

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

## OFFICIAL REPORT

Wednesday, 28th October, 1998

The House met at 2.30 p.m.

*[Mr. Speaker in the Chair]*

PRAYERS

## ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

*Question No. 141*

ACQUISITION OF CITIZENSHIP BY FOREIGNERS

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Wafula not in? Next Question!

*Question No. 429*

NUMBER OF ROBBERY INCIDENTS IN NYERI

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Mutahi also not in? Next question!

*Question No. 249*

CONSTRUCTION OF PUBLIC TOILET  
AT NYAMONYE MARKET

**Mr. Speaker:** Dr. Oburu also not in? Next Question!

*Question No. 529*

PROVISION OF POSTAL SERVICES IN BUDALANGI

**Mr. Wanjala** asked the Minister for Transport and Communications:-

(a) if he is aware that there is unsatisfied demand for postal and telephone services in Budalangi Constituency; and,

(b) if the answer to "a" is in the affirmative, when the Budalangi, Sisenye and Osieko markets will be provided with postal and telephone services.

**The Assistant Minister for Transport and Communications** (Mr. Obure): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

(a) I am not aware that Budalangi Constituency has unsatisfied demand for postal and telephone services.

(b) Budalangi has postal services which are considered satisfactory at the moment. The possibility of providing postal telephone services at Osieko and Sisenye during the current five Year Development Plan is being explored by Kenya Posts and Telecommunications Corporation.

**Mr. Wanjala:** The Assistant Minister is giving quite unsatisfactory answers. Osieko is very far from where the main post office in the division is situated. It is not easy to reach it from Port Victoria Post Office. Sisenye is also very far and without postal and telephone services. It is the same for Budalangi Market. Could the Assistant Minister tell us when these Markets will be supplied with telephone and postal services?

**Mr. Obure:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I did point out that Osieko and Sisenye do not have postal services at the moment, but that under the current five year Development Plan there will be a possibility of installing these services in the two centres. Budanlangi has both telephone and a sub-post office situated in the same centre which

provides a number of services and at the moment those services are considered adequate.

**Mr. Kombo:** The demand for telephones in this country is such that over 150,000 people are on the waiting list. If this Government was looking for revenue to connect such telephones at Kshs7,500 and you multiply this with 150,000 people, you would collect Kshs1.2 billions. So, it would be really wrong for the Minister to stand here and say Budalangi demand is satisfied and that he is not aware. If in the whole country we still have 150,000 people on the waiting list, could he confirm that?

**Mr. Obure:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have no problem with what the hon. Member has just said. In fact, it is true that there is unsatisfied demand all over the country for telephone services and I am aware of that. But we are talking about the situation in Budalangi constituency. My information is that in Akati, for example, which is connected to the phone services and has the capacity of 300, lines only 32 of those have been connected because there are no subscribers which means that it is underutilised at the moment. Port Victoria has a capacity of 180 lines. Only 49 have been connected because there is no demand. Sio Port has the manual exchange with a capacity of 70 lines out of which only 17 are being used. There is underutilisation of the capacity in Budalangi Constituency. The two centres, Sisenye and Osieko, are under consideration and they will be connected. In fact, my information is that both are situated on swampy ground and that occasionally there is over flooding in the area that creates a problem, but we will serve the area.

**Mr. Wanjala:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, although the Assistant Minister is saying that they are going to consider the two centres, is he aware that Osieko is going to cover four locations in a swampy area? So, they should understand there is really a problem of communication among people in those places. Could the Assistant Minister tell us when and how fast he is going to reinstall the postal and telephone services in this area?

**Mr. Obure:** Those sentiments have been expressed very articulately. We understand them and we will urge the KPTC to try and speed it up. But in the meantime, we are asking the hon. Member for Budalangi to sensitise his people so that they can use these facilities. For example, even the sub-postal station at Budalangi a capacity for 100 private letter boxes, but only 28 of those are being used. So, please sensitise your people to use these facilities. We will help him to extend services to Osieko and Sisenye.

*Question No.197*

REVIVAL OF TOURISM

**Mr. Speaker:** Question No. 197 is by a stranger and, therefore, it is a non-issue. I want to make this absolutely clear that if your Question should come to the House when you have been excluded from the House on disciplinary grounds, that Question will never be brought back to the House. So, this is a non-issue. Next Question!

*Question No.539*

SACKING OF COASTAL PEOPLE BY  
COCA-COLA AFRICA LTD

**Mr. Mwakiringo** asked the Minister for Labour:-

- (a) if he is aware that Coca-Cola (Africa) Ltd. recently posted a General Manager (Sales) to Coastal Bottlers, Mombasa, who is aggravating the tension between the indigenous and upcountry people residing in Mombasa through unfair trade and labour practices such as sacking Coastal people employed by the firm and replacing them with people from upcountry; and,
- (b) if the answer to "a" above is in the affirmative, if he could take urgent steps to avert a potential conflict in the Company between the said General Manager and the local people.

**Mr. Obwocha:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Before this Question No.539 is answered, I think it contravenes the Constitution. Section 82 of the Constitution says that no person shall be treated in any discriminatory manner by a person acting by virtue of any written law or in the performance of the functions of a public office or authority and discrimination in this case means affording different treatment to different persons attributable to tribe, place of origin or place of residence or other connections.

**Mr. Speaker:** What is your response, Mr. Mwakiringo?

**Mr. Mwakiringo:** I think if that is the rule, then it is alright because the man has since been sacked and the situation is back to normal.

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is dropped for being unconstitutional.

*(Question dropped)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Wafula's Question for the second time!

*Question No.141*

ACQUISITION OF CITIZENSHIP BY FOREIGNERS

**Mr. Wafula** asked the Minister of State, Office of the President:-

- (a) how many Asian, Chinese and Japanese nationals have acquired Kenyan citizenship as from 1990 to-date; and,
- (b) whether he could table the list of their names.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am sorry! I had information that there was a request for the Question to be deferred. So, I do defer the Question.

*(Question deferred)*

*Question No.429*

NUMBER OF ROBBERY INCIDENTS IN NYERI

**Mr. Wamae**, on behalf of **Mr. Mutahi**, asked the Minister of State, Office of the President:-

- (a) how many shopkeepers have been attacked by night robbers in Nyeri District since last year (1997) and in which trading centres; and,
- (b) how many people have either been killed or wounded in such attacks and whether there have been any arrests of suspects.

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Sunkuli):** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

(a) A total of 23 shopkeepers have been attacked by night robbers since last year in Nyeri District, in the following trading centres:- Karatina, Ngunguru, Tumu Tumu, Kaheti, Mihutu, Chaka, Naro Moru, Gakochi, Kimondo, Katheri, Kathidudu and Othaya townships.

(b) Two shopkeepers have been killed and none wounded. A total of seven suspects have been arrested and arraigned before a court of law.

**Mr. Wamae:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, as you would have noted, there are too many robbers in the market. There are 23 robberies. What is the Assistant Minister doing to reinforce security in the area and ensure that the shopkeepers in the markets can live in peace and continue with their businesses? This is because many of those markets are dying and shopkeepers are robbed of their goods in the market.

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I agree with the hon. Member. The Government is trying to ensure that all trading centres are given security personnel. I just want to request the hon. Member to request of the public, with whom he is in contact, to keep their shops very safe, and to make sure that the buildings have also been erected in such a way that security will be available.

**Mr. Keriri:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, of late, in trying to provide security for this type of thing, the police and the Government have asked the local people to construct some buildings for police posts. We are doing that in some places. Can the Assistant Minister confirm that if we build semi-permanent buildings for the police posts, the Government will take over from there and make them permanent?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I appreciate the efforts made by some people in the country, to assist the Government to construct residences for policemen throughout the country. I would like to say that whenever the members of the public help the Government to do that, the Government will post police officers to those areas, and ensure that certain buildings are constructed to act as armouries, so that the arms are secure. But, the hon. Member does recognise that we are a poor country.

**Mr. Wamae:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, could the Assistant Minister come up with a simple design for building a police post, which can be adopted by people in the markets? He should give us a standardised form with a reasonable armoury and a good cell for keeping those elements in the society who want to disturb other members of the society. Would he come with a proper cheap design?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, if the hon. Member can come to my office, he will find that, that design is ready.

*Question No.249*

CONSTRUCTION OF PUBLIC TOILET  
AT NYAMONYE MARKET

**Dr. Oburu** asked the Minister for Local Authorities:-

- (a) whether he is aware that there is no public toilet at Nyamonye Market in Usigu Division of Bondo Constituency despite the raging cholera epidemic in the area; and,
- (b) if the answer to "a" is in the affirmative, what steps he is taking to ensure urgent construction of a public toilet at the market.

**The Assistant Minister for Local Authorities** (Mr. Sasura): For an area to have cholera, and for the same area to have not a single public toilet, is quite despicable and disturbing. A health calamity, or a potential calamity is quite dis-inviting to good public health.

Having cleared my conscience, I would like now to deliver the following answer.

**Mr. Speaker:** What was the first?

**The Assistant Minister for Local Authorities** (Mr. Sasura): The first one was an appetizer to the real one.

(a) It is true that there is no pit latrine at Nyamonye Market, and which market is operational, but the reason for that is that the previous toilet got filled up. The County Council of Siaya then undertook to dig a pit latrine, but was caught up during the heavy rains and the pit collapsed. Currently, the Council is preparing a pit latrine comprising three doors. The work is going on and will be completed within the next three weeks from now.

**Dr. Oburu:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I thank the Assistant Minister for the answer. But the toilet got filled up in 1996, and the *El Nino* was there last year. So, the real reason for not putting up the latrine was not because of the *El Nino*, but it was because the District Commissioner in Siaya was holding funds from the Services Charge which was supposed to be used for constructing this pit latrine, as a result of which, so many other markets within Siaya District, including Ajigo Market, were closed when the funds were actually being held or withheld by the DC. Can the Assistant Minister confirm or deny this?

**Mr. Sasura:** Indeed, if the funds were held up by the DC, our Ministry does not condone that type of activity. What we would like to say, in addition, is that there are very well established markets within the County Council of Siaya, that have toilets, except Nyadorera Market, which has a problem with the soil formation. Although the Council has financial constraints, the process of toilet provision facility in other markets is on-going and is being done in phases. Established markets, under the County Council of Siaya, Ng'ia, Akala, Sidindi and Aramy are currently well provided for. So, whatever else is left to be done, and with specific reference to the Question that was raised, we have, within three weeks, to provide that toilet, and it will be ready.

**Mr. Otula:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, now that the Minister has agreed that markets were closed, what steps is he going to take to make sure that the other markets are re-opened with completed toilets?

**Mr. Sasura:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, with specific reference to the Question that arose, we are going to have the toilet ready in three weeks. With respect to the rest of them, there is work that is on-going. When and how it will be completed, is also partly due to financial constraints encountered by the Siaya County Council. But we are giving an assurance that the issue of having no toilet in an area that is cholera-prone, is a very serious matter, as it affects good public health. Therefore, we are going to make sure that we actually apply our resources to solving that problem once and for all.

**Mr. Ngure:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I represent the Constituency where Aram Market is situated and I am really at home with the soil topography of Aramu Market. I know for sure there is no public toilet in Aramu Market. If it was there, it would have collapsed during the *El Nino* rains.

Is the Assistant Minister not misleading this House? If he knows there is a toilet at Aram Market, in Doli Market and other areas in Siaya District, can he give us the L.R. numbers where these toilets are situated?

**Mr. Sasura:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, these markets do not have any L.R. numbers as yet, so that we can extrapolate any L.R. numbers for toilets. So, they will have to wait for proper jurisdiction and adjudication for us to provide the same.

However, this Ministry has assurance to all those who are bothered by this issue. We are going to exact

our resources to ensure that these toilets are provided for. Thank you.

### QUESTIONS BY PRIVATE NOTICE

#### EVICTION OF NJUKINI RESIDENTS

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to ask the Minister of State, Office of the President the following Question by Private Notice.

(a) Is the Minister aware that over 800 families in Njukini Location of Taveta Sub-district in Taita Taveta District occupying land reference L.6730/1 and L.R.6730/2 are being evicted from their land which they have been occupying since 1950?

(b) Is he further aware that the Provincial Administration is allegedly involved in the burning and demolition of the houses and farms belonging to the affected residents?

(c) If the answers to "a" and "b" are in the affirmative, and given that there is a pending case in court over the issue, would the Minister order the on-going illegal eviction stopped until the case is heard?

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Sunkuli):** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

(a) I am not aware.

(b) I am not aware.

(c) In view of my reply in parts "a" and "b", part "c" does not arise.

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is unfortunate I do not even have a written answer and it is my hope that the Assistant Minister is going to come up with a better answer. The information I have is that this is a piece of land which has a dispute between people who have been living there for the last 48 years and they are being forced out of that plot.

The area has been given a chief, there are two sub-chiefs, three primary schools and all the required facilities. People have been living there since 1950 and they are being forced out of this place.

It is unfortunate that the Assistant Minister says he is not aware of what is happening.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, Mr. Katuku, if you knew all that, why ask?

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, is it in order for the Assistant Minister to deny having that knowledge which is common knowledge to everybody in that area?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member must trust my answer because I come from far away from there. The truth is that the land in question, L.R.6730/1 and L.R.6730/2 is land belonging to Ziwani Estate.

I am aware that there are 354 families who are squatting on that private land. Arrangements have been made to relocate these persons to a land near Lake Jipe which will be for resettling these persons.

I want to encourage the hon. Member to work together with the members of the communities in Taveta. I know he is doing so because the people in question have the same dissent as himself. That is why perhaps he has crossed so many boundaries.

