to ask you to exercise your discretion by asking the Minister for Information and Communications and the Minister of Co-operative Development and Marketing not to expedite the functions of the parties concerned until the court rules on this matter? The so-called Econet should not roll out its service until we hear the verdict of the courts.

**Mr. Speaker:** Hon. Members, that, to me, is a very valid concern. Given that the matter is pending before court, there are ways of moving the court to ensure that the IPO is not rolled out. Among these would be for any of the parties to the suit to ask for injunctive orders from the court. The hon. Member for Mutito, or any other Member for that matter, who may be interested for the sake of the public, is at liberty to ask to be enjoined to the suit and to make an appropriate application for the necessary restraining orders. That is the position in law and so my ruling shall stand accordingly.

That notwithstanding, I believe that all Ministers are appointed to serve in their respective portfolios for the greater interest of the Kenyan public. So, the Minister for Co-operative Development and Marketing as well as the Minister for Information and Communications are under duty to ensure that the public interest is safeguarded jealously.

#### **ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS**

Question No.183

#### SWINDLING OF PUBLIC BY LOTTERY FIRMS

**Mr.** Nguyai: Mr. Speaker, Sir, unfortunately, I have not received a written reply to this Question. I would have wanted to have that written reply, so that I can peruse it before I further interrogate the answer.

Mr. Speaker: Vice-President and Minister for Home Affairs, this is your baby!

The Vice-President and Minister for Home Affairs (Mr. Musyoka): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wish to apologise to the Member for Kikuyu for the fact that he has not received the signed copy of the reply to this Question. That being the case, I wonder whether he would indulge me because I am ready to answer the Question.

**Mr. Speaker:** Member for Kikuyu, are you going to be comfortable if you are given the answer now and we revisit your Question a little later?

Mr. Nguyai: Certainly, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Very well! Then we will proceed accordingly. Vice-President and Minister for Home Affairs, if you, please, give your written answer to the Member, then we will come back to the Question.

#### STALLING OF MIGORI DISTRICT HEADQUARTERS PROJECT

#### Mr. Pesa asked the

Minister of State for Provincial Administration and Internal Security:-

- (a) whether he is aware that the construction of Migori District Headquarters stalled in 1995;
  - (b) whether he could explain the circumstances that led to the stalling of the construction of the headquarters for the last 15 years;
  - (c) who the constructor was and how much she/he was paid out of the money earmarked for the construction of the headquarters; and,
  - (d) what plans he has to revive the construction and finish the headquarters.
  - Dr. Otichilo: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.
  - Mr. Speaker: Dr. Otichilo, I am aware you are there! The Chair is exercising its discretion.
  - Mr. Minister of State for Provincial Administration and Internal Security!

The Assistant Minister, Ministry of State for Provincial Administration and Internal Security (Mr. Lesrima): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

- (a) Yes, I am aware. The construction of Migori District Headquarters stalled in 1995.
- (b) The initial construction experienced funding difficulties, and there was intermittent progress resulting in the stalling of works at an early stage. Finally, the project was handed over, as it was, to the Government on 24th February, 1999.
- (c) The contract was awarded to Carpentocraft Building Contractors at a contract sum of Kshs518,026,759. The total amount paid to them up to 3rd December, 2002, was Kshs162,679,082.20.
- (d) The completion of the works has been included in the Completion of Stalled Projects Programme, which began in 2003. The initial scope of the works has been reduced in response to the current requirements and available resources, with the estimated cost of the works being Kshs505 million for the first phase. The rest of the project will be completed in subsequent phases.

The first phase of the works has been tendered, evaluated and is awaiting award by the Ministerial Tender Committee of the Ministry of Public Works for the works to commence on site.

**Mr. Pesa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is a very serious issue. The amount of money that was paid to the contractor amounts to almost one-third of the estimated cost of the construction works, yet hardly the foundation was done. That is where the works stalled.

Is the Assistant Minister satisfied that the money that was paid was for the work actually done?

- **Mr. Lesrima:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the information I have from the relevant Ministry is that the project is 30 per cent complete. The following facilitates were to be provided:-
  - (i) Office conference hall block on five levels; this stalled at the foundation level.
- (ii) The District Commissioner's (DC) residence and domestic quarters, which is almost 95 per cent complete.
  - (iii) The DC's guest wing, which is 50 per cent complete.
  - (iv) Administration Police (APs) lines, one block, which is complete except the finishing.

That is the position. I am not satisfied with the progress made and I cannot vouch for value for money.

**Mr. Olago:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the answer by the Assistant Minister does not respond to part "b" of the Question which is: "What are the circumstances that led to the stalling of this project?"

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Olago, is that the question you want to raise?

Mr. Olago: Not yet, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

- Mr. Speaker: Then ask the question!
- **Mr. Olago:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, if this project was quantified at Kshs518 million in 1999 and Phase I was quantified at Kshs500 million, what caused this? What is the Assistant Minister doing about the contractor who has caused this delay?
- **Mr. Lesrima:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, part "c" of the Question is answered by part "d" of the answer. The winding-up was agreed upon on the grounds that there were no sufficient funds at the time. This was a fairly ambitious programme. So, both parties mutually agreed to wind up the programme and await subsequent budgeting.

However, in 2003 during the previous administration, there was a taskforce to deal with stalled projects. There were a number of projects which had stalled over the years. The Completion of Stalled Projects Programme will cost about Kshs21 billion. This particular project is being revived under the Completion of Stalled Projects Programme, whose budget is in the Ministry of Public Works. The programme is to be implemented by the Ministry of Public Works. I can only identify the stalled projects under the Office of the President.

- **Mr. Pesa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, could the Assistant Minister tell the House when this first phase will be completed?
- **Mr. Lesrima:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, as I said earlier on, the first phase will be awarded when the Ministerial Tender Committee in the Ministry of Public Works finalises its work. They should award the tender and commence the work before the end of the year.

#### Question No.267

#### REHABILITATION OF KIMA-EMUSUTSWI/ MAJENGO-LUANDA ROADS

#### **Dr. Otichilo** asked the Minister for Roads:-

- (a) whether he is aware that since Kima-Emusutswi Road was tarmacked, it has never been maintained and now has numerous and dangerous potholes, with most of the culverts blocked;
- (b) whether he is further aware that the Majengo-Luanda tarmac road is currently in a state of serious disrepair; and,
- (c) what urgent steps he is taking to ensure that these roads are repaired and maintained on a regular basis.

#### The Assistant Minister for Roads (Dr. Machage): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

- (a) I am aware that since Kima-Emusutswi Road (D264) was tarmacked, it has not received periodic maintenance.
- (b) I am further aware that Majengo-Luanda Road (C38) is currently in a condition that cannot provide a satisfactory level of service.
- (c) My Ministry is taking the following urgent steps to ensure that these roads are repaired and maintained on a regular basis.
- (i) The rehabilitation of the Majengo-Luanda Road (C38) has been included under the project for the completion of outstanding works on Kisumu-Yala Road, which is classified as (B1) and Kshs8 million has been allocated for the project in the Road Maintenance Levy Fund Budget for the Financial Year 2008/2009.
- (ii) With regard to the Kima-Emusutswi, Road (D264), an amount of Kshs1,100,000 has been allocated in the Road Maintenance Budget for the Financial Year 2008/2009 for holding maintenance.

The road shall be prioritised for periodic maintenance in the Financial Year 2009/2010.

**Dr. Otichilo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, first, I wish to thank the Assistant Minister, and the entire Ministry, for visiting Emuhaya to inspect the road from Yala through Kilingili, Eshululo to Khumsalaba. Because of their visit, the contractor is now doing a good job on the road. So, I want to acknowledge what they have done.

The Majengo-Luanda and the Kima-Emusutswi Roads are the most important roads in Emuhaya and Vihiga and because of their state, business in Emuhaya has stalled and people cannot travel. When will the Assistant Minister initiate the rehabilitation programme? Currently, the road between Luanda and Majengo is under the control of some youths, who are filling the potholes with soil and are demanding payment. So, when will these roads be rehabilitated?

- **Dr. Machage:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I thank the Member for appreciating the work that we are doing in the Ministry. May I assure him that I intend to start the works immediately this House passes the Budget of the Ministry for 2008/2009.
- **Dr. Khalwale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, it took the Minister's visit for the contractor to move to site. I also remember that, on the same day, the same Minister visited the Kisumu-Kakamega-Webuye Road. Why has the contractor not also moved to site?
- **Dr. Machage:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am also investigating that. I want to know why he has not started his work.

#### (Laughter)

- **Mr. Speaker:** Order, hon. Members! I hope, Dr. Khalwale, you are not implying that because the Speaker is a stakeholder in this one the Minister visited it!
- **Mr. Midiwo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, you being the Speaker, I think Dr. Khalwale would be wrong to imply that. At least, you need a good road.

I used the Luanda-Majengo Road about three weeks ago and it should not even be called a road. Even the formation has been eroded. However, the Assistant Minister has mentioned another road which affects the Speaker also, namely, the Kisumu-Yala, Road (B1).

Last year, I asked a Question in this House, and wrote to the then Minister for Roads, hon. Nyachae, to consider putting bumps at the markets on Road B1, particularly around Yala, Muhanda, Kodiaga, Malanga, up to Unguja. Every week, somebody is knocked down and killed by big trailers and speeding vehicles on that road. The answer was that, that is a highway and we cannot put bumps on it. At the same time, the Kisiani-Bondo-Usenge Road was built and, in all the market centres, bumps have been put. That is a big highway as the other one.

- **Mr. Speaker:** Order, hon. Midiwo! Being one of the Chief Whips, you are supposed to demonstrate by example that you know the rules of this House. You should quickly come to your question when it is Question Time. Ask the question!
- **Mr. Midiwo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, could the Assistant Minister assure the people who ply and live around Road B1 that bumps are going to be erected at all black spots as soon as possible and that all the bushes along the road are going to be cleared so that our people can stop dying?
- **Dr. Machage:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is an interesting issue where the Ministry usually goes to repair roads to minimise accidents, enhance transportation and shorten the time it takes one to move from point "A" to point "B". After we have maintained the roads, we are again made to erect road bumps in order to reduce that time. Anyway, I will look at this road on merit and see whether the observation the hon. Member has made warrants erection of road bumps.
- **Mr.** Were: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Assistant Minister has indicated that Kshs1.1 million has been set aside for Kima-Emusustwi Road and Kshs8 million for Majengo-Luanda Road respectively. These are tarmac roads. Is the Assistant Minister satisfied that the amount of money provided is enough to do this job?

- **Dr. Machage:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, indeed, I am not satisfied with this amount of money. I have, therefore, projected for a further funding of Kshs20 million in the 2009/2010 Budget. Thereafter, we shall require Kshs21 million for the same road. That comes to Kshs41 million. I believe that will be of good use.
- **Dr. Otichilo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, could the Assistant Minister confirm that the rehabilitation work that will be undertaken on Kima-Emusutswi Road will include the repair of guard rails on the two bridges on the road, that is, at Jordan and Mulisalula? Could he also confirm that the bushes will be cleared?
  - Dr. Machage: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I will do my best.