**Mr. Kikuyu:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, while appreciating the last part of the Assistant Minister's answer, could he tell us when the laws of this land changed so that when one purchases a piece of land with squatters, one is allowed by law to buy another one to resettle those squatters there?

These people have been living in Taveta. Even the owners today were not born when these people started living there. Why are they being allowed to transfer them to Magadi which is too dry and inhabitable?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have not been to that particular piece of land. If hon. Kikuyu is asking for the principle behind it, the principle is that squatters must be settled somewhere.

**Mrs. Ngilu:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is embarrassing to hear a Kenyan call another Kenyan "a squatter", especially if a person has been living on that piece of land since 1950.

These people who are being removed from the land that they have lived in for so many years, why are they being removed from there and who is going to occupy that piece of land?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member was a Presidential candidate. She ought to know that the word "squatter" applies to everybody, be he a Kenyan or not, who lives on land which is not his.

**Mr. Munyai:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. The Assistant Minister who is a great friend of mine, I am afraid, is misleading this House. The answer he is reading has been drafted by the same Provincial Administration who are frustrating the inhabitants of Taita Taveta. The truth is that these people who have been living there for 48 years, have graveyards in that area and other developments in that area--

**Mr. Mbela:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Is the hon. Member in order to make allegations about Provincial Administration in an area he does not actually live in?

**Mr. Munyao:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am not misleading the House. In fact, a lot of evidence being used by these inhabitants is that when the hon. Mbela was a Minister, he supported these people in writing and assured them that they would be allocated this area. My question, at this point is that---

**Mr. Mbela:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Could he substantiate that allegation about me? Is he aware that it is a concentration of Kambas who are talking about Taita Taveta District which they do not know anything about?

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! I think, Mr. Munyao, you are wrong! You are asking the question to this Assistant Minister and you do not have to debate Mr. Mbela. I also urge hon. Members, to treat this as a national issue. Do not tribalise it!

**Mr. Munyao:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, we take your advice and your directives. I was responding to a point of order which the hon. Member raised---

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Order, Mr. Munyao!

**Mr. Munyao:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I will do exactly that. These inhabitants who have been living in that area and who have developed that area; and the families are more than 386--- Will the Assistant Minister consider allocating them those areas and give them title deeds? The areas where they are being proposed to be taken, nothing exists there. There are no monkeys let alone human beings.

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I can confirm to the Secretary-General that I have not been to that other area.

**Mr. Katuku:** The Assistant Minister is talking of a place where people have been living even before he was born and he cannot consider to allocate these people this piece of land. In fact, this land was allocated just the other day; in 1995, to one of the hon. Members of this Parliament and also the wife of a former Head of this State.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, Mr. Katuku! Mr. Katuku, your own Question is that those people are squatters. It does not help your case either way. Whether it was allocated to a barber, a Head of State or to a Member of Parliament, it still means the people you are complaining about are still squatters. Can you put your case in that light?

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am just concerned about the insensitivity---

**Mr. Speaker:** Order!

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, let me put my point----

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! You may be concerned about those people. I am also concerned about hon. Members using the Floor of this House to besmirch other people's names. That will not be allowed by me again to happen. Proceed!

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to put a very simple question to the Assistant Minister. When was this land in question allocated to the people who are said to be the owners of the land? Could we be told when?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member is referring to things done before I was born. He looks like he is of my age and I do not know how he came to know this. But as for the question he is asking, I do not have the facts for that one.

**Mr. Ndicho:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I am standing on a point on the following issue. This country has been independent for 34 years. The word "squatter" was used by the White Man who believed that all the land in this country belongs to him and Africans were squatters in their own country. Can we rule now that this House will never again use the word "squatter" against Kenya Africans. It is those Wazungus who should be squatters, not Africans. Mr. Speaker, can you rule that one out? We cannot have a few people called squatters in their own country.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, Mr. Ndicho! The word "squatter" is not an invention of either the Questioner or the Assistant Minister. It is an English word; Language which we have to use in this House, or which we may, actually, because we can avoid by using---

**Mr. Katuku:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! This is because we can avoid to speak it by using Swahili. But I may also advise you that, if you really care to read the basics in land law, you will be advised as to who is the land owner, a squatter, a trespasser, a licensee and a temporary occupant.

*(Several hon. Members stood up in their places)*

Order! Order! One thing that you are not going to ask me to do is to re-write the dictionary. Next Question!

*(Several hon. Members stood up in their places)*

Order! Order! "Order", means order! I do not want anybody to ask me to go on a journey of linguistics. That is not my occupation here.

**Mr. Munyao:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** What is it?

**Mr. Munyao:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, my point of order relates to the admission which was made by the Assistant Minister. I told him that, he was misled because the reply he is reading was produced by the same Provincial Administration who are frustrating those inhabitants. During that time, the Assistant Minister came up and admitted that he does not come from that area. Granted this Question is by Private Notice and, perhaps, the Assistant Minister did not have enough time to check. Would it be in order, if through the Chair, we could plead with the Assistant Minister whom we respect very much, to take a little bit more time and, on humanitarian grounds, investigate more and, perhaps, see how he can help these inhabitants? As he says, there are more than 386 families. There is a petition even with the hon. Questioner which the Assistant Minister will receive so that it would assist him in arriving at the right answer.

**Mr. Speaker:** What is your response to that plea?

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the plea is being made on humanitarian grounds. The only thing that the Government can do on humanitarian grounds is to settle squatters. What I did admit is that I did not know about the quality of the new land that they are going to move to. But I have absolutely no powers to keep people on land which belongs to others.

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Katuku, I think we have exhausted your questions.

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the last one please.

**Mr. Speaker:** Okay, the last one.

**Mr. Katuku:** Yes. Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I am delighted by your concern about these people. Before I ask my last question, I have a petition here from 800 families who are settled in that area, to this Government to consider allocating them land where they are and not to remove them. I would like to table this, Mr. Speaker, Sir, with your permission. My last question---

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! The petition is addressed to who?

**Mr. Katuku:** To this Government of Kenya. In view of---

**Mr. Speaker:** Maybe, I can help you, Mr. Katuku. If you look at the Order Paper, Order No.3 is Petitions. So, you do not just make a petition and table it the way you have done. There are specific rules governing the presentation of petitions to Parliament and you have to follow those rules, and then table that petition when the particular Order is called. So, that is actually how you table petitions.

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, thank you for your guidance. But I did not mean petition, maybe, it is a mix-up of language. As you said, you are not here to guide people on that. It is a request and, if you allow me, I will put it. In view of these circumstances and the fact that the Assistant Minister seems not to have the right answer for this, I would, through the Chair, request that this Question be deferred for the Assistant Minister to get time, go to the ground and find out the facts. As we are talking now the houses of these people are being burnt.

**Mr. Speaker:** I think, Mr. Katuku, again to help you, the best I can do is to facilitate you to give that request to the Assistant Minister and hopefully, he will listen. But I think there is no ground why I should postpone the Question. You may give it to him. I am sure Mr. Sunkuli will be willing to receive and listen.

*(Mr. Katuku laid the document on the Table)*

**Mr. Sunkuli:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I know that the hon. Member is a good man. In fact, he ought to be on this side, and on that ground, I will take his plea.

**Mr. Katuku:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker.

**Mr. Speaker:** What is it?

**Mr. Katuku:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I thought I was busy presenting my document here and the hon. Assistant Minister says that I should be on that side that is so unfair to me! I have never imagined being on that side. Could he withdraw that?

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Mr. Katuku, I do not think you are serious even to yourself. Supposing your party won, they would go to that side.

(Laughter)

**Mr. Katuku:** But they will come here!

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Kombo's Question.

IMPORTATION OF TEA SACKS BY KTDA

**Mr. Kombo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to ask the Minister for Agriculture the following Question by Private Notice.

(a) Is the Minister aware that for the last ten years Kenya Tea Development Authority (KTDA) has been buying tea sacks made from imported paper?

(b) Is he further aware that the cost of these imported tea sacks is between Kshs200 and Kshs220 per sack; whereas the local sacks which are used by all private tea factories in Kenya such as African Highlands Produce Limited and Brooke Bond (K) Limited cost between Kshs75 and Kshs80?

(c) Is he also aware that KTDA has issued a tender currently for three million bags whose specifications demand imported paper that is wet strength and extensible paper whose price will be three times higher than the local natural extensible sack?

(d) If the answers to "a" and "b" are in the affirmative and since the farmers will suffer huge financial losses if this tender is awarded, could the Minister, as a matter of urgency, cancel the tender and direct the Authority to purchase these sacks either in the local market or from the lowest tenderer so as to save farmers from incurring huge financial losses?

**The Minister for Agriculture** (Mr. Mudavadi): Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir---

**Hon. Members:** For the second day running!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Members!

**The Minister for Agriculture** (Mr. Mudavadi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, before I give the formal reply to the hon. Member and to the House, I would like to set some things straight because the perception created through the debate yesterday, and also through what has come out from the print media, has cast a lot of negative light on the person of Mrs. Nyachae who, to the best of our knowledge and to the best of the records that we have in the Ministry of Agriculture and with KTDA, has not in any way involved herself in whatever manner, in the question of tenders of KTDA.

So, I think it is important that when we make allegations on the Floor of this House, we are able to make them in a very clear manner. Before I respond to that Question, I would like to call upon the person who made these remarks, and this Mr. Osundwa, to either substantiate or withdraw and apologise.

**Mr. Wamae:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. The hon. Member who made that allegation will substantiate. Why does the Minister have to demand for it now? He should let the hon. Member substantiate or fail to substantiate.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Hon. Members, you realise that apart from being a Minister, Mr. Mudavadi is also the Leader of Government Business and he has a duty to seek the truth to this House. If, according to his Ministry, Mr. Osundwa told untruths in this House--- In fact, each one of you hon. Members owes a duty to this House; to let it be known when a Member has deliberately misled the House, and I think he should be commended for that. Now, Mr. Osundwa, do you remember what I told you yesterday, that you alleged that Mrs. Nyachae was part of the racket; the "scandal" as quoted by the *East African Standard* newspaper? I told you yesterday that today, you must come here prepared to substantiate that allegation. Are you ready now?

**Mr. Sambu:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Mr. Sambu, you are not known by the name Osundwa. I am dealing with Mr. Osundwa, and I will not deal with any other hon. Member until I am through with him. Mr. Osundwa!

**Mr. Osundwa:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

(Loud consultations)

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Order, all of you! I am the custodian of procedures. Yesterday, I directed that hon. Member to be prepared to substantiate. I am going to have that substantiation now and nobody is going to tell me in which way I am going to take that substantiation.

(Loud consultations)



Order! Order! Order! It is my duty to keep order in this House, and I want order! The first order of business is to get that hon. Member to substantiate before I go to the Question.

**Dr. Kituyi:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! It is not your business, Dr. Kituyi, to tell me how to conduct business. Will you sit down, Dr. Kituyi? Mr. Osundwa, will you now substantiate?

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I thought the normal procedure would have been to let the Minister answer the Question first as asked by hon. Kombo so that I can come and substantiate my remarks.

**Hon. Members:** Yes!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Mr. Osundwa, if what you said yesterday is untrue, the Question is not as important as the amount of damage you probably have inflicted on another hon. Member. Will you table your evidence now?

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, please bear with me. I would like the Minister to answer the Question first, and then I will come and substantiate.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Mr. Osundwa, this is not a request. It is an order for you to substantiate, and if you cannot, you withdraw.

**Mr. Anyona:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am sorry I have to deal with this hon. Member first. No way!

**Mr. Sambu:** Absolute cover-up!

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I---

*(Loud consultations)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! I am not going to be distracted. Mr. Osundwa, you have the Floor.

**Mr. Osundwa:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I do not know what this House is trying to cover in this matter. I have the evidence and I stand by what I said yesterday.

*(Applause)*

I am only requesting that the Minister answers the Question as put, so that I can substantiate from that.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Mr. Osundwa, why do you think your truth is dependent on what the Minister has to say?

**Hon. Members:** It is!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! I cannot have this behaviour. Unless, Mr. Osundwa, you are now telling the House and the Chair that you were directed to say what you said yesterday, you better tell us whether you are now refusing to answer. Mr. Osundwa, you are on your own, will you answer?

**Mr. Osundwa:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. The person named in this massive scandal is not hon. Nyachae, whom this House is trying to protect. I do not know why I am being told to substantiate before the Minister answers the Question as it was put yesterday.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Mr. Osundwa, you are not going to hold the Chair at ransom. You have been directed. If you read the transcripts of yesterday's HANSARD - I do not know whether anybody has a copy. Does Mr. Clerk have a copy? Any hon. Member with a copy of yesterday's HANSARD?

*(Mr. Angwenyi handed a copy of the HANSARD to Mr. Speaker)*

I hate to have the feeling that certain hon. Members just do not want the truth to come out. Yesterday, Mr. Osundwa, you made a claim that Mrs. Nyachae and other two persons were involved. I want to get it right from the HANSARD. What you said is on page six. What you said yesterday is as follows:-

"Mr. Speaker, Sir, the first recipient of this commission is Mr. E.G. Karanja who takes Kshs15 per bag. The second is a European called Mr. Sanderson, Kshs10 per bag, and the wife of Finance Minister, hon. Simeon Nyachae, Kshs5 per bag".

And there was a challenge, in fact, by Mr. Nyachae himself. The Finance Minister, hon. Nyachae, rose on a point of order and asked that you bring those documents, and this is what I said and it is on record:-

"I think Mr. Osundwa, you have heard the sentiments of the Minister. Because, through his wife, you have named him adversely. What I will do in all fairness, I will postpone this Question to

Thursday", which I changed to today.

Now listen carefully to what I told Mr. Osundwa.

After you finished saying that, there was a challenge by hon. Nyachae who told you that you must substantiate what you were saying. Now, the sequence of things. The next was to Mr. Karauri; I directed Mr. Karauri thus: "You have heard the sentiments of your colleagues. I am not directing you on how to answer the Question, but I think you have heard the feeling of the House. So, I give you upto Thursday."

**Hon. Members:** Wednesday!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! When I said Thursday, hon. Members pleaded with me and I brought it to today. So, I wanted Mr. Osundwa to prove what he said. I ordered him yesterday. Now, you must do it, Mr. Osundwa!

**An hon. Member:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir!

**Mr. Speaker:** You are out of order!

**Mr. Osundwa:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, Sir. You heard with your own ears when the Leader of Government Business stood up, he tried to cover Mr. Nyachae. Mr. Nyachae was not mentioned by me in this House. I am wondering what is so special about Mrs. Nyachae? There are other people in this scandal, and I do not understand why---

*(Applause)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Mr. Osundwa, it does not matter whether it is Mrs. Nyachae or any other Mrs. or Mr. for that matter. What matters is that you were ordered by the Chair yesterday to substantiate an allegation you made about a particular person. You must now do it. You are taking too much time! You must do it or refuse to do so.

**Mr. Sambu:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Mr. Sambu, I will not have it. Mr. Osundwa, I give you the last chance, otherwise I will consider you to be disorderly.

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have all the proof.

*(Loud consultations)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Can we hear what the Member has to say?

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, what I am saying is that I have all the proof to the allegations I made here yesterday. But I am insisting that I will not prove anything here until the Minister answers the Question. I would rather go out.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Even if it means--- On a question of order of this House--- By the way, it was just yesterday. I told this House that you are bringing the integrity of Parliament to rock-bottom. Order! Even if we have to use the relevant Standing Order to finish today's business at 7.00 p.m. I will have to get it right, because one thing I am not going to stand here, is to preside over a House being misused by Members to besmirch others. That I will not stand. If, Mr. Osundwa, you think, by any stretch of imagination that the Minister is going to substantiate for you, you are wrong. Mr. Mudavadi, just to finish all this, will you help Mr. Osundwa? Will you want to answer this Question?

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Angwenyi):** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, Mr. Angwenyi! Let me see if---

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Angwenyi):** Is Mr. Osundwa directing this House or you are directing us?

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Mr. Osundwa, it does appear to me--- Two things are very clear in my mind. Either you do not have substantiation or if you do, you are really very contemptuous of the Chair. None of them helps you. Choose now. Either you comply with my order or in the alternative, I will name you, send you out for three days---

**Hon. Members:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** And even on your return, I will still demand that you substantiate. So, choose your option, Mr. Osundwa.

*(Several hon. Members stood up in their places)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Can you not hear him? Order Mr. Kombo! Order! Mr. Kombo and Dr.

Kituyi, I am presiding over the House of the National Assembly. I am presiding with the authority of the House. None of you has that authority. Mr. Osundwa!

**Mr. Osundwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, it looks like the Chair is out to intimidate me. Can I request for a division on this matter, since the House seems divided on it?

*(Applause)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Order! Mr. Osundwa, for your persistent refusal to comply with orders of the Chair, I do now name you under Standing Order No.88. You are excluded from the premises of Parliament for three days and upon your return, I will still demand a further substantiation. You must now leave.

*(Loud consultations)*

Order! Order! Order! Order, Mr. Sambu! I do not know what is wrong with this tea thing. It has given me quite a bit of a problem. Order! Order! Order, hon. Members. Can we now come back to ourselves? It does not pay for us to spend 20 minutes, just to haggle over what a Member is actually bound to do under Standing Order No.69 which none of you has the business to argue with. Standing Order No. 69 says:- "A Member is responsible for every allegation of fact that he makes and may be called upon to substantiate." Now, he was called upon to substantiate; I ordered his substantiation. What are you arguing about? Mr. Minister, will you now answer the Question?

**Mr. Sambu:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Yes, you have named the hon. Member and he has been thrown out for three days. If this House, and you are presiding over it is for the welfare of society and the just government of men who also include women and everybody, for those of us who come from tea growing areas, we are hurt. This is an absolute cover-up!

**Hon. Members.** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir!

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! I think there is something basically wrong which I do not understand. There is something that I do not understand out of all this. I am getting confused but Mr. Sambu, may I tell you one thing. That writing there on that door, first of all excludes emotions here. It calls upon reason. Number two, it excludes Members from making wild, unsubstantiated allegations. That does not lead to just government of men and women. Number three, it does not mean that this House must disobey its rules and the Chair. Those ones who are trying to impose their unreasonable will upon the Standing Orders of this House, are the ones who are going against what you are saying. So, I have said that this Question must be dealt with today. I will extend the time to 7 o'clock under the relevant Standing Order or to such a time as it is necessary, to dispose of this question because it does appear that a section of Members wanted to take this opportunity to stop me from having this Question dealt with. Will you proceed now?

**Hon. Members:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir!

**Mr. Speaker:** No. It is overruled. Mr. Mudavadi, answer the Question.

**The Minister for Agriculture** (Mr. Mudavadi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to reply.

(a) I am aware that for the last ten years, the Kenya Tea Development Authority (KTDA) has been buying imported tea sacks for packing tea.

(b) It is true that in the past, the tender price for paper sacks has ranged between Kshs200 and Kshs220 per sack and indeed, there has been a major differential between what other tea producers have been buying their sacks for and that which KTDA has been buying its sacks at.

(c) I am also aware that KTDA had issued a tender currently for three million bags whose specifications demand imported paper; that is wet strength and extensible paper, whose price will be higher than that of local, natural and extensible sacks.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, in view of "a", "b" and "c" and taking into account that we want, as much as possible, to make sure that the farmers of this country shall benefit from proper and competitive tendering processes, the Ministry has advised the KTDA to cancel the tender and at the same time, to re-advertise for competitive bidding of the tea sacks.

**Mr. Kombo:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, arising from that answer which I appreciate and especially the last part, my concern is also to ensure that we use local material manufactured by local industries like PanAfrican Paper Mills. Could I ask the Minister to ensure that as they re-tender, that they do not insist on conditions which keep away Pan African Paper Mills from being used?

**Mr. Mudavadi:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, we have made it clear. I have made it clear and we are going to make

it clear again to the Board of the KTDA that, specifications that are drawn up for any tender must be specifications that, first of all, ensure that the quality of our tea is maintained.

Secondly, we have also told them that the specifications should not be tailored to favour imported products. It should give equal opportunity to both local manufacturers and also other competitors.

**Mr. Sambu:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, yesterday, hon. Karauri stated that the price had dropped, by the same manufacturer, from Kshs220 to Kshs106 and, plus VAT, it came to Kshs136. It shows that the company had been conning them and the KTDA directors had also been conning our farmers of between Kshs220 and Kshs136; that is almost Kshs80, for the last six years. What hon. Osundwa wanted to do here was to give evidence as to why prices when we questioned here, dropped from Kshs220 to Kshs136. There is proof that there has been, all along, collusion to steal from the Kenyan tea farmers. Let this House not be used a tool of cover-up and stealing from our own farmers.

**The Assistant Minister for Agriculture** (Mr. Karauri): Mr. Speaker, Sir, hon. Sambu has misquoted me. Yesterday, I did not say that it is the same manufacturer. I said that the tender has now been given to a local manufacturer. The previous one was a different one. He is saying that he is the same person. That is not true.

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Angwenyi is next.

*(Mr. Angwenyi moved to the microphone)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Angwenyi, you are an Assistant Minister. I am sorry you stood and so, you are not on a point of order. Mr. Matu Wamae.

**Mr. Wamae:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am grateful to the hon. Minister for Agriculture for coming out clearly to say that he has recommended that this tender be cancelled. We would like the hon. Minister to assure this House and tea farmers in the whole country, that the tea bags which will be bought by KTDA will not exceed Kshs80 per bag as bought by other manufacturers in Kenya, because anything more than that will be stealing from the farmers?

**Mr. Mudavadi:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have said that the tender should be re-advertised. Let people bid competitively and let the best price and quality be met. I will be misleading the House if I say that I can give a price now.

**Mr. Imanyara:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, now that the Minister has told us that he has given advice, what assurances do we have that this advice is going to be followed and what steps or disciplinary action is he going to take against this Board that was going to fraudulently abstain from farmers millions of shillings, had this Question not been brought into this House?

**Mr. Mudavadi:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the tenders shall be re-advertised and that will be the best evidence to show that, the advice has been taken by the KTDA.

As to the other issue, I want to state here very categorically that, we are dealing with a situation where the perception has been that there was something improper with this particular tender that has generated controversy. Let the investigations go through and if, indeed, there is evidence to show that somebody was involved in some irregular transactions, then that matter will be dealt with separately.

**Mr. Wamalwa:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would really like to thank the Leader of Government Business for the thoughtful answer he has given, and for taking cognisance of Members' feelings. But as the Leader of Government Business, could he assure this House that the standard set by the directive he has given with regard to the importation of gunny bags for the Kenya Tea Development Authority (KTDA) will apply in all sectors of the Government, so that we do not save in the KTDA and get conned in other sectors?

**Mr. Mudavadi** (Mr. Mudavadi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I think what we are trying to deal with here is that--- For instance, if you look at the history of this issue, you will see that for the last 10 years, there has been a particular supplier. Now, some of the issues that have led to this scenario are legal aspects under the patent laws which an individual or organisations can use to block other competitors. We are saying that we want a situation where there will be proper competitive bidding, and where we do not have any manufactures being locked out simply because of patent laws. So, I am putting it on record that we want specifications that give equal opportunity to all irrespective of whether they are in the tea sector or any other sector.

**Dr. Ochuodho:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. Standing Order Nos. 88 and 89, which were used to name hon. Osundwa---

**Mr. Speaker:** Dr. Ochuodho, we are still on the Question.

**Mr. Shidiye:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Shidiye, you have no tea at all in Lagdera.

*(Loud consultation)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, hon. Members!

**Mr. Shaaban:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Yes, Mr. Shaaban.

**Mr. Shaaban:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, my point of order regards your ruling. I understand that when a Question comes to this House, it becomes the property of the House. Therefore, are you in order to say that hon. Shidiye should not ask a supplementary Question?

*(Laughter)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Yes, indeed, I am in order. It is true that the Question is the property of the House. But while recognising hon. Members, the Speaker has to take into account special interest, especially of those hon. Members who are likely to be much more affected by the matter at hand. To my knowledge, I do not think there is any tea in Lagdera. Mr. Anyona, proceed!

**Mr. Anyona:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is a very important Question. I think two different issues are kind of crossing each other here. One is that of orderly procedure in the House, and the other one is the interest that the Question bears.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I will come to that later, but one of the problems the farmers have is that---

**Mr. Speaker:** What is the question?

**Mr. Anyona:** I am coming to the question, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Please, do so because I have already given this Question too much time.

**Mr. Anyona:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, for every bag of tea, farmers lose two kilograms, I do not know to whom. Tea farmers want bags that are weightless so that no weight of their tea is deducted because of the weight of the bags. Since the KTDA wants to exploit the farmers, it orders for bags that weight three or four kilograms from the weight of tea. In fact, it is in contravention of the law to deduct two kilograms, or one and half a kilogram. The law allows for the deduction of one kilogramme. What will Minister do to ensure that from now onwards, the farmers' money will not be deducted on account of the weight of the bags?

**Mr. Mudavadi:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to seek some clarification on that particular question. This is because, really, bags cost money. Therefore, there has to be an element of cost for the bags. So, I would like to get some advice from the hon. Anyona on this particular matter so that I can investigate it further. I did not quite get his point.

*(Several hon. Members stood up in their places)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! That is the end of that Question.

## POINT OF ORDER

### SENSATIONAL REPORTING BY NEWSPAPERS

**The Minister for Finance** (Mr. Nyachae): On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I stand here to make one request specifically on the matter which was deliberated on before this Question was answered.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, if one considers the source of the information, the person who raised the Question, the person who made the allegation, and how that allegation was blown up in the *East African Standard* and the *Kenya Times* newspapers, one will realise that there is a scheme aimed at a particular individual, which will eventually harm this country.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am involved in negotiations for this country. The information that went out of this country through the internet yesterday is meant to stall these negotiations. Therefore, I would like to request this House to compel the *East African Standard* and the *Kenya Times* newspapers to give this matter, as deliberated today, prominence. The newspapers should be compelled to publish the matter on the front pages. This is not a matter for this House. It is a problem from this House.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, schemes like this one should not be allowed to interfere with the interests of the country. The schemers have tried to hit me below the belt. They have brought issues here, some of which are of a tribal nature. We would like the House to establish who brought the Question, where it was taken from, where all

those people come from, and who took it to the *East African Standard* and the *Kenya Times* newspapers. We would like the truth published as well, as it came out here today.

Mr. Speaker Sir, the Standing Orders require that if certain allegations are published by the Press and later on discussed in this House, the Press should give the issue the same prominence as in the previous time.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

*(Loud consultations)*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, hon. Members! Since yesterday, this Question has been very unlucky, if I may use that term. Since yesterday, this House has not been at peace with itself, with its Members, or with the world at large, just because of one Question. We have not had any other Question that has brought so much controversy, since we opened this Session, like this one. I am shocked and very surprised to see that certain hon. Members would want to even control the Chair and overrule it. Now, the only thing I can say to this House and in response to what hon. Nyachae has said, is as follows.