#### Question No.283

#### NON-COMPLETION OF MANYANIA ROAD

- **Mr. Waititu** asked the Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Local Government:-
- (a) whether he is aware that Manyanja Road, connecting Sprine and Outer Ring roads and whose construction was scheduled to take one year, has not been completed despite the lapse of the contract time; and,
- (b) when the construction will be completed.

The Assistant Minister, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and Ministry of Local Government (Mr. Githae): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wish to seek the indulgence of this august House. The answer to this Question is not ready basically because this Question was first referred to the Ministry of Transport. It is only this week that it was re-routed to us. We are working hard on the answer and we will be in a position to give a comprehensive one on Tuesday, next week.

Mr. Waititu: Mr. Speaker, Sir, if he is not ready, I can still wait.

Mr. Speaker: Very well! The Question is deferred until Tuesday, next week.

(Ouestion deferred)

Question No.287

## LOSS OF LIVESTOCK DUE TO INADEQUATE STAFF

- Dr. Munyaka asked the Minister for Livestock Development:-
- (a) if he could give the estimated livestock population in Kenya *vis-a-vis* the number of veterinary doctors and relevant staff in the Ministry;
- (b) if he could confirm that Kenyan farmers have greatly lost their livestock due to poor disease control owing to inadequate qualified staff in the Ministry; and,
- (c) what urgent measures he is taking to rectify this major problem relating to food security in the country.

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

- (a) The estimated population of domestic animals in this country I want hon. Members to agree with me that the last census in this country was done in 1969 is as follows: Beef cattle, 10 million; dairy cattle, 3 million---
- **Dr. Khalwale:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Given the lifespan of cattle, does the House have to waste its time listening to the Assistant Minister talk about the population of cattle

in this country in 1969? Is it of any use to us?

#### (Laughter)

**The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development** (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to inform the hon. Member that we are talking of the censuses that was done in 1969. However, during all that period, animals were dying and others were being born. I would like to inform the House that census are done over a number of periods---

**Dr. Otichilo:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I think the hon. Assistant Minister is misleading the House. Is he aware that aerial surveys and censuses have been undertaken in this country by the Department of Resource Surveys and Remote Sensing since 1977 to date? The Assistant Minister is misleading the House!

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker Sir, I can say it here, with certainty, that the hon. Member is misleading this House! The Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 is in charge of census and figures in this country can attest to that. The Department of Resource Surveys and Remote Sensing is a small one and is run by NGOs. So, the figures I am going to give you here are the current figures---

#### (Dr. Otichilo stood up in his place)

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Mr. Assistant Minister! Order, Dr. Otichilo! Mr. Duale, would you proceed and answer the Question as asked beginning with part "a" which seeks to know the population of livestock in Kenya *vis-a-vis* the number of veterinary doctors? I believe that means the population today.

**The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development** (Mr. Duale): Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir, for saving the time.

I beg to reply.

The estimated population of livestock in this country, as at today, is as follows: Beef cattle found in the ASAL areas, 10 million; dairy cattle in the Highlands, 3 million; meat goats, 11 million; hairy sheep, 73 million; domestic fowls, 29 million; dogs and cats, 1.5 million; camels, 800,000; dairy goats, 80,000; wool sheep---

**Ms.** Chepchumba: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Is it in order for the Assistant Minister to mislead this House? He has stated that since 1969, this was the estimated population of livestock! Now he is confirming to us that it is the current population! I think we need clarification on which statistics are true. Is it the one for 1969 or the current one? What we want are current statistics of livestock in the country.

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I said that the census was last conducted in 1969. I did not say that these figures are of 1969. They are generated on a transmigration period. Our officers do this thing on a monthly basis. So, 1969 is when the last census was done. However, every hour, every day and every month in this country, our officers in the field report and have a record of what we have.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if I may continue, dairy goats, 80,000; wool sheep, 850,000; pigs, 450,000; rabbits, 520,000; horses and donkeys combined---

**Mr. Affey:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I come from a pastoral background. Now, are rabbits and dogs livestock?

(Laughter)

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is

very unfortunate that a Member from a pastoral community does not know that rabbits fall within the category of livestock!

Hon. Members: What about dogs and cats?

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, dogs and cats fall within the broader terminology of livestock.

#### (Laughter)

#### (Loud Consultations)

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, hon. Members! The Assistant Minister will be heard! Mr. Duale, could you complete your answer!

The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development (Mr. Duale): Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I know hon. Affey comes from a place where camels are found. For his information, emerging livestock includes crocodiles, ostriches and guinea fowls which are about 100,000. This huge livestock population is against a backdrop of 24,392 veterinary doctors found in this country, 2,475 animal health technicians---

Dr. Khalwale: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Dr. Khalwale! The Assistant Minister must be heard and allowed to complete his answer! Proceed, Mr. Duale!

**The Assistant Minister for Livestock Development** (Mr. Duale): Mr. Speaker, Sir, this population of livestock that we have is *vis-a-vis* 24,392 veterinary doctors, 2,475 animal health technicians in the Ministry and about 200 private veterinarians.

Currently, the ratio of veterinary doctors to livestock in this country is 1 to 53,000 while the desired international standard is 1 to 5,000 in intense production systems and 1 to 20,000 in the Arid and Semi-Arid Lands (ASALs) region. From the foregoing, the Ministry needs to employ an additional 1,700 veterinary doctors to bring down the ratio to an average of 1 animal to 12,000 veterinary doctors.

- (b) It is true that Kenya as a country might have lost a number of livestock to endemic outbreaks due to poor disease control owing to the shortage of trained personnel. It is for this reason that hon. Members should know that my Ministry has not employed veterinary doctors and animal health technicians for the last 20 years as a result of the World Bank Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs). However, despite the shortage of trained personnel and very low budgetary allocation, my Ministry has been in a position to respond to, control and contain animal diseases in this country.
- (c) In order to address the problem of animal diseases which has a very significant bearing on food security in this country, my Ministry has recently recruited 23 veterinary doctors who have already been posted to the field. An additional 100 veterinary doctors are in the process of being employed by the Public Service Commission (PSC). The Ministry is also in the process of recruiting 145 livestock animal health assistants and 51 laboratory technologists.

Further, in an effort to contain animal diseases in the country and to enable farmers to penetrate the international livestock market, my Ministry is in the process of creating disease-free zones at the Coast and Laikipia and also reviving the holding grounds.

Equally, there is an ongoing international programme known as Pan African Tsetse and Trypanosomiasis Eradication Campaign (PATEC) aimed at eradicating the tsetse fly which causes East Coast Fever. In recognition of the importance of disease control in this country, the Ministry of Livestock Development has, in the last three months, revived and put under its custody the Kenya Veterinary and Vaccines Production Institute (KEVEVAPI) in my docket. This institute will

help the Ministry and the country in the production of vaccines.

In conclusion, vaccination of animals against various strain-related diseases in this country has been undertaken. Currently, vaccination against foot and mouth disease, rabies, Rift Valley Fever and PPR is ongoing. This financial year, the Kenya Government has provided Kshs420 million which has enabled the Ministry to carry out a massive nationwide exercise against the outbreak of PPR that is affecting the small goats and sheep across the nation.

**Dr. Munyaka:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to thank the Assistant Minister for being very bold and sincere in actually exposing the serious understaffing in the Ministry of Livestock Development. However, could he confirm that there is a serious danger of the Ministry closing down because the remaining staff members are just about to retire since most of them are around 50 years of age?

**Mr. Duale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, first, I want to thank the hon. Member and this House for the recognition they have given the Ministry of Livestock Development. Secondly, I want to assure this House that yes, for 20-plus years, this Ministry has not employed veterinary doctors and animal health assistants. We are in the process of recruiting them and in the next one or two months, we will have young men and women from Kenyan veterinary colleges who are going to replace the retirees. So, do not worry.

**Mr. Letimalo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, in reference to part "b" of the Question, the huge losses of livestock incurred by pastoralists through the PPR are still fresh in our minds. Could the Assistant Minister inform the House what precautionary measures he has put in place in creating awareness among the livestock farmers on disease control, in view of the acute shortage of veterinary officers to ensure that we will not incur such losses in future?

**Mr. Duale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I know that the Kenyan livestock sector has for many years been a victim of the disease controlling it and not *vice-versa*. I want to assure the hon. Member that we have put in place very strong measures. We told this House last week that we are more than ever before, prepared to contain the Rift Valley Fever that usually comes with the floods. Over Kshs1.3 million is out in the districts where this Rift Valley Fever occurs.

Lastly, I know it is this Ministry's wish that as per the Vision 2030, its flagship project is the creation of disease-free zones. At the moment, we intend to create disease-free zones which we are in the process of setting up at the Coast and at the Laikipia, Samburu, Isiolo axis. We will do it again in the North Rift and South Rift. Therefore, the element and the future of the Kenya livestock sector will be safe and sound.

Mr. Speaker: Last question, Dr. Munyaka!

**Dr. Munyaka:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, we all know that the under-staffing was as a result of the Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) which were brought about by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank. When will the Government discard the implementation of Sessional Paper No.1 of 1986, so that we may start employing?

**Mr. Duale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, as I said earlier, this year, 800 staff were employed from the cadre of veterinary surgeon to animal health assistants, livestock production assistants, clerks and drivers. I know that next year, there is a programme and an arrangement we have made in the Ministry of Livestock Development. But I want the hon. Members of this House, more so, those from the pastoralist communities, to support the initiative we are discussing as the Government on how we can combine the human census which will be done next year with livestock census. This is because for the pastoralist communities, it is easier to do it. When you count a family, you can easily tell the number of animals they own. But I can assure this House that very soon, we will give you facts and do a more comprehensive census of the livestock population in this country.

# INADEQUATE FACILITIES/STAFF AT TANGARATWET/CHEPTARIT YOUTH POLYTECHNICS

Mr. Koech asked the Minister for Youth Affairs and Sports:-

- (a) whether she is aware that Tangaratwet and Cheptarit Youth polytechnics lack adequate physical facilities, including classrooms and laboratories and are grossly under-staffed; and,
- (b) what steps she is taking to ensure that these polytechnics, which are expected to provide industrial skills, are well-staffed and enough classrooms and workshops built.

The Minister for Youth Affairs and Sports (Prof. Sambili): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

- (a) I am aware that Tangaratwet and Cheptarit Youth polytechnics in Mosop Constituency lack enough physical facilities, including classrooms and laboratories, and that they have few Government instructors.
- (b) In 2007, the Government employed 600 instructors for the youth polytechnics who were deployed in the existing 750 youth polytechnics. Tangaratwet and Cheptarit Youth Polytechnics are among the youth polytechnics that received instructors. Tangaratwet Polytechnic received one instructor while Cheptarit received two instructors.