Just to reiterate what I said yesterday, this House owes it to itself, the Kenyan nation now and in the future, to uphold itself with due decorum and dignity. All issues must be faced purely on national basis, without malice or any other consideration. Thirdly, I would like to appeal to you hon. Members that, if you persist in violating the business of this House like this, by constantly refusing to take orders from the Chair and comply with the rules of debate and decorum, I am telling you, hon. Members, you will go down in history as the Eighth Parliament that completely ruined the dignity and respect of the Kenya National Assembly. May I plead with you from the bottom of my heart: Please, keep the dignity and respect of Parliament intact.

As for the report in the Press, I can make one or two observations; that Mr. Nyachae is right. The *East African Standard* has the headline: "Nyachae's Wife Named in Scandal" and apparently quoting what transpired here in the House yesterday. Honestly, I do not know who wrote the story. But one thing I can say is that, if I was the writer of a story of that magnitude, and a Member has made an allegation from the Floor of this House and apparently he has refused to substantiate when given a chance, I would certainly have got the details. I would have done a little research to find out who, for example, had tendered for this work and whether the wife of the Minister was among those who tendered. I think, to just pick the story from the Floor, flash it on front page in very big letters without checking anything at all, to say the least, is not fair. I do not want to say it is malicious, but I can say, maybe it is laziness.

But I would like to tell the Press; you need Parliament and Parliament needs you. We all need each other to serve the Kenyan people. Please, the Press, as I have pleaded with hon. Members here, I also plead with you not to destroy Parliament. I think you owe it to the Kenyan nation not to destroy the Kenya National Assembly. I think that is the least I can say, hon. Members. I have nothing to say. I am very sad about this matter because I do not want to preside over this House when it is systematically being demolished by Members and strangers.

**Dr. Kituyi:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir. I have no intention of saying anything on a matter that you have already announced will be dealt with within three days. In fact, your last ruling should have waited for three days.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I care very much about the dignity of this National Assembly and I am very glad to add to what you have just said; that we have a collective responsibility to retain the honour, integrity and dignity of this House. I feel pained when a Member of Parliament makes unsubstantiated allegation against a senior member of the Government. It pains me. I am also interested that it be true, otherwise, appropriate action should be taken. I share that with you. But what concerns me is the conduct of the Chair this afternoon. Mr. Speaker, you are the custodian of the rules of this House and you are our first servant. Your honour is radiation of the respect we give you, the onus is on you to earn our respect and---

**Mr. Speaker:** Are you discussing the Chair?

**Dr. Kituyi:** I am not discussing the Chair, Mr. Speaker, Sir. But the Chair cannot anticipate what we want to raise under a point of order as malicious or attempts to filibuster on a matter that is so important for some of us. I care that this matter be sorted out. But I have been making allegations about individuals in this House and I have been asked to substantiate; I am always asked to substantiate after Question Time. When the Chair veers from the practice and seeks a substantiation in the middle of answering a Question, it is the duty of Members to say, "You are making it difficult for us to anticipate when we will substantiate in the future." It is only fair that you respect that it is good faith that drives our desires to raise points on such matters.

Thank you.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order, Dr. Kituyi! I think you owe it to the Chair, first of all, to listen. Secondly, I wish you were sitting there when Members deliberately, in my view, want to stop a certain issue from being raised.

It is my duty to make sure that it is. In any case, this is not a matter that is new. In the middle of this same Question yesterday, I ordered that Mr. Osundwa substantiates what he did allege. I read the HANSARD to the House. If Members choose not to listen to what I am saying; there is really very little I can do. But one thing I am asking all of you is, if every Member sat there in an orderly fashion and obeyed the rules, I am sure even the confusion that comes out of this turmoil would not arise. Help me to keep your House, this is your House. I am your servant and if all of you, 220 Members, want to destroy this House, who am I to prevent that? I am only one and I have even no vote. The only thing I have is your bestowing upon me Order. Next order.

**Mr. Kombo:** On a point of order, Mr. Speaker, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order! Order! Yes, indeed, I have to be a little flexible because I did also notice what Mr. Nyachae said in his response. He did allege that the hon. Kombo, in bringing his Question, was motivated by things other than ordinary course of business.

**Mr. Kombo:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Sir. When I brought the Question, it was in good faith and I declared that my interest was the local paper manufacturing factory which is in my constituency. I had no other motive. So, what the hon. Nyachae has said this afternoon that, "Looking at the person who brought the Question and looking at where the allegation came from" has some tribal connotations. I would like him to substantiate because he is imputing improper motives on me as a Member of this House.

*(Applause)*

**The Minister for Finance** (Mr. Nyachae): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I think I have to be very frank here. The problem begins right inside the KTDA. The Company Secretary is a Mluhya---

**Hon. Members:** No! No!

**The Minister for Finance** (Mr. Nyachae): Niacheni niseme! That man wants the job of the Managing Director. From there, they discussed and said, Mr. Karanja cannot go because it is alleged that he is a brother-in-law of Mr. Nyachae. "Therefore, Mr. Nyachae will defend him, so, we must hit at Mr. Nyachae through his wife who is supposed to be a sister to Mr. Karanja." I am not defending Mr. Karanja. I repeat, if my wife is a sister or a cousin to Mr. Karanja, then, every Kikuyu is a cousin to my wife.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, Members! Order, all of you! With all those many remarks, let us have the next Order, and the sitting will be extended by another thirty minutes.

**Mr. Kombo:** What about the writer with the *Kenya Times* Mr. Nyachae?

**Mr. Speaker:** Order Members! Next Order!

#### COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY

*(Order for Committee read being  
Twelfth Allotted Day)*

#### MOTION

THAT MR. SPEAKER DO NOW LEAVE THE CHAIR

Vote 16 - Ministry of Tourism

**The Minister for Tourism** (Mr. Kosgey): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move that Mr. Speaker, do now leave the Chair.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, as hon. Members are aware, my Ministry is charged with the responsibility of development, promotion and marketing of tourism, as well as regulating and controlling hotels and other tourist enterprises. Over the years, tourism has continued to play an important role in the economic development of this country. Indeed, tourism has become one of the leading foreign exchange earners which inject huge sums of money into the national economy. In addition, tourism brings in revenue to the Exchequer through various taxes and levies besides providing employment to wananchi both in the formal and informal sectors. Indeed, for the information of the House, the tourism industry is anticipated to be the industry for the 21st Century superseding the automobile and oil industries which are currently the leaders. The World Tourism Organisation expects that by the year 2010, tourist arrivals will be 937 million worldwide from a figure of 448 million in 1997. Africa's share, currently at 23 million, is expected to be 36 million by the year 2010. Our job in the Ministry of Tourism is to

make sure that we get a fair share of that business. It is also worth noting that the tourism industry has a multiplier effect on the economy in that it stimulates growth in, among others, the agricultural production and processing industry as well as the transport and financial sectors, by creating demand for the various products and services in those sectors.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, hon. Members will recall that 1997 was a difficult year for the tourism industry. Visitors numbers fell following insecurity problems that hit parts of the country and the heavy rains that followed closely which wreaked considerable havoc on the already deteriorating infrastructure thus further compounding the problem. The uncertainty due to the then impending general elections did not help matters either, hence the difficult position in which the Kenyan tourism finds itself today. That notwithstanding, I wish to report to the House that following a detailed analysis of visitor embarkment and disembarkment cards, by the Central Bureau Statistics, it came to light that Kenya had actually hit the one million tourist mark way back in 1994 when we had 1,008,300 tourists. In 1995, the figure was 973,600, and 1,003,000 in 1996 and 1,000,600 in 1997 out of which 566,000 were from Europe and about 85,000 from America. The rest were from various parts of the world, including Africa. With over 2,000 hotels and lodges, we have the capacity to accommodate more visitors. In 1997, for example, the average bed occupancy capacity was only 51.6 per cent leaving an unutilized capacity of 48.4 per cent. Current bed occupancy rates are in the region of 35 to 43 per cent on average.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, every effort is being made to ensure that more visitors come to our destination. Presently, there are 13 charter flights to Mombasa, the heart of the tourist activities. Last year, we dropped to as low as two charter flights per week. We have moved up to 13 charter flights. There is some improvement. We need to cultivate a new image for Kenya in the generating market as well as promote and market the destination effectively. These objectives and strategies call for commensurate resources which I am asking the House to approve.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, in view of the urgency involved in revamping the tourism sector, increasing competition for tourists in the generating market and in line with the existing policy on tourism development, the Government has created the Kenya Tourist Board, an institution which will operate independently with a view to responding promptly and effectively to the challenges posed by the dynamic and sensitive modern tourism industry at the local, regional and international levels. Indeed, to further facilitate these activities, the Government has since exempted the Board from the provisions of the State Corporations Act in discharging this responsibility. It is important that the utilisation of available resources and the supporting infrastructure are carefully planned. In this regard, efforts are being made to ensure that the conflict between private gains and social goals of tourism development are minimised as we strive to conserve and preserve the natural resources, the environment and the country's beauty. This approach should have the country remain attractive and enhance foreign exchange revenue earnings from tourism. In short, that is sustainable development in the tourism sector. Consequently, my Ministry will continue to pursue policies which support and benefit the vulnerable groups in the society by way of promoting sustainable utilisation of the resources upon which our thriving tourism industry is based. My Ministry will, therefore, endeavour to support desired projects and programmes paying particular attention to policies outlined in Sessional Paper No. 1 of 1994, the Eighth National Development Plan and the Social Dimensions of Development Programmes.

We have formulated a tourism master plan in this House, to provide guidelines and the way forward to the tourism sector. Hon. Members will agree with me that achievement of this noble objective has been possible and will only continue to be possible in a state of peace, security and political stability. It is undoubtedly on account of the dynamics and wise leadership of our beloved President, that this enabling environment for growth has been put in place.

I wish, therefore, on my own behalf and that of the entire tourism industry pay tribute to the Head of State and wish him good health so that he can continue leading us to greater heights of prosperity.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, in order for my Ministry to undertake the projects that are aimed at enhancing our foreign exchange earnings in future, I am requesting this House to approve an expenditure of K£18,297,470 in the Recurrent Expenditure and K£11,382,110 in the Development Expenditure for the 1998/99 Financial Year. These expenditures will be as follows:-

Under the Recurrent Expenditure the funds will be spent on personnel, operational costs such as transport, operating expenses, travelling and accommodation, purchase of stores, equipment and advertising, publicity expenses. The total expenditure will be broken down as follows:-

Under Sub-Vote 160, General Administration and Planning, Head 530 - Headquarters Administration Services a sum of K£6,933,432 will be required. These funds will be spent mainly on salaries of the headquarters staff, running and maintenance of vehicles, travelling, accommodation expenses, purchase and maintenance of equipment, the official calendar and payment of outstanding telephone bills. A substantial amount will also be



spent on subvention to the Bomas of Kenya, grants to the Kenya Tourism Board and Kenya Utalii College. Also, to be paid under this Head is compensation in respect of deaths and injuries caused by wildlife. Although wildlife is under the Ministry of Natural Resources, we have pending bills which are due and which should be settled by my Ministry.

Under Sub-Vote 161 - Tourism Services, a sum of K£11,364,038 will be required and will be distributed as follows: Head 535 - Tourism Department Headquarters, K£1,271,816; Overseas Tourism Promotion, K£8,254,310; Licensing and Hotel Classification, K£186,923. They do generate revenue through licensing fees. So, there is a substantial amount of Appropriations-in-Aid under that Head. Tourism Promotion and Marketing will require K£1,272,102. Under Domestic Tourism, we maintain two offices in Mombasa and Malindi which require K£378,887.

The distribution of the provisions in overseas tourist offices is as follows:- We have nine overseas offices with a total staff of about 50 manning those offices. The York office will require K£1,124,950 mainly for rent and salaries; London office K£1,154,900; Frankfurt office, K£1,080,240; Stockholm office K£687,320; Paris office K£807,950; Los Angeles office, K£968,150; Zurich office K£1,618,300; Rome office K£253,100 and Johannesburg office K£469,400.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, tourism has continued to be an important economic activity for this country. The growth of the industry and increase of foreign exchange earnings have been made possible mainly by promotional campaigns undertaken by the Ministry in the tourism related markets overseas. The sector earned this country K£1,132,000,000 in foreign exchange in 1997. This marked a decrease of 11.6 per cent over receipts generated the previous year which stood at K£1,280,000,000. The positive picture that I have painted of a prosperous tourism industry should be no cause for complacency on our part. As it were, the industry is highly sensitive to adverse publicity. We should, therefore, work even harder to strengthen the industry for both sustainable development and for increased economic returns. At the same time, we must also be prepared to respond urgently, appropriately and effectively to the rapidly growing competition in the tourist related markets. Many developed and developing countries are spending huge amounts of money selling their tourist attractions, to lure as many visitors as possible. In this regard, every endeavour should be made to make sure that we continue to get our fair share of the cake in this otherwise, very sensitive and competitive industry. Every effort must be made to ensure that the industry continues to offer the best in terms of standards in hotels, lodges and national parks and quality in related services and infrastructure such as roads and other communication facilities. We shall strive not only to secure and expand traditional tourism markets overseas but also to make further in-roads in other potential markets in order to increase the number of tourist arrivals to the country. In this regard, my Ministry does maintain the nine tourist offices I have mentioned in the main tourist generating regions.