Prior to the employment of the instructors by the Ministry, youth polytechnics had their own staff that were employed by the management committees of the various youth polytechnics. The Government has continued to top up grants to instructors who have been employed by the management committees in youth polytechnics in order to support them to meet their obligations.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, regarding the tools and equipment support for the polytechnics, the Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports in the year 2006/2007, requested the hon. Members to select or identify one youth polytechnic in their constituencies to benefit from the provision of tools and equipment. So far, 221 institutions in this country have benefitted with tools and equipment worth Kshs500,000. In Mosop Constituency, the institution that benefited was Cheptarit Youth Polytechnic. Because this was done during the Ninth Parliament, I have here a list of all the youth polytechnics that benefited for the Members to see. This will be availed later.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, regarding the infrastructure of the youth polytechnics, the Ministry plans to partner with other stakeholders like the Members of Parliament, through the Constituencies Development Fund (CDF), Local Authorities Transfer Fund (LATF), bursary schemes as well as income generating activities and other sources, including the Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and other development partners to develop one model youth polytechnic in every constituency. To this end, Members of Parliament are requested to give construction and equipping of such polytechnics a priority.

Finally, through the African Development Bank support, the Ministry will assist ten institutions across the country by putting up workshops, classrooms and hostels, connection to power and water

supply, and ground upgrading so as to facilitate the development of sports. So far, I would like to say that we have not received requests from the two institutions in question, namely, Tangaratwet and Cheptarit regarding assistance in putting up classrooms and workshops. Once we receive that, although we do not have much money, we will consider the request, of course, depending on the availability of funds.

I want to thank the hon. Members for the interest that they have shown in the activities of

the Ministry. Yesterday---

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Madam Minister! This is Question Time! You should answer the Question as asked. We want to use our time optimally.

Yes, Mr. Koech!

- **Mr. Koech:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to sincerely thank the Minister for being open and candid with her answers. I thank her for confirming that before the Government employed the instructors, there were some instructors in our youth polytechnics who were employed by the management committees. These instructors are qualified. In Cheptarit, for example, we have nine of them.
- **Mr. Speaker:** Order, Mr. Koech! Just as I cautioned the Minister to be relevant to what we are doing now, can you also be relevant? What is your question?
- **Mr. Koech:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the top-up grants given by the Ministry have ended up being the salaries for these workers. Today, the instructors are getting Kshs2,790. Could the Minister consider employing these instructors, so that they can earn a good salary?
  - Mr. Speaker, Sir, the money that was awarded to the---
- **Mr. Speaker:** Order, Mr. Koech! You have asked the question. Have you not? Could you allow the Minister to answer, please?
  - Mr. Koech: Mr. Speaker, Sir, just a clarification.
- **Mr. Speaker:** Please, you are a teacher by profession! In high school, for that matter, we were all trained to be precise. We all did summary!

Please, answer Madam Minister!

- **Prof. Sambili:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, as for the absorption of the instructors that are in the youth polytechnics, we have asked them to upgrade their skills, so that when the Public Service Commission advertises positions, they can be considered. So, we are willing to consider them together with the Public Service Commission if they qualify.
- **Mr. Mwiru:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, you will realise that the top-up that the instructors who are employed by management of these polytechnics is up to the tune of only Kshs2,750. It is not easy for them even to upgrade their skills. Could the Minister consider upgrading their skills, so that they are absorbed when the Public Service Commission advertises posts?
- **Prof. Sambili:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, we, in the Ministry, together with our development partners, are already supporting the instructors through what I would call "in-service training". That is because during the holidays, the lecturers, together with the instructors, go to Kenya Technical Training College (KTTC) to upgrade their skills. So, I think we are already doing something.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

Mr. Speaker: Last question, Mr. Koech!

- **Mr. Koech:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Now, the Minister has confirmed that in my constituency, those institutions seriously require upgrading. Could the Minister confirm in this House that through African Development Bank (ADB) funds, at least, one of my polytechnics will benefit? I have documents to prove that they have already sent the requirements to your office.
- Mr. Speaker, Sir, because of the state of the polytechnics in my place, could I request the Minister to accompany me to my constituency at her own appropriate time, so that she can look at them herself?
  - Mr. Speaker, Sir, my point was on corruption. The Minister mentioned 500,000---
- **Mr. Speaker:** Order, Mr. Koech! Order! This is Question Time. You are allowed one supplementary question at a time. You have asked a question on whether the Minister could accompany you to your constituency. Madam Minister, could you respond?
  - **Prof. Sambili:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, when we receive the request for that consideration, we

will consider it along with the others, depending on the availability of funds. As for the visit, we will consider that when we are around that constituency. We want to visit all the others, but I do not want to commit myself to visiting only one particular one.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Very well! That brings us to the end of Question Time. As you all know, this is an Allotted Day. We are supposed to commence the next business at 3.30 p.m. It is now 3.32 p.m. So, we will have to continue until 6.32 p.m.

The balance of the two Questions by Amb. Affey and Mr. Nyamai, please, bear with the Chair. Your Questions will come on the Order Paper tomorrow. They will be given priority over the other Questions that may be scheduled for tomorrow.

Question No.374

NUMBER OF P1 TEACHERS IN NORTH EASTERN PROVINCE

(Question deferred)

Question No.432

ABSENCE OF A BOARD AT KEMSA

(Question deferred)

#### **COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY**

(Order for Committee read being 14th Allotted Day)

#### MOTION

THAT MR. SPEAKER DO NOW LEAVE THE CHAIR

Vote 06 - Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030

(The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 on 21.10.2008)

(Resumption of Debate interrupted on 21.10.2008)

Mr. Speaker: Who was on the Floor? Proceed, Mr. ole Metito!

The Assistant Minister for Regional Development Authorities (Mr. ole Metito): Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir, for giving this opportunity to contribute in support of Vote 06, Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030. This Ministry, as it has clearly put it in

its mission, is a very important Ministry. It has stated that its mission is to lead in policy formulation, co-ordination and implementation. I do believe it is for the purpose of resource mobilisation and allocation.

Again, Mr. Speaker, Sir, if you look at the Ministry's mandate, it has clearly defined its mandate as:-

"To facilitate and co-ordinate national development process and planning. To provide leadership in national economic policy management."

What I would like to say is that if this Ministry really stands firm in accordance with its mission and mandate, it is a very important Ministry. But I would like to say that it has not really done a lot previously. Maybe, it is because it used to be a department under other Ministries. For a long time, it has been combined with the Treasury or the Ministry of Finance. But I want to challenge the Ministry. It should come up with pro-poor policies that will address the contemporary issues that are affecting the Kenyan population right now.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, we are experiencing high inflation, high cost of living, high cost of fuel and food prices. It should come up with structures that can actually put together our development goals. It should not really, as has been the case before, come up with development plans each and every five years. We discard or abandon them when we fail to implement them. We just give them another different name, but the goal is almost the same.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, regarding the budgetary allocation, as we are discussing it today, the Ministry has really tried to streamline and probably allocate resources equitably to all the 146 districts we have in the Republic, especially in the Recurrent

Expenditure - that is Vote R06. But I have a problem with Vote D06 - the Development Expenditure.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if you look at that Development Vote, the Ministry has actually put in resources in not more than ten districts, mostly on the construction of District Development Officers' (DDOs) offices. I am happy to note that, out of only ten districts that have been earmarked for the construction of DDOs offices, my district, that is Loitokitok District, is one of them. It is actually one of the only three in the greater Rift Valley Province that has been allocated Kshs5 million for the construction of the DDO's office.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, DDOs in the constituencies are very critical in terms of planning, coordination and also implementation of Government policies. So, it is good that they be equipped with the necessary tools, not just the offices, but also with mobility in terms of vehicles, so that they can really help us to come up with proper policies that can guide us in planning and coordination of our development goals. That is because they are really field officers.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, even if the old 72 districts have offices for DDOs, the balance of 74 new districts really require offices for their DDOs. If only ten are earmarked for construction in a specific financial year, that is a very minimal number. Each district has been allocated Kshs5 million. So, that amounts to only Kshs50 million for the Development Vote in this Ministry.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, other than the South Nyanza Development Strategy which is mostly donor-funded programmes in some of the South Nyanza districts, there is also the Central Kenya Programme which is, again, a donor-funded programme. In fact, very little has gone to the Development Vote in this Ministry. It is only the Kshs50 million that has been given to the ten districts for the construction of DDOs' offices.

But, Mr. Speaker, Sir, let me come to the very critical point or objective of this Ministry, which is planning for resource mobilisation and allocation.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to come out very specifically on the issue of CDF. Constituencies have actually become the focus for development. They are becoming the principle units of

devolution in terms of resource allocation. But this Ministry is also in charge of taking the statistics - the census.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, as we heard this afternoon, the last time they took the census of livestock was in 1969. That is 40 years ago. I am sure even the livestock that were counted then are all dead.

With regard to the population census they envisage to do, I would like to ask the Minister to be very fair and firm in research. At times, we find that the population index and poverty index rankings are not representative of what is on the ground. They should do proper national census and do it without any bias whatsoever.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, you will agree with me that one of the things they consider when carrying out census is, for instance, land. They should not just consider the size of land available in that constituency. They should also consider the productivity of that land, whether it is arable or not. They should also consider the distribution of that land and establish how many people in that constituency own land.

Other things to consider are the natural resources found in those constituencies. The Ministry should consider not only the availability of the natural resources, but also their trickle-down effect in terms of benefits to local people in that constituency. A good example is in my constituency. We have Amboseli National Park, which is one of the very prime natural resources in this country.

The Ministry should go a step further and try to find out the trickle-down effects, or the benefits that the constituents are getting because of the existence of that resource. At the moment, I am very sure the local people are not benefiting from their natural resources. The Ministry should also consider the livestock in pastoral areas. They should not just consider the number of livestock found in a given constituency, but they should also consider the distribution of ownership of the livestock. They should establish how it is skewed among the human population of the constituency.

A report which was done by the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI) some years back, says that 80 per cent of the livestock is owned by 20 per cent of the pastoralists. So, if you find that the number of livestock in a given area is very big, do not conclude that those people are rich because they have a lot of livestock. Even when they go to agricultural areas, they should not just consider the produce in the farms. They should also consider the ability of these farm produce to access the market.

They should establish the status of the road infrastructure in an area. A constituency may be very rich agriculturally, but it could be a nightmare transporting their produce to the market because of bad status of the infrastructure in that constituency. Such infrastructure can render such a constituency really poor. So, it is important that this Ministry takes note of those considerations when they carry out the statistics that will be used to determine how resources should be allocated in this country.

Finally, Mr. Speaker, Sir, on the issue of CDF Managers, we have Fund Managers who have been seconded by the Ministry to the Constituencies Development Committees (CDCs). However, we have a problem because, according to the CDF Act, they are not allowed to draw any allowances when they attend meetings or visit the constituencies to oversee implementation of CDF projects.

So, Mr. Speaker, Sir, if it is not possible for the CDF Act to be amended at the moment, so that they can also be allowed to be part of the 15-Member Committee allowed to draw allowances, maybe, the Ministry could issue a circular, or a regulation, to ensure that the 3 per cent that goes to the National Management Board (NMB) or the CDF Board, takes into account the allowances of such Fund Managers when they attend our CDCs and when they oversee the implementation of projects.

With those few remarks, I beg to support.

**Mr. Gunda:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to the debate on the Vote of the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030. I have three points which I want to touch on in the course of my contribution.