In addition to these offices, Kenyan Embassies and High Commissions abroad collaborate with my Ministry in marketing our tourist attractions in their areas of accreditation. I would like to take this opportunity to register our appreciation for the support extended by our Ambassadors and High Commissioners overseas. It is indeed, the intention of my Ministry to encourage and facilitate the opening of new tourist offices in places such as the Middle East, Canada, Japan and Australia.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, in order to succeed in the promotion and marketing of the country as planned, the Ministry of Tourism, in liaison with the newly established Kenya Tourist Board, will facilitate the production of appropriate materials in the form of destination brochures, leaflets, posters, film documentaries as well as the creation of a Kenya Website on the internet for promotion and marketing of our destinations.

On the other hand, the Hotels and Restaurants Authority, established by an Act of Parliament in 1972, has continued to play a key role in regulating the hotels and restaurants industry through the provision of licensing, inspection and classification of hotels and lodges. This is in recognition of the need to maintain high standards in our hotels and restaurants in order to compete effectively with other destinations. We will, therefore continue to pay more attention to the quality of facilities and services offered by the tourism industry. Similarly, domestic tourism is one of the sections of the industry which my Ministry continues to pay special attention to for two main reasons:-

First, quite apart from the enjoyment that Kenyans will derive from their own country's tourist attractions and facilities, domestic tourism serves as an important vehicle for the promotion and enhancement of better cultural understanding, appreciation and harmony among our people. Secondly, domestic tourism will help cushion off the adverse effects of slumps in international tourism, unemployment and underutilisation of our hotels, lodges and other related facilities.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, to enhance this awareness, my Ministry, in collaboration with the private sector, has been organising domestic tourism exhibitions for the last several years. I am happy to inform hon. Members that, as a result of this collaboration, significant progress has been made in the promotion of a travel culture among

our people with action being taken on the pricing policy to design specially discounted rates, affordable by our people. My Ministry also maintains two tourist offices in the Coast Province; one in Mombasa and the other in Malindi. It is the responsibility of these offices to sustain this holiday and travel culture, besides promoting, co-ordinating, licensing and investigating complaints arising within the tourism industry in the region. It is my Ministry's intention to open more tourist offices in other areas of the country in line with the District Focus for Rural Development.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, under the Development Vote - D16, a sum of K£11,382,110 is required. A total of six projects will be financed, out of which four will be Government of Kenya financed projects and two externally funded projects. The total estimated expenditure for Government projects will be K£382,110 while estimates from external receipts will be K£11 million.

The funds allocated under the Development Vote amounting to that figure will be distributed as follows:- Administration - K£1,382,110. Minor alteration and maintenance work at the Ministry's headquarters - K£15,000; Government grants to Kenya Tourism Board - K£1 million; and Modernisation of the Ministry's show stand; plans are under way to construct a permanent exhibition stand at Mombasa Provincial show ground at a cost of K£70,000 and to replace the existing structures.

A total of K£50,000 will be spent on payment of pending bills and on construction of tourist target roads.

This year the Ministry has made available a total of K£297,110 as a loan to the Catering Levy Trustees to finance expansion and rehabilitation of training facilities at Kenya Utalii College.

Under Subvote 151 - Tourism Services, a sum of K£10 million will be required. The funds under this Subvote will finance tourism development and promotion activities which include printing of promotional material, travel literature, lectures, as well as organising tourism exhibitions and fairs locally and abroad. In this financial year, we expect to participate in several major tourism exhibition, seminars and workshops to promote and market our destinations in Europe, USA, Canada, as well as the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS). These exhibitions and workshops are annual events which have proved to be very effective tools for promoting and marketing Kenya's tourism overseas.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, before I conclude my remarks, I wish to state that the tourism industry is very sensitive.

I wish to appeal to hon. Members, particularly where security is concerned, that tourists would like to visit a country which is safe and secure. Hon. Members can help and contribute by making sure that their areas are safe at all times and that security is uppermost in their minds whenever and wherever they are.

In conclusion, Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wish to assure hon. Members that I will do my best to ensure that the funds that I am requesting for will be utilised with a high degree of accountability and transparency, so as to ensure that the downward trend in foreign exchange earnings and revenue receipts accruing from the tourism sector, that was witnessed in the past year, is not only reversed but it is also improved. I wish to assure hon. Members that our efforts to build a tourism industry of international repute have not gone unnoticed elsewhere in the world. In 1994, International Tour Travel Agents voted Kenya as the best destination in Africa. This position was reasserted in 1995 when Kenya scooped the Top World Travel Award as the best destination in Africa, beating South Africa and Egypt to second and third positions respectively.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, we have a very beautiful country with ecological systems ranging from the beaches right up to the mountains with lodges and game parks. We really should be proud of our country. But we have to make sure that every part of the country is safe and secure. If we do so, tourists will come to this country.

With those few remarks, Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move.

**The Minister for Local Authorities** (Prof. Ongeru): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I stand here to second this Vote of the Ministry of Tourism for two reasons. First, tourism is one of our major areas where we are able to spin a lot of money to support various activities within the tourist industry and within the economy as a whole. Tourism contributes greatly towards the growth of our economy. It acts as a major catalyst to our economy in many areas. Secondly, tourism makes us to be part of the global village, where we are able to narrow the ethnic, cultural and international differences. It acts as a bond between nations and people. It is a better template on which we can interact with one another. It has far-reaching implications in terms of human contact.

*[Mr. Speaker left the Chair]*

*[The Temporary Deputy Speaker  
(Mr. Imanyara) took the Chair]*

Thirdly, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, even within the Kenyan context, tourism is very important.

For example, if one travels from one corner of the country to another, he can see the kind of cultural diversity that is so enormously displayed by different communities and which is pleasing and relaxing. In times of political tension, for example, one finds solace in our cultural heritage and diversity. If you go to my constituency for a Harambee, you will see how Kisii dancers display Kisii culture. All of a sudden, without any prompting, everybody joins in. This is because the message is: After all, we are one nation called Kenya. Therefore, tourism in this country plays that key role of ensuring that we are part and parcel of the international community.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, tourism creates goodwill when managed properly. In fact, it acts as the second ambassador of our country. It links Kenya with the rest of world.

Therefore, the budget, which has been presented by the hon. Minister, of a sum of K£18.3 million for Recurrent and a sum of K£11.2 million for Development, is, to say the least, not enough to compensate for the gains we derive from the tourism industry. I would suggest, for instance, that this Ministry should be allocated more money because it is a major foreign exchange earner and plays a major role in our economy.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, tourism is one of the sectors that bring in a lot of foreign exchange. This is one Ministry where a great deal of emphasis and effort should be put in order to attract both foreign and domestic tourists. One of our major problems that we have to tackle very expeditiously is the question of the infrastructure. For instance, my Ministry is collaborating with the Ministry of Tourism. We have swiftly moved in to restore the image of Mombasa. This is because early this year the tourist industry was in a total slump. The bed occupancy at the Coast Province was at its lowest ebb. Therefore, job redundancies were very high. Looking at it from this angle, it was necessary to invest more resources in the infrastructure so that we could cope up with the flow of tourists. I am happy to say in this House that, that effort alone has restored and increased the number of tourists booked in our hotels.

One of the major aspects that we should look at is to welcome foreign tourists to visit this nation. We must also simultaneously promote domestic tourism. Spain, a country which has a population of about 60 million people, is able to attract tourists to the tune of 55 million, both domestic and foreign. The same case applies to Portugal, Egypt and the United Kingdom. When you compare the kind of tourist attraction sites that tourists visit in those countries with the ones in our country, you will see that theirs are far much simpler than the type of attraction sites we have here. Kenya, as a tourist destination has a variety of attractions. It has the flora, fauna, beaches and coral features which are a major attraction to the tourists. The culture in our respective areas is also a major area of attraction. We would like to invest more money in promoting these areas that are likely to promote both foreign and domestic tourism.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I cannot downplay the effect that the tourism industry has on the creation of employment opportunities for our people. Right now we have a lot of people on the streets who are not employed. I am glad that we have the Kenya Utalii College which trains the best manpower in the hotel industry. I have travelled widely in my previous assignment and know that our graduates are quite a clear testimony that the training content--- I would like to see more money being allocated to this institution, so that we can produce enough manpower in the hotel industry in order to attract the best tourists. Sometimes, the bulk is not what we require: We are about the quality of the tourists who visit our country. We might get 100,000 tourists who will be equivalent to two million tourists visiting our country. Therefore, we must look at the type of tourists we want to attract to this nation now.

We all know that poverty has hit this nation hard. We also know that 47 percent of Kenya's population lives below the poverty line. One sure way of alleviating it is by attracting more tourists into our country in order to create job opportunities. There are peripheral spin-offs which come along with tourism. The tea industry and transport sectors thrive best when the tourism is flourishing. The security element must be taken care of.

Sometimes, I get very much alarmed when some of our own hon. Members talk recklessly without due regard to matters of this nation that would only require a fore thought to stop the reckless utterance. One word through the internet will create havoc internationally. The Minister has shown us why we must be very careful in our utterances. If one wants to please people by raising sensational issues which have no content or facts, he is obviously creating a state of insecurity in the country. If we are all responsible Kenyans and want the tourism industry to thrive, then we must also do what is required of us. We should take care of anti-social elements that may play havoc with this industry.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I wish I had more time to contribute to this Motion. I would like to say that with this approach in the tourist industry, we are in the right direction.

I beg to second this Motion.

*(Question proposed)*

**Mr. Mwakiringo:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to this important Vote of the Ministry of Tourism. As much as I agree with the Minister that the tourism industry will be one of the best industries in the next millennium, I would just wish to pinpoint some shortfalls, and give credit where it is due. For the tourist industry to flourish, there must be four important elements that should be taken into account.

First is security, which the Ministry has already put in place. We are happy that the Ministry has already established a Tourist Police Unit in Mombasa. Though they are there, I would like to assure him that these policemen are yet to be fully trained. Their public relations is not good. They still have the ordinary policeman kind of mentality. As a result, they cannot approach the tourists and all those who operate along the beaches properly. We need more of these policemen to be deployed there because the number which is currently there is too small. Therefore, they cannot match the wide beach along the Coast. We need many of them but, as I said earlier, they should practise good public relations.

The Tourist Police Unit should be autonomous for it to be effective. If it falls under the orders of the Commissioner of Police, then their mode of operation will be the same as it used to be before and we will never attract tourists to visit this country.

For us to sustain the tourism industry, we must also establish the root cause of insecurity in this country. The Judicial Commission of Inquiry into Clashes is currently investigating the clashes that rocked the country in the past. The clashes which took place in Mombasa could have been caused by the refusal by hotel owners to employ the local people. They did not also give tenders to the local people to supply vegetables, food and beverage items. One does not expect even a sweeper or a driver to come from outside where the hotel is situated.

Roads leading to these Parks and outside are not in good condition. They are very poor. Currently there is no way you can even go to Maasai Mara unless you fly there. Not very many people can afford to do that, even the locals from this area. The infrastructure must be maintained and upgraded. So, we need more funding on that one so that we can have local tourism and foreign tourists coming in where they can easily move in and out of the parks comfortably without feeling that there is poor infrastructure and they are not sure of reaching their destination.

While talking of infrastructure and especially roads, this is where other countries are beating us because even tour operators who have vehicles, find it very expensive to change car vehicles after every two years because of the maintenance. That is why most of them would opt to go to South Africa and other places like Zimbabwe where the infrastructure is very good. What I am saying is that it is also becoming too expensive for the tour operators who have vehicles to maintain them where they are forced to change the vehicles after every two years. While on that line I would not mind the Ministry giving some small funds to Mwatate-Taveta Road which links Kenya to Tanzania because when we have tourists from Tanzania, it is easy for them to cross through Taveta Lake Jipe, Lake Chala and Tsavo East and West National Parks from Taita other than coming through Namanga and other areas. So, more money should be used on that road, to do upgrading where the roads become impassable when rains come.

Telephone service is another item which need to be looked into because we have very poor telephone services in most parts of this country and especially in Tsavo East and Tsavo West where most of the time the telephones are out of order and, therefore, communication becomes very poor. Electricity is another area which needs to be looked into very seriously. There should be a continuous flow of electricity so that we do not interrupt any services being rendered by the hotel in those national parks and other tourism related industries. Another area I would want to touch on is on Lake Victoria which has not been tapped up to now. We used to have a lot of boats sailing to Mwanza in Tanzania and to Uganda but this has since ceased and it has now become a place where you only see hyacinth and nothing more. Since people used to move from one place to another within the waters of East Africa, but currently it is not happening, we would urge the Ministry to look into that one so that once the water hyacinth is removed then the boat services can be resumed so that school children, local tourists and even the international tourists can come and use the boats for tourism purposes.

I would want to touch on the role of the media. We get negative publicity from the media. It is not their own fault but the fault of the Ministries and the Government because they are not open in giving information when they are required to and, therefore, the grapevine becomes active. If we had enough public relations officers in that Ministry who deal with whatever comes up and give the information to the media, I do not think this negative publicity would happen in this country any more. As much as the Government does the concealing of the information, I would also personally urge and appeal to the media to report accurately. All people are equal not only in Kenya, but even in the whole world. There is no difference between a European and an African when they are killed somewhere. Report it. Do not highlight that there is insecurity and people are being killed because one is a European and yet it is only one European and yet when ten lives of Kenyan Africans are lost, none of it is

reported in the media. This country is for you. Even the media has a role. We need you and you need us but at least there must be correct and accurate reporting. You will be judged when you go to heaven on what role you played in promoting tourism in this country where you live and what you expect the Government to do for you.