My first point is that this Ministry is charged with the responsibility of carrying out the national census. The current figures we have are for 1999. We hope that as they plan for the Census of 2009, they will plan this exercise properly, carry it out with due diligence and come up with figures which will reflect the true position on the ground. As we all know, the census figures are the ones which are used by the Government to distribute resources. We see this, especially with the CDF money.

Firstly, the CDF money is based on census figure and the poverty index. I hope that when the census is done next year, it will take into account all these factors, so the Ministry can come up with figures which will enable the various parts of the country to get their fare share of national resources.

Secondly, we know this Ministry is also responsible for distributing the CDF money to the various constituencies. We are happy about the amounts of money we are being given at the moment. However, I have a problem with the way these funds are being distributed. Seventy-five per cent of the total CDF allocation is shared equally to all the constituencies. Only 25 per cent takes into account the poverty index.

I would like to see a situation where we reverse these allocations, so that instead of 75 per cent being shared equally, we have it shared out according to the poverty index and only the 25 per cent is shared equally among all the constituencies. That way, we will be able to distribute resources to the people who need it most.

Thirdly, we all know that the funds which are devolved through the CDF have been used for the good of this country. The people on the ground appreciate what Members of Parliament are doing with the CDF money. Only 2.5 per cent of the total National Budget goes to the CDF. We all know that this percentage of the National Budget is being used to bring about a lot of development on the ground.

So, I would want to see a situation where the Ministry brings to the House an amendment to the Act to increase this allocation to the CDF, from the current 2.5 per cent of the National Budget to, at least, 10 per cent. If it is not possible to do so, then let us increase the current allocation to, at least, 7.5 per cent to provide for adequate resources, which can be used at the grassroots level to bring about development.

By saying so, I do not mean that the various Ministries are not doing much. However, as we all know, from the time we started using the CDF money for development, a lot has been done at the grassroots level, and it is only fare that we increase the allocation for the CDF. I think it is a cry which the Members of Parliament have given to the Ministry and we hope the Ministry will take it up and bring about the necessary amendments to the Act to satisfy the cries of Members of Parliament.

With those few, remarks, I beg to support.

The Assistant Minister, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and Ministry of Local Government (Mr. Githae): Thank you Mr. Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to make my contribution to this very important Ministry's Vote.

May I take this opportunity to congratulate the Minister and his staff for the good work that they are doing. As we congratulate the Minister, it is my request that the Ministry should start thinking outside the box. They must be innovative and come up with new solutions to new problems. We cannot sort out old problems unless we use new solutions.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, one of the things we can do is to make all constituencies to be districts. As of now, there is this confusion where in some Ministries, the principal organ is the district while

it is the constituency in others. I think if we make all constituencies districts, we would be able to sort out this issue. This is not something new. Our neighbouring countries-Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi and Tanzania, are doing this. In fact, they have gone further and said that every constituency is a district and a local authority. In neighbouring countries, a Member of Parliament is an ex-officio councillor of the local authority. I think that is the way to go, so that we remove this confusion. We need change of policy and I think it is good if it is effected.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, let me now dwell on census. A census is planned for the near future. The Ministry should start preparing so that when results are announced, they would be acceptable to the majority of Kenyans. The census should be credible. They should stop asking questions which have been overtaken by events. Of what importance is the tribe of a person in the census? Do we still need these kind of questions? To me, they are irrelevant. All people in this country are Kenyans. We do not need to emphasize tribes. We should even go further and take the example of Rwanda where if you call somebody a Hutu or a Tutsi, it is an offence and you would be jailed. That way, we will be able to eradicate tribalism.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, as I said, the Ministry needs to start thinking outside the box. If I come to registrations, in this country we have very many registrations, each with a different number. For example, we have numbers for Pay As You Earn (PAYE), Value Added Tax (VAT), Income Tax, Personal Identification Number (PIN), Identity Card, Voters Card, Birth Certificate, Driving Licence, National Hospital Insurance Fund (NHIF) and Death Certificate. We need to copy Botswana. In Botswana, the number you are given when born in a hospital will be your Identify Card number, Income Tax number, PIN number, PAYE number and even bank account number. That way, they have been able to centralise all their registrations. In this country, there are so many registrations which only increase the cost of doing business.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if you go to the United States of America (USA) or United Kingdom (UK), as you enter a town, you will find a notice board welcoming you to the town. They state the population of that town on that board. In this country, nobody really knows the population of our small towns. In these countries, once a birth is registered, the register of the town is updated automatically by computers. When death is registered, automatically, the population register is updated. This means that at any given day or hour, they know what exactly their population is. We are, therefore, asking the Ministry to start thinking outside the box and copy what other people are doing. This will enable proper planning in this country.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, let me now come to the CDF, particularly the so-called poverty index. I am recommending that we abolish the so-called poverty index. I was shocked to find some Members of Parliament glorifying poverty and saying their constituencies should be poorer. We want to create wealth but if we start talking of poverty index so as to get more CDF allocation, we are glorifying poverty instead of glorifying wealth creation.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, we should abolish the so-called poverty index which, to date, we have not even been given the figures. We, therefore, cannot allocate funds for the year 2008/2009. Let us have CDF allocation based on population or let it be allocated equally to all constituencies so that the issue of glorifying poverty does not arise.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am proud that when I was first elected as the Member of Parliament for Ndia, we were number 43 in the so-called poverty index. Now, we are number 13. In Ndia we are not glorifying poverty. We want to be number one on the so-called poverty index. That is our target! We are interested more in wealth creation rather than eradication of poverty. So, what we are saying is that the Ministry should plan outside the box.

**Mr. Ethuro:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Is it in order for the Assistant Minister who is a good friend of mine to mislead this House? In one instance, he is saying there is no need for the poverty index but on the other hand, he appreciates that he has made some serious progress

by climbing up the ladder! This is the more reason we need the poverty index to know where we are going and whether we are making progress. Is he in order to mislead the House when he is making very good use of the poverty index?

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Githae, that appears legitimate! Against what will you measure yourself?

The Assistant Minister, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and Ministry of Local Government (Mr. Githae): Mr. Speaker, Sir, wealth creation instead of poverty. We have a register for wealth creation. When you have poverty index, you are only glorifying poverty.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if you look at all the statistics from the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030, they give emphasis on the girl child.

In my constituency, the problem is not the girl child. We have more girls in primary school than boys. We have more girls than boys in secondary schools. My problem is the boy child. However, this problem does not seem to have been recognised by the Ministry.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, my problem is the boy child and it seems that problem has not been recognised by the Ministry. The rate of drop out of boys is worrying. In fact, we need not say that all constituencies are the same. They are not the same. Some have changed. For example, in my constituency, I have four dispensaries which have been lying there, because we do not have staff. We are not even demanding a doctor. A clinical officer will do. Even a nurse will do. There is an ambulance that we were given by the Ministry, but it is lying idle because there is no driver. We must recognise that all the constituencies are not the same and, therefore, each must be treated differently. If I was given authority to employ a driver, I would be ready to do that, instead of an ambulance being idle.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the other thing that I want to speak about is the CDF. Two-and-a-half per cent is too low. In the previous Parliament, we had proposed a figure of 7.5 per cent. The CDF is the only money that is felt at the grassroots. We need to increase that amount, because it is only through the CDF that a difference can be felt on the ground. We need to increase it even if it means removing some money from the central Government. This money has resulted in a dramatic change in the lives of the people who voted for us.

With those few remarks, I support.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I hope I have my ten minutes. I want to thank you very profusely for giving me this opportunity. I want to speak from a position of authority. First, I am the Chairman of CDF, a Committee of this House. Secondly, I am a former Assistant Minister in the Ministry of Planning and National Development, and an authority in Development Economics.

The theme of the Budget for this year was "working together to build a cohesive, equitable and prosperous Kenya". The Minister for Finance spelt out the things that they will need to do in order to build a cohesive, equitable and prosperous nation. One of them, in addition to the restoration of the economy, is the reduction of poverty and inequality through accelerated regional development, and also deepening the human development efforts for a higher productivity and economic prosperity.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, it pains me to be in an awkward position against the Minister. This is a Ministry that I would ordinarily support. This is a Ministry that has the most competent professionals in this country in terms of sound economic theory; it is a team that is working very hard, and has some of the best statisticians in the whole of Africa. I want to oppose this Vote. I am opposing this Vote because, first, as the Chairman of CDF, the Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 has given out Kshs10.1 billion when the CDF Act, Section 4 (2)(a) talks of an amount of money equal to, and not less than, 2.5 per cent of the ordinary revenues. The estimated ordinary revenues were Kshs465 billion. I am not "cooking" these figures from Turkana. These are figures from the good offices of the Government of Kenya. When you do

the calculation, it bring you to Kshs11.6 billion. The Minister in his Printed Estimates, has gone ahead to allocate Kshs10.1 billion. I want to draw the attention of the Minister to the Constitution of Kenya, Section 100(3) that the Minister needs to demonstrate to this House that if an item has been under-spent, then he should bring a supplementary estimate to this House. I am hoping that when the Minister will reply--- I am not going to rest this matter here; it is a notice to him. When he replies, he should give a firm indication to this House as to how and when he is going to give the difference between Kshs11.6 billion and Kshs10.1 billion.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, this House needs to communicate to the Executive in very clear terms, and without mincing our words. You cannot take Kenya for a ride and definitely, not the Tenth Parliament. That is one reason why I do not want to support this Motion.

The second reason, which is more substantial, is that the Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030, in some weird wisdom, has decided to discard the poverty index. Maybe, he is informed by the former speaker, Mr. Githae. Maybe, he is informed by some interests. My suspicion is that whoever put the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 under the Office of the Prime Minister is the source of our problems. You cannot purport to be interested in poverty reduction and inequality---

When the Ministry had used the current poverty indices, constituencies in Arid and Semi-Arid Lands (ASALs) would have been given Kshs167 million against a loss of Kshs40 million. We are talking of a difference of about Kshs100 million.

**Dr. Khalwale:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Mr. Ethuro is a very loyal member of the "Grand Opposition", but he is making a very serious allegation that the Prime Minister is the reason why the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 is underperforming. Could he substantiate?

Mr. Speaker: Before he does that, what is this animal called the "Grand Opposition?"

**Dr. Khalwale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, great minds imagine the future, even before it is realised. We know that it is just a matter of time before Parliament---

**Mr. Speaker:** Dr. Khalwale, will you, therefore, withdraw the words "Grand Opposition" because in law it does not exist?

**Dr. Khalwale:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I withdraw and hope that the future will vindicate me.

Mr. Speaker: Very well; Mr. Ethuro, respond to that point of order.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, in view of his withdrawal, is it necessary for me to respond to it? First, I did not refer to the "Prime Minister"; I referred to the Office of the Prime Minister. Secondly, he has already made me a member of the "Grand Opposition." As you know, it does not exist; I cannot be a member of an illegal entity.

**Mr. Mbadi:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Even though Dr. Khalwale made some mistake, is it in order to ask Mr. Ethuro to explain how the Office of the Prime Minister is making the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 under-perform.