On tourism promotion, while appreciating the establishment of the KTB, a lot of promotion needs to be done both internationally and locally. We would urge the Ministry to give more money to KTB. I do not think Kshs1 million would be enough for the KTB to do the promotion, both internationally and locally. It should be autonomous. I am sure that has already been put in place where it can also borrow money. But it should also not rely fully on donor money. It should also be funded from the Government. The same KTB should also be allowed to implement Government policies on licensing and of course it should also be incorporated when it comes to grading of these hotels in conjunction with Hotels and Tourist Board. One thing I would also like to caution the KTB on is not to rely on consultancy. We should recruit our own local people who have the patriotism of this country at heart. We need our own people to be there to master the job for future investment and the expansion of the tourism industry. This country has a variety of viable attractions in wildlife, beaches and much more which have not been exploited; like mountain climbing and cultural tourism. These have still not been explored. As I said, a place like Karachuonyo has six hot springs but these have not as yet been tapped for tourism attraction along the Western Kenya side.

On the introduction of visas to British citizens, I think this has had a negative signal to suggest that tourists are not welcome in this country. If this is reversed, I think the number of tourists from Britain would increase. So, I think the Ministry will have to take that one into consideration so that we can increase the number of tourists from Britain.

On KWS, I know it is not in your Ministry but I think there is that collective responsibility. It should not arbitrarily increase park entrance fees as this will discourage tourists. This is happening and I think this is why we do not have most of the locals going into the national parks though the entrance fees are lower. It should not increase arbitrarily. I think we should lower them if we have to compete and we still have to come to number two position in tourism marketing in Africa. I know it is difficult for us to reach number one, but we can come to number two if there is collective responsibility. The KWS should come out with a clear policy on both revenue sharing and community wildlife programmes. This has always been a problem between the KWS and the community. They do not know what revenue sharing and community wildlife sharing programmes are all about. I hope the Ministry has got a policy that can be implemented. When this is achieved, it will actually act as an incentive to those communities who live around the parks and they will be part and parcel of conserving the wildlife and the animals in the parks.

Finally, the hotels and the national parks and the KWS should endeavour to employ the locals who are neighbouring the national parks so that we do not cause animosity and then the community becomes an enemy of the parks in terms of poaching. Wildlife and tourism go hand in hand with environmental conservation. We have forests which are being destroyed and these are the places where we find butterflies and birds which most of the tourists come here to see. Specifically, if they want to see birds and butterflies, they have to go to the forests. But we can see now the massive destruction of the forests in this country is going to affect the tourism industry because if there are those who are interested in butterflies and birds, they will definitely not come because they know the forests are not there; where birds are supposed to inhabit.

Finally, I would like to plead with the Minister that the intake at the Kenya Utalii College is not proper. The enrolment, in my humble submission, is done on a quota basis. If a Maasai wants to be a cook or a waiter, let him have a chance to be enrolled there. But as of now, most of those who are there are from high potential areas.

With those few remarks, I beg to support the Motion.

**The Assistant Minister for Water Resources** (Mr. Chanzu): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I stand here to support the Vote of the Ministry of Tourism. I would like to take the first opportunity to congratulate the Minister for the manner in which he has presented the Vote. I also wish to congratulate the Minister and the Ministry's staff for the good job that they are doing. This is because this year, we have not had as much as we have been having, in terms of negative publicity and operations. I think it must be because of the good work of the Minister, the PS, the staff, and other related institutions.

Tourism is a key sector in our economy, and it is a major income earner. It is a very delicate sector which we must be very careful when handling it. I think it goes with the publicity. I think we should be careful about the publicity that we make about this sector, locally and internationally. This being a developing country, everybody involved in what is going on must try as much as possible to be patriotic, in order for us to build a strong foundation on which we can develop. So, publicity locally must be done carefully. We must have well trained people to man our affairs in the tourism sector. This goes for the college that we have, that is the Kenya Utalii College. I think we need to improve on it. Although it is expensive, I would like to make a suggestion

that we should try to decentralise. I think the more we move things closer to the people, the easier they are going to appreciate. It is very expensive to get the trainees who come all over the place, just to come and train in one place. I think it could be decentralised and if an allowance could be made for that.

We have got the tourist offices abroad, which I think should be strengthened so that they can spread positively, about our country outside, so that we can attract more tourists and hence, more revenue from the sector.

We have had problems with the infrastructure and security. We have at times had to enjoy donor funding. I think with the meagre resources from the Government, we need to make appeals for international financing so that we can improve on the infrastructure and security. In this connection, I wish to thank the effort made by His Excellency the President when he met with the World Bank people early this year. Although the money that they are giving us is meant for the *El Nino* Emergency Programme, but the rains caused a lot of damage to our infrastructure. I think it is encouraging that we are getting assistance through that programme. What we should do is to manage the funds properly, efficiently and effectively so that we can get good results out of whatever money we are getting from the donors in that sector.

Our hotels have been wanting in certain aspects. This should also be improved on so that the visitors who come can get comparable accommodation that they get in other international hotels outside the country. On game parks and reserves, I think if we have got infrastructure and security well taken care of and well improved, game parks and reserves will also improve. The visitors who will be coming and going will have no fear.

There is the aspect of privatisation, which I think, in my view, is a good ideal. This is because some of these aspects, like the hotel industry, are made more competitive when they are privatised. When we sell Government equity in some of the hotel industry, we make them more competitive internationally.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the expansion of the tourism business to take care of the Western Circuit to reap maximum benefits from the Eldoret International Airport is worthwhile. The Airport would benefit if we could expand and intensify the Western Circuit. We have the Mt. Elgon Park and, in my Constituency, we have got the Maragoli Hills. If we intensified our wildlife conservation and re-afforestation, it would be of great benefit and income-earning to this country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we have got great problems in the Coastal area. I would like to take this opportunity to say that there have been problems of water, which I think, made it very difficult for the operations at the Coast. But the Ministry of Water Resources, under the able leadership of hon. Ng'eny, has been able to make a lot of repairs on the water supply system in the Coast Province. This is still going on and it is going to encourage more visitors to come.

Lastly, just as a matter of coordination, there must be effective coordination among the key sectors in this business for it to succeed in this country, under the Ministry of Tourism. We have got the Ministry of Tourism itself at the centre, the Ministry of Local Authorities, Public Works and Housing, Water Resources, Energy and other sectors which are involved in coordination so that we can offer services efficiently and successfully.

With those few remarks, I beg to support.

**Dr. Kituyi:** Thank you very much, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me a chance to say a few things also about the Vote of the Ministry of Tourism. When I looked at the Estimates for the Ministry of Tourism, one of the first concerns I got was the lopsidedness in the allocation of resources in favour of maintaining tourist offices in Europe and America. Out of about K£17 million of the Recurrent Expenditure, more than K£7 million is being requested for the offices in Zurich, Tokyo, Stockholm, London, Frankfurt, Los Angeles and New York.

This is a very ridiculous phenomenon because it is a very traditional way of thinking about how to strengthen tourism in this country. With the growing sophistication of information management and dissemination and the greater integration of the world into a common village, the most important promotion work of a tourist destination is done in the country; the destination country for the tourist.

There is very limited demonstrable returns on investment put in for some people to remain in offices in Europe and America; to keep telling Europeans and Americans that Kenya is a good place to go and to continue showing the same tired old pictures of lions and Maasais.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, if the Kenya Tourist Development Board developed a website and disseminated on that website, internationally, information about eco-tourism, integration of communities concerns in the tourism industry, the possibilities that comes from a fresh start and initiatives in the tourist industry, there would be much more returns from fresh tourists coming to this country than the amount that comes from retaining and giving salaries and paying rents for people ostensibly promoting tourism in New York and Los Angeles.

I think it is about time we started re-thinking the direction of the growth of tourism in this country. The traditional mode of the expansion of the tourist industry in this country has reached saturation level.

We have to start desegregating between areas where quantities of visitors have substantial returns from

areas where qualitative tourism has to be emphasised. For example, if we talk about the expansion of the tourism interests on the Southern Coast of Kenya, massive package tourism can still be sustainable in areas of Msambweni up to Lunga Lungu; so long as we can contain population and mining of marine resources of the beach.

We have reached the point of saturation in low-quality tourism in Maasai Mara. The proliferation of cheap lodges on the fringes of Maasai Mara and the over-concentration of mini buses in the Maasai Mara, is so causing a destruction of the natural eco-system for the survival of the game in the Maasai Mara, that the returns are not worth that permission for cheap tourists to come to Maasai Mara. If a Mzungu just wants to see a lion and does not have money to stay in a high-taxed facility, let him go to the zoo in Nairobi and see the lions.

There is not much utility to this country to blindly allow for cheap tourism expansion into the Amboseli and the Maasai Mara. These are two over-burdened destinations right now in this country.

Many times we have been thinking of ourselves with our tourism almost like the brothel of Europe. We want to tell them what is exciting and exotic and unspoilt virgins in our country, "come and enjoy it". That direction of thinking has perverted promotion of tourism to be equated to encouraging Europeans that we are a good place to come to. Countering misfortunes happening at home by propaganda that those who have reported are just evil; it is not that bad in our country.

The best way to encourage tourism is like the best way to encourage foreign investments. Once the environment is right for those in the country, that is the first step towards making it right for those outside the country.

If security is made good for Kenyans, that is the best way to guarantee security for tourists. We cannot start parcelling this country, franchise out violence to locals in local neighbourhoods, but we over-concentrate security regulations in areas where White tourists are coming. Even those tourists will think that there is something the matter with us. If we go to their country, they give priority to their own. When they come to our country, we are sacrificing the security of our people by mobilising most of the security to protect tourists. They will think there is something the matter with our priorities.

It is about time that the concerns of security for tourists has to remain streamered with concerns of security for Kenyans. The primary responsibility of the State in Kenya about security is the security of Kenyans, but not security for tourists. It is sad and regrettable that when a tourist gets shot in a park in this country, it makes news; not abroad, but here in Kenya. It is news in the newspapers that a tourist has been killed.

When a Kenyan gets killed, we might hear of it, if a policeman has been suspected to be involved and has been arrested and charged in a court of law. Otherwise, it is not newsworthy. Or a policeman has been transferred after being involved and an inquest is going to be carried out.

We are not leaders of destinations for tourists, but we are leaders of a country called Kenya. Our primary responsibility is the people of Kenya. In paying attention to the interests of Kenyans, we secondarily create an enabling environment for visits to our country by those tourists.

Secondly and related, the most important potential source of tourists for a tourist destination in this country, is Kenya. There is just not sufficient attention being paid to cultivate domestic tourism in this country.

One of the areas which can be very productive instead of spending the amount of money we are spending in European and American destinations - which by reading one page of negative news in the *Newsweek Magazine*, erodes all the good news you have created through expensive advertisements and officers stationed there - if we should spend half of that money for the Ministry of Tourism to offer subsidised trips for students in key schools to visit destinations in this country--- The amount of domestic pressure it causes to their parents; that the other family members also want to visit those places, is immense.

From my personal experience, half a year ago, my son went biking to the Mzima Springs and on an escort biking safari to the "Shetan lover". On return, he mobilised three quarters of the family against my desires and my economics, that I must take all of them to see what he saw.

The Government did not involve itself in promoting that I should become a tourist to go to Mzima Springs and go to the Shetan Lover, but the fact that one son of mine had been there and was saying how much important it is that others have to go, it is a very effective way of marketing tourism in my domestic side. To me, this demonstrates the potential. The Ministry can just promote by taking to key places students, select groups in schools, visit some of these destinations and they domesticate the desire in their homesteads for more people to go to these places.

The main thing I have been emphasising is the need for us to look at domestic market, to abandon traditional thinking about how to enhance tourism and the need for us to abandon the defensiveness. If something has gone wrong our responsibility is not to write to the world that it did not go wrong, but our responsibility is how to deal with the cause of that thing going wrong, in such way, the chances of a similar catastrophe occurring are reduced.

Finally, I wish to say the following. That the potential of tourism around the East African region cannot be sufficiently maximised without proper circulating between the three countries of the region. The potential of maritime tourism around Lake Victoria, if managed properly - the relationship between Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania - and the sharing of costs and returns will be so immense, and it will do so much in expanding some of the fields of tourists destinations like the Western Circuit, my friend and colleague was mentioning. It surprises anybody that the Government has not paid sufficient attention to it. The duties that exist between Kenya and Tanzania about tourists staying in Kenya and entering into Tanzania and coming back are being lowered. I am glad the Kenyan Government has been pushing for the reduction of levies by the Tanzanian Government on Kenyan vehicles entering into Tanzania.

This is not sufficient. The Government should start integrating concern that Tanzania should not impose stiffer conditions for Kenyan vehicles entering Tanzania, than what Kenya imposes on Tanzanian vehicles entering Kenya as a way of further integrating the national eco-system of Serengeti and Maasai Mara; for example, and reducing the pressure on the resources of Maasai Mara which is a substantial benefit to both countries.

With those few remarks, I beg to support.

**Mr. Shidie:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to this Vote. Tourism is an industry that, if harnessed very well, will earn this country a lot of foreign exchange. Indeed, it is the goose that lays the golden eggs. But the way things are in this country, this industry is really facing a crisis at the moment. There are several things that need to be done in order to attract tourists into this country. If there is sufficient security, there is no doubt, we will make tourist to come to this country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, you will realise that insecurity in this country has become the order of the day. Many people are killed in this country. There are parts of this country which are really virgin for tourists; areas like the Western Circuit, the Northern Circuit where even the tourists would like to visit. Particularly Northern Kenya, where there are about 15 districts, like Turkana; Samburu; Somalis, Borans and all those areas. Those are areas which are really virgin in terms of tourism.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, when several people are killed in those areas, it naturally discourages tourists from visiting those areas. I am saying so because just yesterday, about 36 people were butchered mercilessly by bandits in Wajir. That does not augur well for this country. This is because when somebody reads Kenyan newspapers through the Internet that so many people were killed, naturally, the tourists will get scared and they will not come into this country.

Time has come for the Minister for Tourism to liaise with the Minister of State, Office of the President to make sure that the lives of these Kenyans are taken care of. That is the only way tourists will be encouraged to come into this country. If you do not take care of your country, then nobody will come to your country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we have to go back to the drawing board and assess where we went wrong. This is because today, people are mercilessly butchering one another in Northern Kenya. Bandits have taken over almost all the roads. Recently, in my own constituency, Lagdera, five people were killed and five others in Garissa because of some differences between clans. It is the same thing in Moyale and Wajir. Such killings really scare away tourists in this country. After all, our lives are more important, than the tourists we are talking about. For tourists to come to this country, we must ensure that this country becomes a secure place to visit.

We, leaders, in Northern Kenya have sat and discussed about the issue of insecurity. We have said that we should have homeguards. We want the Government to spend less money on security. We want to reach a level where there is self-governance, where, at least, people can take care of their security. This will reduce Government security bill and it will make people in those areas run their affairs very well. For instance, in Garissa, home guards were trained. Kenya Police Reservists were trained and to this day, those people have not been given firearms. This means that when you train somebody and you do not give him a firearm, then he has to look for one. This is because you have already given him a skill he never had before and he must practise that skill. I am saying so because the lives of Kenyans are much more important than tourism.

Besides, the other issue I would like to touch on is infrastructure. We have been saying time and again that the road between Mombasa and Nairobi which has been the lifeline for tourism in this country is in bad shape. We spend about 17 hours on that road, which is almost two days. That road is in a bad state. We sometimes claim that it is the *El-Nino* induced rains which caused all the damage to our roads. The *El-Nino* weather phenomenon buried what we had destroyed. That road was to be repaired about five or ten years ago and it was not repaired. We waited for big vehicles with heavy loads to pass through and all the weather conditions which are bad and it has really be destroyed. Time has come when those roads must be rehabilitated and contractors who are given the contract must be verified. This is because there are contractors who will repair a road and in less than one year, that road becomes just useless. We must think positively because tourism is the most competitive



industry in the world today. Those countries which advertise themselves are the ones who are reaping most from tourism.

Look at what is happening in Kenya today. We are still practising the old style; the traditional way of tourism, like white sunny beaches, game reserves and national parks. Those are now long gone. People are going for eco-tourism, environmental friendly tours and these are the packages that we need to sell. Those are the ones that are going to bring us more foreign exchange. Kenya has been a destination for most of these tourists from Europe. Today we are losing them to South Africa and Tanzania and other new destinations because their security is assured. These countries are more organised and more aggressive. We want the Minister to forge a policy where he becomes more aggressive. You do not require so many Kenyan officials based in Bonn, or in London to do that. We require people who are skilled, people who will run Kenya Tourist Board professionally and those who have entrepreneurial skills in the tourism industry.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, last year, KTDA removed some Hirola from Northern Kenya and it wanted to take them to somewhere else but those animals ended up in Europe. Those hirolas are rare antelopes and they are an endangered species and those ones can only survive and thrive very well in their home places. It was really an interference. If the Minister wants to improve tourism in those areas; like in the Northern Circuit, he must ensure that there is enough security and there is good infrastructure. Today, as I speak in this House, half of the year, Northern Kenya is not accessible. During elections we had a very difficult time. We did not have even airstrips, the roads are in a bad shape. You can imagine that there is no single tarmacked road in the whole of Northern Kenya, which is almost two-thirds of this country. We are talking about developing one area of the country while the other one is not developed. It is as if the left hand does not know the right hand is doing.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, there are three societies in this country, an opulent society, a rich society and a very poor society. If we are to develop the tourism industry, which is a service industry, education is a must. If those people are not educated and if the potential of tourism is not developed in that area, how are we going to compete with the rest of Kenya? I am posing this to the Minister because he knows these problems. We want to open up those areas. I am sure more tourists will come to those areas than to the Coastal Region. After all, there are many sunny beaches all over the country. Time has come for us to change the policy in this country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, Kenya, at the moment, has become a sex holiday destination. You will realise that most of the street girls are now turning into prostitutes. The white man comes from overseas, he might be HIV-positive, and he is never tested. He comes to Kenya and it looks like Kenya is almost becoming another Gambia, a sex holiday destination. This must be discouraged.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the other issue has to do with currency. Our currency is over-valued. In order to attract tourists we have to devalue it a bit. In order to attract more tourists we have to devalue it a bit. Once we devalue it, we are sure of attracting many tourists. Even students can afford it, people who are low income earners can afford it. It will be economical and the turnover will be higher. But if our currency is artificially raised, then naturally we are not going to make any sales. We are attracting less than one million tourists per year. That is a small number compared to Belgium and Germany where about 10 million tourists or even more are attracted. This country has got the potential, it is beautiful and it can be one of the best tourist destinations. It is the Minister and the Kenya Tourist Board that have to steer it. We want it to be dynamic.

I beg to support.

**Mr. Odoyo:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Sometime ago, tourism used to be the number one forex earner to this country. It still has the potential of being number one. However, when I look at the total Government recurrent resources that have been apportioned to the Ministry of Tourism, it is less than one per cent. This is a question of our priorities. This is an industry that can earn billions, but has less than one per cent of the Recurrent Expenditure of the Government. Is it because the Ministry is weak or they do not have good planners?

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, time is ripe for us to put our priorities right. This is because, where we earn money, that is, agriculture, tourism and the invisibles, like exports, we should put our money where we are earning revenue. The first question I would like to pose is why the Ministry of Tourism has less than one per cent of the Recurrent total Government expenditure. Be that as it may, if one looked at the recurrent budget of the Ministry, there are several anomalies. For example, the ratio between administration and tourism services is 40 to 60 percent. This is excessively large. A good ratio should be 20 per cent administration and 80 per cent services. The 20 to 80 per cent rule applies mostly in Government services in as much as it applies to the private sector. And, in as much as this is a Government Ministry that administers to the private sector more than the Government sector, they should obey and play by the rules of the normal business operations.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, one of the normal business operations is advertising. If you look at the budget for advertising in all the offices, it is less than five per cent of the total expenditure. Here we are

dealing with a consumer market based in Europe, where advertising plays a critical role in attracting business. This is a Ministry that considers advertising to be only valid at five per cent of their total expenditure. Time is ripe for us to ask the Minister whether the priority in terms of attracting tourists to this country is really based on strategic thinking or based on traditional budgeting, whereby, somebody simply looks at the budget in 1965 adds two, three or four per cent. Little thought is given to it. On the same token, if you look at the number of tourists who come to this country, we have people coming from Europe, Italy, a few from Australia, Japan and the Middle East. But if you look at the way the budget has been made, New York, London and Frankfurt have similar budgets while the number of tourists who come to Kenya from the United States of America together with the other offices is minimal compared with tourists who come to Kenya from Rome. Rome has less than 20 per cent of the budget of New York, whereas Rome, supplies us with more tourists than the U.S.A. Perhaps, we should ask ourselves why Rome which provides many tourists to Malindi and other areas, is not being targeted as a market. Less than 20 per cent of the budget that goes to London is apportioned to Rome. Whereas the potential that should be exploited from Rome is far much more. These imbalances continue throughout the budget.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, domestic tourism is three per cent of the international tourism. It has been relegated to a no-contest position. Whereas a few years back, faced with the problems which we are facing today, as a result of the political clashes at the Coast that happened during the election time, when very few international tourists are coming, when Kenyans are being laid off, if we had a strong domestic tourism, by this time, we would not be laying off people. My colleague, hon. Maitha, has been complaining that hotels are now empty, people are being laid off, my brothers at the Coast are being sent home---

**Mr. Maitha:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. I have never complained in this House that people are being laid off. Could the hon. Member making those allegations say when I complained about that?

**Mr. Odoyo:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I think it is a fact that hon. Maitha will not deny that people are being laid off at the Coast. Neither will he deny that tourists are no longer going to the Coast or that tourist hotels at the Coast are empty. But if he is going to say otherwise, I may take time to look for the particular remarks he made in the HANSARD.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, if I may proceed, the issue of ownership in the tourism industry is a big issue. Kenyans own very little of the tourism infrastructure, marketing and financing in this country. While we benefit a little bit, we might get \$100, but how much has not come to Kenya that we should have got? The question of transfer pricing, where the bulk of the money paid by the tourists is left overseas is an issue that must be addressed by this Ministry. At this point in time, as we are moving towards liberalization, the question of what we are going to call discrimination or bias towards Kenyans, so that Kenyans can be encouraged to set up hotels that can be used by tourists, should be addressed. At the moment, we are giving a lot of emphasis to non-Kenyans and we are not able to determine how much money we are not getting in Kenya.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, turning to the general tourism industry, we should not be complaining that we are getting bad publicity. This is because, indeed, bad publicity results from land clashes and the politically-motivated clashes are instigated by Kenyans. Therefore, we should not be complaining.

What we should be doing is damage control and the Ministry of Tourism is not very well placed to do damage-control. They have made no budget for advertising; their overseas representatives are just sitting in offices waiting for tourists; nobody is doing positive search for the tourists. We have got the money-guzzling offices in New York and San Francisco and Zurich but what they are doing is very questionable. I applaud the Government for setting up the Tourist Board which is going to take over these offices and the money that is being apportioned by the Government to these offices should increasingly be determined by the private sector.

The Ministry should increasingly reduce itself to a regulatory body and create an enabling environment, rather than a participant; and let the private sector carry the burden of the tourist industry in this country. The Government continues to assume the total burden of bringing tourists into this country. Increasingly, they should move away and let the private sector carry this burden, providing an enabling environment which at this moment is lacking because of the constant meddling with and harassment of hotel owners. We have got the Catering Levy Trustees, and all sorts of people marching in and denying Kenyans the right to conduct business in tourism. But if an investor comes from Europe and wants to set up a game lodge, he will be welcomed with: "Yes and yes and yes and more yes." But if one is a Kenyan and wants to set up a game lodge, he would be told: "No, no, no." We must ask: How many Kenyans have got game lodges? We have got over 100 game lodges in Kenya of which less than 10 per cent are owned by Kenyans. The time is right to ask: "Why is the Ministry doing what it should not be doing?" Why is it not encouraging Kenyans to do something?"

With those few remarks, I beg to support.

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Sunkuli):** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, it

is good to listen to the Members of this Eighth Parliament like hon. Odoyo who really happens to know a lot about tourism. I listened keenly also to Dr. Kituyi. The points that he made about the policy of the Ministry of Tourism having tourism offices abroad has an element of truth, because I think, in a way, we cannot over-emphasise the traditional ways of advertising when we know that the world has gone internet. But we cannot also rule out this simple fact; that we do need our people to market tourism and they must be stationed where the tourists are. They must be stationed abroad. So, it is not yet time to actually say: "Decamp and come home so that we use the internet." I think let us use the internet as a way of supplementing those people who are abroad. I think I still support that, that amount of the Budget does go, in fact, into funding our offices abroad. What in fact, I picked from hon. Odoyo which is the truth, is that the Minister must ask those people in the offices abroad to account for their presence there. I personally visited our tourist office in Los Angeles a few years ago, and I did not get the impression that the reason why we have tourists from Los Angeles is because of our tourist office there. I think that there must be a way in which the productivity of our people abroad must be assessed by the Ministry, so that we do not keep people there. It is also good for the Minister to realise that you cannot keep a person in Los Angeles to continue marketing tourism. Kenyans being what they are, they will start going to run some matatu, but unfortunately there are no matatus there. They will start going to the university there to study and so on, because eventually what people are thinking is about themselves. Let a person stay in Los Angeles for three years, do the marketing and then you transfer that person to Canada or Frankfurt and after serving nine useful years outside this country, I think that person deserves to come back home and spend their earnings here. I think it is not profitable to keep our people abroad for that long.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I have listened to an argument about saturation of tourists. I must declare my interest here; that coming from the constituency where Maasai Mara effectively falls, I do not wish to succumb to the story that there is saturation of tourists in Maasai Mara. What has happened is that the Ministry needs to liaise with the experts and plan Maasai Mara. This is because, once you go to the Mara, you do not get the impression that it has been planned for the future. We must have a place where the tourists use as roads. If you over-fly Maasai Mara today, when you look down, you find so many tiny roads all over, and those are not roads. Those are by-ways created by people who are chasing the big five. I think it is very important that a law be instituted in this House to stop the tour drivers and the tour guides from calling one another by radio to go to one particular point. This is because when you go to see the tourists there, you will find that all the Nissans have gone to one place because the drivers are telling each other that there is a lion here. I think there must be a way of stopping this because that is what is creating the impression that Maasai Mara is saturated. It is not, and neither is it true that we have put up new camps in Maasai Mara upto today. Along the Mara Triangle, which is on the Western side of Mara, there have been always six camps for the last 12 years. There has never been an additional camp at all. What is happening is that there is an increasing need for these camps and those of us who are involved in the management of the Mara have laid a policy that there shall be no more increase of camps within Maasai Mara. That will help in retaining the quality because the camps which are there today; a camp run by A&K, which is now run by a South African, the Serena, Musiara which is a local one, and so on, are quality hotels. Having had the advantage given by this House to travel to many destinations in this world, I must say that you cannot get in many countries the hotels as good as those in Maasai Mara today. They are quality hotels and we want them to remain so.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I know that the KTGA does have interests in certain hotels also in Mara like the Ol Kororok Lodge and I realise that some are going to be sold. I just want to plead that some of these be sold to the local people there. Some people are bidding; they may not have as much cash as other people do, but I think that it is important that the Maasai people who live there do get shares in some of these hotels.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to invite the Minister for Tourism to answer one question. Who works in the Mara? Who is it who works in the Mara? Who is employed in the Mara? Who is employed in Amboseli? Who is employed in the Samburu Lodges? We, being the people residing within those areas have been given a raw deal. The hotels, granted, are owned by people from around here and you will find that in some of the hotels, the big men, the general managers, the group managers or the personnel managers send people from their tribes to go their on the pretext that they are training.