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Mbadi, if you ask a question, then it is not a point of order. For it to be a point of order, you must indicate what is out of order. To what extent is Mr. Ethuro out of order? So, you are out of order! Mr. Ethuro, we will add three minutes to your time.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Thank you very much for protecting me from my good friends. The second point I was making--- It is a fundamental point which I think my friend should wait and listen. I heard Dr. Khalwale, yesterday, as he spoke on this point. But Dr. Khalwale has a great mind. But he has a limitation of figures - the ones that I have laid before the Table! I can produce more.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the poverty indices that the Minister thinks are better than the proposed ones are those ones of the Welfare Monitoring Survey of 1999. That is a survey that never factored in the entire North Eastern Province.

Mr. Midiwo: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Something is disturbing and I think

you need to guide the House. Is Mr. Ethuro in order? He was the Assistant Minister for Planning who guided the "cooking up" of those figures, which he is trying to Table, and which have really affected our people.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, currently, the Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 should be thanked for stopping something which Mr. Ethuro pioneered! It was really going to hurt us!

Mr. Ethuro: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Hold your horse! Hold your peace, Mr. Ethuro. Could you respond to that point of order?

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wish to respond. I wish to respond by laying on the Table of the House the proceedings of the HANSARD on a Motion brought by Mr. M.Y. Haji on 11th October, 2006, which was replied by non other than the hon. Member for Turkana Central, in his capacity as the Assistant Minister for Planning and National Development. I was an Assistant Minister in the Government. The Motion was seeking:-

"That, the allocation of CDF be based, among other things, on poverty index; that the current CDF allocation to constituencies is based on past indices, this House urges the Government to set up a pilot poverty index with a view to matching the current needs and problems affecting the constituencies in this region."

Mr. Speaker, Sir, what was the considered response from the Ministry? Not in my capacity and not to be wished away by the people who come after me and, definitely, part and parcel of the record of the House and Parliament. The response was as follows:-

"The truth is that the CDF did not consider these areas because of the way things were being done, but because during the drought of 2000/2005, the Government directed the Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS) to ensure that all districts in the Republic were covered. So, the 2005/2006, Kenya Integrated Household Budget Survey was, therefore, designed to provide indicators necessary for measuring, monitoring and analyzing living standards in the whole of Kenya. The survey covered a total of 1,339 clusters and a sample size of 13,390 households."

Mr. Speaker, Sir, these are not my words. These are the words from the Ministry of Planning.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the concerted effort by my good friend, Mr. Midiwo, is an effort to ensure that the people of ASAL districts continue to be marginalised by the tyranny of the majority! Time has come when we should give voice to the voiceless. Time has come when we have to ensure that those who have been marginalised for a long time and oppressed just because they are not in the centres of power are assisted. It is a shame because even the people who are in the Kenya National Bureau of Standards--- By then I have made my case. This is a record I want to lay on the Table on a Motion before this House, a commitment by a Minister of the Government---

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Mr. Ethuro. It would suffice if you cite to the House the date of that HANSARD Report, so that hon. Members would be able to refer to it.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I thought I said so. But being an obedient follower of your rulings---

**Mr. Speaker:** State the date of the HANSARD!

Mr. Ethuro: It is 11th October, 2006, the year of our Lord - Parliamentary Debates!

Mr. Speaker: Very well, proceed!

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, having proven that one, the law has been broken as per the CDF Act in terms of the Minister giving a smaller amount of money than he was supposed to give, in recognition that in 1999, a Welfare Monitoring Survey that determined the poverty index that we have been using was not good enough--- But it was good for the time it was there. Now, we

have got a new survey that is more comprehensive.

**Eng. Gumbo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I just need the guidance of the Chair. My hon. colleague, Mr. Ethuro, is the Chairman of the Constituency Development Fund Committee of Parliament. He was there when the Minister came to the Committee. He was chairing that meeting when we agreed as a Constituency Development Fund Committee - a committee of the House - that the findings of the poverty indices should be disregarded and the earlier ones should be used. Is it in order for him to come here and mislead the House, when he was the one who was on the Chair when we agreed with the good records of the findings of the Kenya National Bureau of Statistics, which admitted that the figures at the districts were estimates--- I need the direction of the Chair!

Mr. Ethuro: On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Eng. Gumbo is supposed to be heard.

**Eng. Gumbo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, when we went through the discussions, and he was sitting on the Chair, it was clearly stated by the Kenya National Bureau of Statistics that the figures at the districts were estimates. The figures at the constituency level could not be relied upon with any measure of accuracy. I need the direction of the Chair because I feel the Chairman of CFC is misleading the House.

Mr. Speaker: Mr. Ethuro, are you or are you not misleading the House?

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, how do I mislead the House when I have given you the HANSARD Report of this House? How do I mislead the House when I have quoted the relevant provisions of the law that are talking about 2.5 per cent of the revenue, which comes to Kshs11 billion and not Kshs10 billion? Who is disputing these things? On the issue of the meeting, I made very serious reservations because I know these things. The Minister came without the full benefit of this kind of information, even after I had put it to him. I have stood here because of the tyranny of the majority! I shall remain so---

Mr. Speaker: Order, Mr. Ethuro! Your time is up!

**Mr. Ethuro:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir, for protecting me from the majority and the oppression of the Office of the Prime Minister!

(Laughter)

**The Assistant Minister, Ministry of State for Public Service** (Maj. Sugow): Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I stand here to support this Motion.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to congratulate the Minister for bringing this Motion to the House. Although there are quite a number of issues which have been raised, and which may not necessarily have to do with the Ministry with regards to the CDF, the fact of bringing the administration of the CDF under this Ministry was a blessing. I believe that, that kitty, which is very important to the people of Kenya, will get the necessary attention that it deserves, compared to when it was under the larger Ministry of Finance.

[Mr. Speaker left the Chair]

[The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki) took the Chair]

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, there is one very important office at the district level, that is affiliated to this particular Ministry. That is the District Development Officers (DDOs) offices. The DDOs play a major role in the co-ordination of development activities and plans in the district. They are the Authority to Incur Expenditure (AIE) holders for most Government Votes,

including the CDF. But their capacity in many districts is wanting. I would like to add my voice to a Member who talked here before me, with regard to ensuring capacity building to the DDOs in terms of transport, office space and the necessary fuel for their movement.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, census is becoming a major contentious issue in this country simply because of basing most of our development or resource allocation on these statistics. It is very important that the Ministry carries out a very transparent and an all-inclusive exercise this year to ensure that there will be no bickering in the future again. There are so many foreigners who live in this country. A case in point is the refugees who have been living in parts of this country now for nearly two decades. They have become a permanent feature in this country and we do not see them leaving this country in the near future. They use our resources and they are part and parcel of our population now. I would like the Minister to consider this population since they are also using the resources in this country when doing the census.

Today, in one of the camps in my constituency, in northern Kenya, where there are only 30,000 or 40,000 locals, the number of refugees is close to 140,000. They outnumber the locals by almost three times. These refugees have continued to live in the area and increase in population over the last one-and-a-half decade. If we do not consider this population of refugees--- some of them have come with their livestock thereby occasioning pressure on the local environment by using our ground water which was found only 40 metres deep ten years ago, but today it can only be found 200 metres deep the ground. It is getting depleted that fast.

Most of our schools are closing because the rural areas depend on livestock for keeping their children in school. They live within a limited radius of the school. If that radius is overgrazed by livestock owned by the refugees, there is desertification and most of the local people now withdraw their children from school to take their livestock away. So, enrolment in our schools is going down tremendously. You cannot, therefore, convince the people hosting the refugees that the refugees are not part and parcel of the population that is using our resources. They must be considered as part and parcel of the population in the area when carrying out the population census.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like the Minister to consider issues such as population and poverty index when considering the 25 per cent allocation after the equal distribution of the 75 per cent of the money among the constituencies.

I am of the view that we remove the controversy surrounding poverty index and population by not factoring this issue and, therefore, share the money equally among constituencies. That is the best way to go so that the issues of population and poverty index which have become controversial to the extent of people arguing that this and that statistic is wrong or right can come to an end. Once we decide that money be shared equally among constituencies, that controversy will come to an end. That is what I believe should be done.

The CDF has become the most important devolved fund in this country. As we look forward to a new Constitution, we expect devolvement of funds. It is only fair that we continue the trend that we started and devolve more funds through the CDF. Even if you make an angel, the Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 or Minister for Finance, the 97.5 per cent, that is, the bit that goes towards development will always be skewed in one way or another. So, the more we allocate money resources to the CDF, the better. By the way, he is the most accessible Minister in this Coalition Government. I, therefore, urge the good Minister, who is so far doing a very good job, to bring the necessary amendments to the CDF Act so that we increase the allocation to not less than 10 per cent. I do not believe 7.5 per cent is enough.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, some of us come from very vast constituencies cum districts. Whenever there is a meeting, our members travel long distances. In some places there is no public transport. The sitting allowance given to members is Kshs2,500. Probably, that member

spends Kshs2,000 to reach the venue for one way. He or she will need another Kshs2,000 to travel back. Surely, is Kshs2,500 enough? It is very important that Minister considers increasing the sitting allowance for Constituencies Development Committees (CDCs) members. Even if it means increasing the administration elements, that is, the 3 per cent to 5 per cent or 6 per cent, let him do so. It is very important. Administration of the kitty by the CDC members, their sitting and deliberating on development issues are very important things. The more they sit the better. However, in my constituency, for example, even if they sit once a month, that money is still not enough, especially when you consider the fact that these people need money for transport and accommodation. My constituency is 19,000 square kilometres!

When you consider these people travelling to the venue, probably somebody is coming from a place that is 300 kilometres away and when he arrives, he needs to spend the night there because there is no public transport. What will Kshs2,500 do? They need food, accommodation and transport. Even if there is transport, Kshs2,500 is not enough. So, it is a very clear case and I seek the Minister's intervention very urgently otherwise most members of the public will not volunteer to serve in the CDC. This is a job for volunteers!

Finally, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to urge the Minister to consider issuing clear guidelines. He should, probably, conduct further workshops for the fund managers. There is always a conflict between the fund managers---

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, with those few remarks I beg to support.

**Mr. Ngugi:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this chance to support this very important Motion on the Vote for the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030. This Ministry is a very important one. It is one Ministry which can make this country go in either the right direction or the wrong direction. It is charged with the national development and planning policy. It is charged with the provision of the leadership of the national economic policy management of this country. It is, therefore, a very critical Ministry. For that reason, it is important that we get the right people to run this Ministry.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I am glad that we have the right Minister, Assistant Minister and Permanent Secretary in this Ministry. I am also happy to note that in their allocations, they have allocated money for training. This is a Ministry that should value training not only for others but for its staff.

Having said that, let me now discuss the estimates for this Ministry. I want at the outset to support hon. Ethuro on the calculation of the amount that should go to the Constituencies Development Fund (CDF). If the law says it should be 2.5 per cent, it should be a basic calculation to make. If a mistake has been made, I would urge the Minister to bring supplementary estimates so that we do not lose out on the CDF allocations.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I also support the view that the 3 per cent allocation paid for the Constituency Development Committees (CDCs) for administrative costs, is quite low. It ought to be increased. If you come, for example, to my constituency, Kinangop, other than having the central CDF committee, we have gone down to locational sub-committees. Even some constituencies have gone down to sub-locational sub-committees. Those are the ones that know the problems on the ground and they have to meet and bring these problems upwards. Those committees are not given any allowances. The 3 per cent is not enough to pay for administrative costs. So, I would urge this Ministry to consider increasing the amount maybe to 5 per cent. After all, even in private companies, we do not run administrative costs on 3 per cent. At least it is 5 to 12.5 per cent. So, increasing this from 3 per cent to 5 per cent would not be a big deal.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, let me come to the statistics used by this Ministry on the basis of the 1999 census. These statistics are completely out of date particularly in constituencies like Kinangop because all the Ministry has done is that it has projected those figures by the population growth rate. But if you take a constituency like Kinangop, factors like migration have not been factored in. In 1992, there were clashes in the Rift Valley Province and people migrated to Nyandarua and Kinangop. The same happened in 1997, 2002 and even now in 2007. They migrated and others have refused to move back.

So, the figure of the population shown is not the actual one. They have not only migrated from Rift Valley Province but even from Central and Nairobi provinces. People have been coming to Nyandarua and particularly Kinangop and buying land there. So, the population that is estimated here is not the correct one but I am glad that a census will be conducted next year. I have seen an allocation for that exercise so that we can get the correct figures.

As I have said, this is a very important Ministry because it is the one that holds the Vision 2030. The Vision 2030 is anchored in this Ministry. If you read it, there are various things that need to be done for us to achieve it. I will take the aspect of agriculture. There are some ten wholesale and retail markets that are supposed to be set up in the country. I would urge this Ministry not to be swayed by political influence but to think strategically where these ten wholesale markets would benefit people most.

For example, it is a known secret to everybody that Kinangop and Nyandarua feed Nairobi. We grow cabbages, potatoes and carrots in plenty. So, it will be beneficial if one of the retail markets is located in Nyandarua and particularly in Kinangop, so that not only can we grow these things and sell them there, but we can also have what we call value addition. We can have factories there which can preserve this produce so that the people of Turkana do not have to be fed on maize year after year when we are growing vegetables, carrots and potatoes which could be transported there.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, it is also important that this Ministry makes its planning all-inclusive. I know there is always a tendency for technocrats and people in management to sit together and start planning and think or assume that they know everything for everybody. This is a Ministry that I would like to urge to go out and be all inclusive. They should include Members of Parliament and the citizens for whom they are planning so that whatever the outcome is, it would have taken into account all the needs of this country.

It is so important to be strategic. If this Ministry does not think strategically, we will not move as fast as we would if they were thinking strategically. For example, it beats me - I do not understand the first planners of this country - that year after year, there are floods in Budalang'i in western Kenya and drought and famine in Turkana and other parts and yet we do not plan for permanent solutions to these problems. That is why I would urge this Ministry, in its planning, to plan strategically so that we can eliminate the floods in Budalang'i and other parts of western Kenya. They should also plan what to do for the people of Turkana so that they can feed themselves.

Otherwise, if they cannot completely feed themselves, then they should be removed from there, and we make that area

a national park and these people be transported to places where they can feed themselves. Using money to feed people all the time is just like Recurrent Expenditure. It does not develop, motivate and uplift people. So, it is for this reason that I am saying that this Ministry must be very strategic in their thinking so that as they are holding us in the front, they can move this country in the right direction.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, this is the Ministry that is supposed to hold the torch for this country so as to show us the direction that we should go. Where I come from, and I have enumerated what we grow, and there are other things grown in other parts of the country--- Why is it that the people who, especially rely on agriculture in this country are poor and will remain poor? It is because there is no value addition. Year after year, they grow and sell the same crops. They are

exploited by the middle men but there is no value addition. If there was value addition even for potatoes in the preservation and canning, we could export them to the Middle East and even send them to our brothers in North Eastern Province. This could fetch us a lot of money which would in turn not only improve the living standards of the people growing them but help this country develop. So, I urge that we take into account value addition.

The Assistant Minister for Education (Prof. Olweny): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to support this Motion. I would like to say that the Constituencies Development Fund (CDF) money that we are getting at the moment is too little. Mr. Minister, you were a Member of Parliament in the last Parliament and you are one of the people who were complaining that the CDF allocation was too low. Today, I am still complaining about this allocation, but I do not know whether you are comfortable now that you are in charge of that Ministry. Please, do something about the amount which is too little. The CDF is the main development fund that we are getting in this country. Please, do something about it, so that Kenyans are happier than they are. Kenyans are happy with the money, but it is too little.

In regard to the poverty indices, it beats logic when our professionals sit in their offices and fake data. They make data in the direction that certain politicians want and then they get protection from those politicians. Let us say the truth! Let us take the example of Rarieda Constituency. It is one of those constituencies which were rated as poor before and Kikuyu Constituency which was rated as rich.

Now, somewhere along the line, about five years, you find Rarieda Constituency going up and then some of those constituencies which were rated rich and wealthy suddenly become poor. If it is the question of projection, what really happened to those constituencies which were rich and wealthy? It beats logic! Then you find politicians shouting in support of those professionals who have faked data. Kenya is a country where people fake data. Likewise, last year's Kenya Certificate of Secondary Education (KCSE) results were faked, then you find some politicians coming out to support the professionals who have faked data.

**Mr. Midiwo:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. I think I have just heard the Assistant Minister for Education admitting before the House and on the HANSARD, that the results for last year's KCSE were faked? Could he kindly substantiate because this country deserves to know more?

**The Assistant Minister for Education** (Prof. Olweny): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I do not need to substantiate the obvious. There were problems with the returns of last year.

Mr. Mbadi: On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir.

**The Assistant Minister for Education** (Prof. Olweny): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, could you allow me to continue with my debate?

The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki): Proceed, Prof. Olweny!

**The Assistant Minister for Education** (Prof. Olweny): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, just a few years ago---

**Mr. Mbadi:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir.

**The Assistant Minister for Education** (Prof. Olweny): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, could the hon. Member listen to me? This is very important for you!

A few years ago, Nyanza Province was rated as the worst in terms of HIV/AIDS infection, and actually it was and is still the highest. The number of orphans that we have in that part of the country is huge. Since a lot of money was coming into this country to support areas where the HIV/AIDS was high, somewhere in Thika, people decided that they were infected. Then there was this same data that made a huge number of people from there, have HIV/AIDS infection. Why are our professionals faking data? They should be professional. If they want to become politicians who are comfortable with lying sometimes here and there, let them leave those jobs that they are doing

and join us. Some of us, like myself, always like the truth. But a few of us like lies or misleading the country. We always have the word "misleading" in this House because some of us mislead the House.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, this morning there was a very good Motion on the Floor of the House with regard to the constituencies being made districts. It would make planning very easy for this Ministry, other Ministries and the Government in general. This is because instead of planing

for districts, constituencies and locations at the same time, let us have one unit for planning. I think using constituencies will be the best, because after all, the money that is doing wonders today is for the constituencies. Other devolved funds like the Local Authorities Transfer Fund (LATF) could be based on that, even though today they are still based on local authorities. It would help everybody in this country if we did our planning based on constituencies, so that we leave out these others. In fact, even some of those people who are doing nothing in their employment would better be used, if they were incorporated into the planning based on constituencies. They would serve this country more.

Planning for development will not work out well if infrastructure is not properly planned for. We will not have faster development if we have the kind of roads that we have in the rural areas. This Ministry should liaise strongly with the Ministry of Roads and plan for good roads in this country. There can be no development without roads. The Ministry should also link up with the Ministry of Transport and rehabilitate the railway line. Today, the railway line is gone. A few people decided to buy it for some little and then decided that the train should not reach certain parts of the country. That is still faking. Let this Ministry link up with other Ministries, so that they plan well for infrastructure. We cannot develop without the railway system and good roads. How shall we transport goods? Today, our President gave a directive to stop trucks with four axles on our roads. But those trucks are the ones which are ferrying heavy goods. If they do not use the roads and we do not have the railway system, how are things going to work? Let us have a railway system that will serve this country for the purpose of development.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, with those few remarks, I beg to support.

Mr. Midiwo: Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. I rise to support this Vote.

First of all, I want to say that this is, probably, the most important Ministry in any country which is sincere and is interested in developing and going to the next level. I think it is about time that we, as a country, embraced the importance of planning for our future. I want to say that the Ministry needs to take off on a good

footing. There are several issues, which I think are coming out of this debate, which affect Members. I think we seem to want to address them differently. But I think that the Ministry could act as a bridge, first, to assure people of fair distribution of resources. But that means that the Ministry itself must be equipped. Because of our corrupt history as a country, the Ministry of Finance has over the years been strangled by the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030, by not giving it money and the requisite resources to police and monitor the projects which they are supposedly to have planned them.

The offices of the District Development Officers (DDOs), for example, are very corrupt. In every district, they do not even have assistants! How can one person operate an office single-handedly? That is setting a very bad example. Siaya District has a population of over 640,000 people with one DDO. It has three constituencies. It is not possible for one person to effectively supervise development without a vehicle or an assistant! In fact, I pity those men and women who are charged with the duty of being DDOs in this country. I think they are really doomed to suffer, given what is expected out of them!

So, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to urge the Minister and the Permanent

Secretary, who is also here that, this is simple; tell the Ministry of Finance that you need more money, like we are telling it from the Floor of this House. Tell us, as leaders, that this is what you need in terms of personnel to supervise effectively what you will be planning for us from now on. I think it is important to begin from that premise. I do not think without money, you can do anything. We need to appeal to the Ministry of Finance, now that we have a Minister who is acting there--- I hope and wish that he is confirmed soon. He is better than the other crooks who were there before.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to appeal to the Minister for Finance to help free the Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030---

**Mr. Ethuro:** On a point or order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Is the word "crooks" that the hon. Member has used, parliamentary?

The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki): Order, Hon. Midiwo!

**Mr. Midiwo:** I withdraw that word, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, just so that I can catch up on time.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, he is better than the other ones who were there to look after their stomachs; the ones who were selling our national monuments left, right and centre, and hope to get away with it.

The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki): Order, Hon. Midiwo!

**Mr. Midiwo:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. In your planning, as a Ministry, plan for the youth, plan for the elderly, plan for our infrastructure; plan for everything; all sectors of our lives and bring those plans before hon. Members, so that we can see them and put in the political will of the people. All we hear about is seminars at the Kenya Institute of Education (KIE) or wherever. But there is none where the input of hon. Members of Parliament, as the representatives of the people, is called for! You cannot plan on behalf of our people without the input of the representative of the people! I think that is a mess that we must plug in for the betterment of planning. That is because in any country that is serious about its future, that is a good factor! Actually majority of them!

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, let us invest the right way. I want to challenge the Ministry that, issues which concern hon. Members--- Some are about some places that are not getting enough resources. The minorities are not being taken care of. But I want to say that we do not want to sound as if it is better for the majority to oppress the minority. But it is also not right that you look after the

interests of the minority without looking at the interests of the majority! Therefore, when you divide the CDF, for example, or any other resources, you must look at the population! You must look at the regional and geographical vastness! You must look at poverty indices! How can it be that, a couple of years down the line, Gem Constituency turns out to be richer than Othaya, for example?

In those other poverty indices, for example, I think the hon. Member who was contributing was wrong. That is because he had an interest as a former Assistant Minister in that Ministry! Sometimes, we use mischief to bring issues on the Floor of the House knowing that, once we are called the majority, we cannot defend our stand or speak against things which we think are wrong. That is not going to happen very easily!

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, having said that, there are only two areas which are open to this country in which, if we invest our monies, even if it is 30 or 40 per cent of our Budget, this country will be transformed immediately! The Port of Mombasa! Take money and do it. You will never regret it! You will, number one, increase what you collect in terms of revenue, instantly. You will just sit there and revenue will come in if you expand the Port and improve its management capability. That takes money! It is better than giving women Kshs1 million per constituency. It is better than giving the youth. If you give 12 youths Kshs50,000, that is only like

Kshs3,000 or Kshs4,000 per person. That is not planning. That is not development.

Your next area of planning where you should spend some money is Lake Victoria! If it is the second-highest taxpayer in the country, why not invest in it? Why is it all ridden with water hyacinth? It is the Government which should give people cold storage and not Members of Parliament! It is the work of the Government! We only have got those two raw areas. That is because in the sugar and cotton growing areas, things have changed. You must get money from the Port to distribute to western Kenya, where cotton can grow. But you must begin with ready money, which is only in the Indian Ocean and in Lake Victoria.

You think about what I am telling you because, in Mauritius, it has been done. In the Port of Djibouti - and the Minister was with me when that part of the story was told by the Chief Executive Officer of the Port of Djibouti. They took over, invested nothing and now, they have been able to construct a dual carriageway from the Port of Djibouti to Addis-Ababa, and going on to Central Africa! I can bet you on that! On the day they will finish that project, you will not have the Port of Mombasa. That is because all the cargo we are playing around with--- We have closed the railway--- Just a few crooks have formed a company and bought Kenya Railways for Kshs1,000. That is all it is!

**The Temporary Deputy Speaker** (Prof. Kaloki): Order, Hon. Midiwo! You still said the word "crooks"! Withdraw that statement and move on.

**Mr. Midiwo:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I withdraw that part, if it is an offence. But I am saying that a few dishonest Kenyans registered a few companies within a couple of months and acquired Kenya Railways for only Kshs1,000. I can prove it. It is all factual! We need to be fair and true to our duty as leaders, whether you are in the Executive or just an hon. Member of Parliament. I think that is what duty calls us to do.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we need to increase CDF, even if it is up to 10 per cent. It is the only thing working in the country. We need to accept that. The World Bank and the International Monetary Fund who were opposed to it have now accepted that the example which is working in Kenya, is a good thing. Many countries are now coming here to see how we did it. This Parliament deserves credit!

#### (Applause)

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we need to plan for contingencies in our planning. Why are Kenyans still dying of hunger? How are we supposed to feel if we see that in Msambweni, many parts of Coast Province, Pokot and Turkana, Kenyans are dying of hunger? I think we could improve and do better as a country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, with those very many remarks, I beg to support.

The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Peter Kenneth!

The Assistant Minister, Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Kenneth): Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity.

I know that we will be replying officially through the Minister, but I just want to share a few experiences with my colleagues. It is important that we appreciate the kind of issues that we have in the Ministry and take it upon ourselves as Parliamentarians to play the role of oversight, to be able to help ourselves.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the previous hon. Members who spoke and, notably, Mr. Midiwo, who is a member of the Departmental Committee on Finance, Planning and Trade, is very well aware of certain facts that leave the Ministry tied. Despite all the good plans that the Ministry has, ours can only be planning. Implementation is done by the line Ministries. I want to

give a few facts. The Budget that we passed here amounted to about Kshs580 billion. Out of which, Kshs480 billion will come from Gross Revenue collection and Kshs100 billion from donors.

So, we are talking about Kshs580 billion without Appropriation-in-Aid (A-in-A). Looking at this Budget, you will see that the component for development is Kshs180 billion, while the cost of running the Government is Kshs400 billion. So, we keep on talking of developing when the big chunk of our money factored in the Budget goes towards Recurrent Expenditure. If we want to develop this country, we have to think of how we can reduce the cost of Government and allocate a bigger slice to the cost of development. Otherwise, we will spend time here as Parliament. We will continue speaking, and we will not progress.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, that is why I understand hon. Members' feelings when they say that it is important that we increase the CDF allocation. Those are the funds that will be used to implement projects at the grassroots level. The issue of increasing the CDF allocation is an issue which Parliament can discuss and agree upon. We know that Constitutionally, any Bill to increase any amount of expenditure requires Presidential assent. Hearing remarks made by the Chairman of the CDF Select Committee, I was astonished, because he should be on the forefront in encouraging and seeing that the right legislation on the CDF is actually discussed by this House. It is very easy to come here and criticise the percentage. As I said, I was astonished that the person criticising is the Chairman of the CDF Select Committee, and yet he should be on the forefront.

Secondly, I want to encourage hon. Members that within the CDF, we need to have a harmonised way of developing this country. At the moment, what we have is 210 visions of 210 Members of Parliament. Therefore, I want to appeal to Members of Parliament. Now that we have Vision 2030, why can we not align ourselves to Vision 2030 and develop certain basic requirements for our country, which are based on it, so that we grow the country together. It will be pointless to give every constituency CDF money when we are all developing differently, and not in the same direction. So, it is important that, we, as Members of Parliament, align ourselves to Vision 2030.

Thirdly, in as much as our Ministry is required to do the actual planning, a lot of that work has been undertaken, but it is Members of Parliament who scrutinise every Ministry. I alluded to a figure of Kshs180 billion being the amount voted for development

this year. We have 40 Ministries. When we allocate those 40 Ministries money for development, we are, probably spreading too thin to actually achieve anything out of the money we have voted for development. Therefore, if we really want to grow, we have to look at areas of priority, work and decide on them. If it is infrastructure, we should say that we want to sort out, in one financial year, infrastructure problems and go to the Development Vote for infrastructure. That is the only way we will grow.

A lot has been alluded to the poverty index. I have a lot of faith in the Kenya Bureau of Statistics (KBS) and the officers in the Ministry. Any research has its own data. They have data backing their own research. It is important, if there are doubts, therefore, not to politicise it. Let us look at the data and say: "This data is not correct." I would like to see any Member of Parliament coming to tell me that he has looked at the data---

**The Temporary Deputy Speaker** (Prof. Kaloki): Time is up, Mr. Kenneth! Do you support the Motion?

The Assistant Minister, Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Kenneth): Yes, I support the Motion, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. That is how I started.

The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki): Thank you.

Hon. Members, I now call upon the Minister to reply.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to take this opportunity to thank all the hon. Members of this House for overwhelmingly supporting this Ministry's Vote. All those hon. Members who spoke, except one, supported the Vote. I am happy that hon. Members have recognised the challenges facing the Ministry. Of course, they have come up with quite good ideas, which will help my Ministry's officials to improve the way we plan and do other things.

I will respond to some of the specific issues raised by hon. Members, starting with the CDF. Hon. Members have rightly said that we need to increase the CDF allocation to more than 2.5 per cent of the Ordinary Revenue. Parliament agreed that the CDF to be 2.5 per cent of ordinary revenue. Having said that, I would like to clarify that the decision to increase the CDF allocation is not within my purview, but rather within the purview of the Minister for Finance. However, I have noted the sentiments of hon. Members. I will take up the issue with the Minister concerned.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, before I continue to respond to other issues, I want to specifically respond to issues raised by the Chairman of the CDF Select Committee. It should be noted that I was a Member of the last Parliament, which came up with the CDF Act. During that time, I was a Member of the Departmental Committee on Finance, Planning and Trade. Therefore, as a Member of that Committee, I got involved in the development of the CDF Act. In fact, Mr. Midiwo was also a Member of the Departmental Committee on Finance, Planning and Trade, and he can attest to that.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, during that time, Mr. Ethuro was an Assistant Minister in the then Ministry of Planning and National Development. The hon. Member raised the issue of the CDF allocation being Kshs10.1 billion instead of Kshs11.6 billion, to which I agree. The amount of Kshs10.1 billion is the figure that was read out by the Minister for Finance when he presented the National Budget to this House. When I did some calculations and established that the correct figure would have been Kshs11.6 billion, I took up the matter with the Minister, who responded

positively and said that he would consider including the Kshs1.6 billion in the Supplementary Estimates.

#### (Applause)

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, if I would not have waited to distribute the CDF until I get the Kshs1.6 billion, obviously, you would roast me here. You would be asking where the Kshs11.6 billion is.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, coming to the poverty index, the poverty figures were calculated in the year 2006. Mr. Oparanya was not in the Ministry of Planning and National Development then. When these figures were released sometime last year, I was not the Minister. They were released based on district poverty index. Obviously, we require the poverty index figures at constituency level, it was important that we get a rough estimate of the constituency index. This was done and there were a lot of variances. I took it upon myself to go and explain it to the committee which Mr. Ethuro chairs.I explained to him that if we adopted these 2008 figures—The Act says you use the poverty index but it does not say which one. I, therefore, said that because there are variances and Members of Parliament had already submitted proposals, it would be unfair for someone who has submitted a proposal of Kshs50 million to get Kshs40 million.

#### (Applause)

I, therefore, said that for the sake of harmony, let us maintain the status quo. We used the

figures of 1999 as projected because of two things. One is because we are going to do a census next year. Therefore, we shall have more accurate population and poverty figures. Secondly, the method used then to calculate the poverty index--- We discovered that some areas get relief food. However, when calculating the poverty index, they used calories consumed. Therefore, if you have been given relief food and you feed on those calories, do we say you are rich? You are relying on relief food.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, because of these technicalities, we agreed and we have minutes. It is unfair for a Member to come here and mislead the House. We have minutes to the effect that I met the Members and we agreed that for the next two years, we will maintain the *status quo* until a census is done and a proper method of calculating the poverty index is adopted. I do not understand how the Office of the Prime Minister, therefore, comes in. It is very unfair. I would want you to look at the minutes of the day I met the Members of the Committee. We have to take the business of this House very seriously.

All said and done, let me move to some of the specific issues raised by Members of Parliament. Under the CDF, the issue of lack of well established institution mechanisms, administration weaknesses, poor planning linkages and flawed delivery of resources were raised. There was also the issue of involvement of Board of Management on day to day management of CDF. Last week but one, there was another issue on the CDF. A Member raised an issue and I said that we are now in the process of recruiting a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to run the CDF. Some of these issues are there because most of the staff we have are on secondment from the Ministry, Parliament or Ministry of Finance. As soon as we recruit a CEO, we shall have proper people recruited so that they manage the fund properly. This will leave some of the work to be undertaken by the CDF Board.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, there are issues of misappropriation. Every day, if you read newspapers you will find there is a case of misappropriation of the

CDF. Under the Constituencies Development Fund (2007), the CDF Board is a body corporate. It can sue and be sued. We are hoping that it will now come up with a legal unit which will deal with issues of misappropriation more expeditiously than relying on the Central Government to deal with that. Instead of referring issues to the Kenya Anti-Corruption Commission (KACC), they will deal with them directly.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Local Government raised the issue of minimum threshold for CDF projects. This is a good idea. Sometimes you find that we spread out the funds quite thinly. This does not benefit members of the public who are supposed to benefit from the fund. There is also the issue of capacity building for Government officials such as the District Accountants and Fund Managers. This is being addressed and I hope that we will organise a workshop for all the Government officers. I will request Members of Parliament to be there so that some of the issues they are raising here can be raised at that forum so that we can thrash out some of the differences and obstacles in the management of the Fund.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, on the issue of monitoring and evaluation, as we push for the increase of the Fund, we need proper structures at the constituency level to ensure that there is proper implementation and evaluation of projects. There should also be proper reporting on activities undertaken in every constituency. These are issues we have a problem with now.

The Member for Embakasi Constituency raised the issue of professionals not being used in projects. The Act allows that when proposing or evaluating a project, one can hire the services of private professionals. So, you either hire services of private professionals or use Government officials at the district level.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, looking at the census, collection of data is very

important. We are taking next year's census very seriously. Members have raised the issue of us not using modern technology in collection of data. This is being undertaken. The Member for Emuhaya raised quite a number of issues on mapping which is his speciality. I can assure you I shall invite you to the Ministry and show you that we are using quite modern technology to undertake the census exercise.

Already, I have gazetted rules and regulations that are going to be used, and I invite hon. Members to look at them. If there is something that can be changed, since we still have time, I will be ready to make the amendments to those rules and regulations. You expect that there will be challenges, but unlike in the last census, I am hoping that with technology, we will be able to undertake the exercise quite professionally.

Regarding the IFAD projects, this was a critical issue; hon. Members raised the issue of having projects in South Nyanza and another one in central Kenya. Let me assure the hon. Members that we have had quite a number of projects under IFAD in other areas. For example, at the Coast Province, we had the Coast ASAL Development Project, which was undertaken by IFAD and it has already been completed. In Western Province, we had the Western Kenya Agricultural Programme, which was implemented and completed.

In Eastern Province, we had a project on Eastern Province Horticulture and Traditional Food Crops Project, which was implemented by IFAD and completed. In the Rift Valley, Western Province and Nyanza Province, we had Small Holders Dairy Commercialization Project, which, at the moment, is on-going. But it is not within my Ministry. In the Rift Valley, Western, Nyanza, Eastern and Central Provinces, we have had the Small Horticulture Marketing Programme, which is being implemented under the Ministry of

Agriculture and it is on-going. There are many others. So, it is not true that we have selectively selected the two regions for the two projects. There are other projects, but they are being implemented by other line Ministries. Furthermore, these two projects were started in 2002, and are just on-going. So, this was just an additional budget. In fact, both of them are coming to an end in two years' time.

[The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Prof. Kaloki) left the Chair]

[Mr. Deputy Speaker took the Chair]

Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to draw the attention of Members of Parliament that we have other funds in my Ministry like the Community Trust Development Fund, which you can access. Usually, it is advertised through newspapers and if you do a proposal and they feel that a proposal is the right one, they will give out the funds. So, there is no discrimination at all, Dr. Khalwale.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, Vision 2030 is a development blue print for this country, which is being implemented by the Ministry. We are at the early stages of implementation of Vision 2030. Some of the issues raised by the hon. Members are very pertinent, and we are going to consider and take them up, especially as we prepare the next Medium-Term Plan, which we have already started preparing for 2012 to 2017. Now we are already implementing the 2008 to 2012 plan.

However, there are still issues that I need to highlight before I move on. On issues concerning human resource development, PPPs and tourism, I invite hon. Members to read the Vision 2030. I am planning that we have a workshop to look at the Vision 2030 and the Medium-Term Plans, and also the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which I have just launched through a Mid-Term Report. There are other issues that I feel are quite pertinent, and which have

been raised by Members of Parliament, and which I will take it upon myself to raise with the relevant Ministers. These include the creation of new districts where all constituencies should be districts. I also support that idea for proper implementation of most of the projects at the grassroots. We need the implementers and planners to be together.

The issue of constituency boundaries and flow of funds from the central Government to the devolved units is very critical. There is also the issue of supervising projects in line Ministries. An hon. Member raised the issue of where road construction takes some time and asked what we, as planners, do? As soon as we plan, we leave it to the line Ministries to do the implementation. We need to strengthen our monitoring unit, so that we are able to raise a red flag and indicate that some projects are not being implemented appropriately.

With those few remarks, I beg to move.

(Question put and agreed to)

[Mr. Deputy Speaker left the Chair]

#### IN THE COMMITTEE

[The Temporary Deputy Chairman (Prof. Kaloki) took the Chair]

Vote 06 - Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030

**The Temporary Deputy Chairman** (Prof. Kaloki): Hon. Members, we are now in the Committee of the whole House, and I now call upon the Minister to move the Motion.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:-

THAT, a sum not exceeding Kshs6,776,467,850

be issued from the Consolidated Fund to complete the sum necessary to meet expenditure during the year ending 30th June, 2009 in respect of:-

Vote 06 - Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030.

(Question proposed)

#### VOTE R06 - RECURRENT EXPENDITURE

SUB-VOTE 060 - GENERAL ADMINISTRATION AND PLANNING

(Head 527 agreed to)

(Sub-Vote 060 agreed)

SUB-VOTE 061 - PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

(Heads 204, 207, 211, 212, 218, 220, 221, 222, 242, 249 and 758 agreed to)

(Sub-Vote 061 agreed to)

SUB-VOTE 062 - STATISTICAL SERVICES

(Head 214 agreed to)

(Sub-Vote 062 agreed to)

(Vote R06 agreed to)

## VOTE D06- DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURE

SUB-VOTE 060 - GENERAL ADMINISTRATION AND PLANNING

(Head 527 agreed to)

(Sub-vote 060 agreed to)

SUB-VOTE 061 - PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

Head 207- Rural Planning Directorate

**Dr. Khalwale:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, the Minister has indicated to us that the funds that are being used for that development are actually from a donor. There are other donors who have funds that can be availed for development elsewhere. In future, I think it would be nice if the Minister could make it transparent, so that these things are not done privately in the Ministry. That way, Members of Parliament (MPs) can know who the other donors are in order to take the necessary steps.

The Temporary Deputy Chairman (Prof. Kaloki): Could you respond, Mr. Minister?

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, if you look at the end of it, we have clearly shown which other donors are funding us. It is clearly shown that IFAD is one of the major donors. We also have the European Union (EU). So, the money for the community trusts comes through the EU and those other projects come through IFAD. Those are the major donors.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I notice that under the Vote Head, there is a significant allocation of Kshs37 million for the Rural Planning Directorate for Research.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am wondering what kind of research the Minister intends to do. There is also an additional allocation for grants to Government agencies and other levels of Government amounting to Kshs327 million. Which are the other levels of Government because I thought that the Ministry of State

for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 has nothing to do with the Local Government. Could the Minister also satisfy this Committee whether the allocation of Kshs38

million to the new Department of Vision 2030 is enough for us to realise Vision 2030?

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, if I can answer the question on Vision 2030 first, we had requested for Kshs500 million for its implementation. But because the Ministry of Finance thought that the implementation will be delayed and come towards the end of the financial year, it only approved Kshs37 million. It approved Kshs37 million on condition that there was one donor who had already committed to give us Kshs100 million. That is the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). So, UNDP has committed to give us Kshs100 million. In the Vote, we have Kshs37 million.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, on the issue of Kshs38 million which the hon. Member has raised, the IFAD Project of South Nyanza is coming to an end. So, they are carrying out the impact assessment. The Kshs37 million is supposed to carry out the impact assessment of that project, so that they can either renew it or close the shop.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I did not see the other figure he talked about. He mentioned a figure of Kshs300 million. I do not know under which Head that amount of money falls.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, this is the vote on grant from Government agencies---

**The Temporary Deputy Chairman** (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Minister, would you, please, respond?

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I cannot see it. What is the number of the Head?

**The Temporary Deputy Chairman** (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Minister, it is under the Development Expenditure.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, it must be under a Head. Is it Head 207, 208 or 211? I do not see the Kshs 300 million the hon. Member has talked about.

**The Temporary Deputy Chairman** (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Ethuro, under Sub-Vote 061, could you tell us the exact Head and item you are referring to?

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I do not know if we are on the same page with the hon. Member.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to agree. This is an accumulation from Government agencies. I did the totalling myself. I had prepared these notes much earlier. I can let him go on this one.

(Head 207 agreed to)

(Heads 208, 211, 218, 220, 221, 222, 242, 249, 253, 614, and 758 agreed to)

(Sub-Vote 061 agreed to)

SUB-VOTE 062 - STATISTICAL SERVICES

**Dr. Khalwale:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I would like the Minister to explain to us briefly about Item 5120200 which is on Foreign Borrowing - Direct Payments.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, this is money borrowed from World Bank; that is, Kshs40 million for start-gap projects. The money will go directly to the projects and it will be mainly used for building capacity within those projects.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, still on the same Head, and I am getting this one right, Item 1320100 - Grants from International Organizations - Cash through Exchequer; and, Item 1320200 - Grants from International Organizations. Which are these organizations and what is the difference, particularly knowing that the Government says that it is meeting these from the domestic budget and not international organizations?

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I do not see anything on Grants from International Organizations. It is nil. There is some grant of Kshs4 million from international organizations, but I cannot know the specific organizations. There is nothing under that Item 1320200 for this year.

**Mr. Ethuro:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, it is true there is nothing under Item 1320100 for this year, but there was something previously and also in the projected Estimates. So, it is not enough to say that it is not there.

Secondly, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, there is Item 1320200 which definitely has Kshs4,411,400. Could he, please, explain that? He is very happy when it is nil, but when there is something, he conveniently forgets.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, the figure is so small. I need my technical people to tell me what it is actually.

The Temporary Deputy Chairman (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Minister, you can consult your technical team.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am free to consult my technical team.

The Temporary Deputy Chairman (Prof. Kaloki): Mr. Minister, yes, you are free to do so.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Temporary Deputy Chairman, Sir, this grant is from three organizations; namely, DFID, UNF and UNDP. It is a small grant for capacity building. That is what they do. You know they give us money for soft options and not hard options.

(Head 214 agreed to)

(Sub-Vote 062 agreed to)

(Vote D06 agreed to)

(Question put and agreed to)

(Resolution to be reported without amendment)

(The House resumed)

[Mr. Deputy Speaker in the Chair]

#### **REPORT**

Vote 06 - Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030

**Prof. Kaloki:** Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I am directed to report that the Committee of Supply has considered the Resolution that a sum not exceeding Kshsh6,776,467,850 be issued from the Consolidated Fund to complete the sum necessary to meet expenditure during the year ending 30th June, 2009 in respect of Vote 06 - Ministry of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030, and has approved the same without amendment.

The Minister of State for Planning, National Development and Vision 2030 (Mr. Oparanya): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I beg to move that the House doth agree with the Committee in the said Resolution.

The Assistant Minister for Foreign Affairs (Mr. Onyonka) seconded.

(Question proposed)

(Question put and agreed to)

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Hon. Members, the House now stands adjourned until, Thursday, 23rd October, 2008, at 2.30 p.m.

The House rose at 5.52 p.m.