**An hon. Member:** You are right!

**The Assistant Minister, Office of the President (Mr. Sunkuli):** And there is a perpetual influx of trainees there and in fact, the local people do not get a chance. This is compounded by the fact that Utalii College is not taking students on a quota basis. I think it is important that affirmative action be taken, that people from Maasailand be taken to Utalii College on affirmative basis.

They have tried a lot. I am not saying that they are unfair, and whether they acknowledge the fact or not as to whether the Maasai people meet the qualification or not; the major industry that they have today is the tourist

industry and they should be able to take our ladies who are also as beautiful as any other. They can act as receptionists. Our men are as handsome as any other. They can work in the tourist industry and I wish to invite my friend, the Minister for Tourism, to actually recognise these facts and stand up and coming from the Rift Valley himself and say: "As long as I am the Minister, I want to help the Maasai people go to Utalii College". The Utalii College is run by a very competent principal right now and I am sure that when he hears my sentiments, next year we are going to see a big change in admitting the Maasai.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, there is an organisation called KATO; that is, the Kenya Association of Tour Operators which, in fact, does so many things which, if we investigate very carefully, are going to destroy the tourist industry. I think it is important that the activities of KATO become transparent, so that we know what KATO is upto and who is KATO? That is the question that we want to ask right now. I do not want to delve into the details right now. The Minister does know, in fact, what the operations of KATO are but they help in the collection of fees. Sometimes, they manufacture their own receipts and so on; things which ought not to be done if the tourist industry is to be developed.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we have recently improved the roads within the Maasai Mara and when I say "we", I am referring to the county councils of Narok and Trans-Mara. Today, if you got to Keekorok Lodge, you can go to Serena Lodge within thirty minutes. It used to take two hours. We have improved the roads and we are continuing to improve the roads within the Mara. You can now reach Maasai Mara very comfortably in a good car. Well, it has to be a four-wheel drive because you want to see the animals inside but I just want to say that, it is not as bad as it used to be. But I just want to ask the Minister together with the Minister in charge of Public Works, and Housing to also go and do the roads which are classified so that Maasai Mara becomes a good destination.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, lastly, I urge the Ministry to actually open up the road that is linking Kenya and Tanzania because we do not have to be competitors with Tanzania. We can be shareholders. Our tourists can go to Serena and then go and sleep in Tanzania if they like to do so. We can change the overflow of tourists who are now going to Tanzania.

With those remarks, I support.

**Mr. Wamae:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me the opportunity to make my contribution to on this Vote of this very important Ministry of Tourism which the Minister has read in his budget today. Kenyan tourism has been going down. In the last four years, tourism has been on the decline and it has been for so many reasons. The Likoni episode of 1997 was only one incident which really gave it a big shock. However, tourism was declining even before the Likoni incident and this is what we should think about. Why has our tourism been declining?

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, some of the reasons why tourism has been declining is that, we have not been spending enough in marketing Kenya. The marketing by the Ministry of Tourism has not been effective. It is not enough to put people in offices in London, Los Angeles, New York and Zurich. Without money to promote it, they do not do any service. In fact, our tourist offices abroad should be closed down. They should be closed down and let that work be done by the Kenya Tourist Board which is being financed partly by the tour operators; that is, by the people who have interest in tourism and let the money that we are spending from the Ministry in these overseas offices come here and promote local tourism, inspection of hotels and seeing whether the facilities are being kept to the required standards. Instead of being there let them be here. This is because what is happening is that, the question of word of mouth is the best marketing. When people come here and find that there are no roads and no proper services in the hotels, this is what they go and report there and then we get a drop in tourism. However, most important is infrastructure which I know is not the responsibility of the Ministry alone but the Ministry must put pressure that without proper infrastructure for tourists to move from one destination in Kenya to another--- For instance the drop in Mombasa tourism today is because of inaccessibility of Tsavo East and West. This is because tourists do not want to sit in Mombasa in a hotel with sun and sand. They want to visit game lodges and they want to go and see wildlife. If they cannot go to Maasai Mara, Voi East and West and Amboseli because of the roads, then they are not going to come and spend two weeks in Mombasa. It becomes a very dull life. If you were to stay in a hotel for two weeks just seeing the sun and sand without doing anything else, then it is boring. They want more activity and one of the activities is to go to see the wildlife in Tsavo East. This Mombasa-Nairobi Road is killing our tourism. This road is a key thing for the revival of our tourism and I think the Ministry should put emphasis on the Government that, this is a very important factor.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the second thing is the security. Nobody wants to go and spend his holiday in a place where he is not sure of his life. Leaving even your home to go to the market if you are not sure of your life is risky and people even save for a lifetime to take a holiday for two weeks and somebody who has saved for 12 months to go on holiday wants to make sure that he can enjoy that holiday. He does not want to be

looking behind his back whether somebody is attacking him or not. Security is a major issue and dealing with security, let us deal with security for all people of Kenya; that is, for Kenyans and foreigners. We cannot deal with the security for foreigners only. It must be total security for everybody. But for the area where tourism is concentrated, I support the idea of the police security. The police should be assigned duties and trained to work with tourism. That is to make sure that the beaches at night are safe and there is security near the hotels to assist the hotel managers to make sure that people can sleep at night. This is because one dead tourist is like 1,000 dead Kenyans. There in Europe, it will hit the headlines that "A German national has died in Kenya" or "A Briton has been murdered". When one tourist was murdered in Mtwapa the other day and when a chartered plane came from Europe that week, there were no Britons who came on that plane. They cancelled their trips saying that the British are being killed in Kenya because one died in Mtwapa for whatever reasons.

So, you must know that this is a very sensitive industry and the only way that you can help this industry is to have resources to market it. When Egypt lost 56 tourists, they spent a lot of money in Europe, advertising to neutralise that effect. No tourist was attacked after Likoni but that report in Europe made tourists cancel their trips. We did not have the resources to go to Europe and put a counter-offensive. We did not do it and this is why I am saying that, let the Kenya Tourist Board use the Government and the private sector to deal with the promotion of tourism and let the Ministry concentrate on licensing and keeping standards and training of the people who run the hotels.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the bulk of our tourists come from Europe, mostly Germany, Switzerland, Italy, France and Britain. Those are the bulk of our tourists with the Germans being the most but surprisingly, the biggest drop today is from Germany. I think there is too much coverage of things that happen in Kenya in Germany. That is where the biggest drop has been in tourism. In Switzerland where the private sector is working with the Government and the Kenya Tourist Board, tourists have come back. In Italy, you will find that they are now going to Zanzibar. I do not know why they are feeling unsafe in Malindi. Most of the hotels there are closed now.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, as we speak today, most of the hotels in the Coast today are bankrupt. They are bankrupt because they have no business. I do not know how long the owners will continue financing and keeping them open, paying the bank interests and so forth without them being closed. Even if they are closed, we do not know who is going to buy them and support them because if you do not have tourists, nobody is going to bring them in his own way. There is no way. So, this is a very serious matter. Is there any scheme which the Government can implement to assist the hotels to survive for the time being, before the tourists can start coming back?

It is not the fault of those hotels that tourists do not go there. It is because of insecurity problems. What can the Government do about it? When everybody is bankrupt, no one can help the Government. In fact, this is why I would think that some of the money from the Catering Levy Fund should be used to support those hotels. Students at the Kenya Utalii College must also cost-share like their counterparts in teacher training colleges and other colleges. Why should students at the Kenya Utalii College be given special advantage unlike students in other sectors? Even in the medical training colleges, there is cost-sharing.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the Government should introduce cost-sharing at the Kenya Utalii College and use the money it will save to support these hotels to survive. This is because, in any case, the money in the Catering Levy Fund came from the tourism industry and specifically, the tour operators. The Government should return that money to them now that they are in problems. When hotels do well, they do not mind, but now is the time when the Government should give something back to the hoteliers, particularly those in the Coast Province because they are in serious problems. Tour operators are now saying that if one buys an air ticket to Mombasa from Nairobi, one can spend two nights free of charge in their hotels. That is almost giving that service for free. One can get meals at a half board price of only Kshs100,000, which is very cheap. This means the hoteliers are desperate. They are not doing so because they are making money but rather because they want to at least survive. About 50 per cent of hotel workers at the Coast, who are about 50,000, have been laid off. Most of the hotels are now operating with skeleton staff and casual workers because of the problem of low flow of tourists.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to ask the Government to concentrate on this issue and do something about it. There have been meetings between the Ministry of Tourism and hoteliers during which many proposals were made. However, none of those proposals has been accepted or implemented by the Government, except that of supporting the Kenya Tourist Board. Hoteliers have even asked the Government to waive Value Added Tax (VAT) for them now that they have problems, but the Government has not replied to them. These are some of the matters which we feel the Government seems not to address in responding to the cries of the industry's operators. When the good times come, hoteliers will not mind paying extra money to support the Government. Now that they are in problems, let the Government do something to help keep them operational. The

lodges around Mount Kenya, Maasai Mara and Samburu are doing much better than those in coastal areas. Those do not need any support at the moment. However, there is a major problem at the coast. This is because hoteliers there used to rely on package tours, which are no longer coming in large numbers. So, there is need for special support.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, with those few words, I would like to support the Vote. Thank you.

**The Minister for Co-operative Development** (Dr. Anangwe): Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to this Motion. I would like to begin by saying that I support the Motion. I would also like to urge my colleagues to support the Vote so that it can be passed.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, it has been rightly said that the tourist sector used to be a major foreign exchange earner. It is still an important sector that needs to be nurtured. It still contributes about 9.2 per cent of the Gross National Product (GNP). Notwithstanding the problems the sector is facing currently, it still contributes 18 per cent of national foreign exchange earnings and 11.2 per cent of Government revenue.

In its heydays, the tourism sector used to generate about 138,000 employment opportunities in the formal sector, and 360,000 in the informal sector. So, notwithstanding the current problems it is facing, the sector still has the potential and, therefore, should be supported, improved and developed. This country has the potential to attract about two million tourists per year. It still has the ability to earn foreign exchange for this country. I am saying this against the industry's backdrop growth globally of about five per cent annually. So, the environment is still okay. We can still tap a lot of resources from this sector.

It has been said here that the sector is experiencing problems. That is true. Data is abundant. The overall tourist visits to this country over the past years show a major decline from a peak period of about 863,000 visitors annually in 1994 to less than 600,000 visitors currently. I have been told that there has been a decline on specific tourist markets. In the United States of America, there has been a decline of 30 per cent since 1991, and this has not improved. Also, on the European market there has been decline of 10 per cent. Hotel bed occupancy, as the Minister has said, has dropped to below 50 per cent. When one looks at the distribution of the decline in hotel bed occupancy between 1991 and 1996 one will realise that probably the particular picture has not been well captured.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, hardest hit by these problems is of course the North Eastern Province, which has experienced a decline of 84 per cent, the Maasai Lodges, 13 per cent; Nairobi, 75 per cent; and, of course, the coastal beaches, 19 per cent. So, all we are saying is that the picture is not very good although we have attributed the slump in the industry to various situations that the country has faced. Whereas it is true that the Government has a role to play in improving the infrastructure, coping with insecurity and promoting the country's tourism industry abroad, I think, also, the private sector has a role to play. One cannot leave the development of this sector solely to the Government. The Government may do its bit, and do it very well. But the private sector also has a role to play. Adverse publicity is one of the major causes of the problem. This can of course be attributed to what journalists and the media publish. I would like to request members of both the print and electronic media to take cognisance of whatever they publish in respect of this country. Adverse reporting, whether true or false, could be contributing to the decline of the country's tourism sector.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, in terms of the role of the hotels and tour operators, one can readily say that they are boring tourists. That is why tourists cannot frequent our hotels and lodges. They are still confining themselves to the traditional tourism products. They take our guests to beach hotels, hang around with them, take them to national parks to take photographs, *et cetera*. I think this is no longer fashionable. There are many areas which offer competition and, probably, some of the products we offer are very expensive. So, we really need to re-strategise our plans to cope with the situation. Also, there is need for hotels and tour operators to diversify their tourist products.

I think many people in the world over are going for activity based tourism where you combine pleasure with business. You want to go and enjoy cultural tourism, you want to go and participate in a conference and at the same time, you want to go to mountain climbing and so forth. These are the kind of products that probably may attract tourists. The main reason why tourists like to visit Kenya or other places is to see something new. But our problem is that we have not been able to diversify or break out of that circle where we offer conventional traditional tourist products. With respect to domestic tourism, it has been said that we are not taking advantage of our tourist opportunities in this country. I would like to clarify one point. If one looked at the figures in 1996 and compared those of foreign tourists with those of Kenyans who visited registered accommodation, in fact, the number of Kenyans who visited registered accommodation was much higher. It was 782,600 whereas the tourists were 714,400. But what is most critical is that whatever the domestic tourists were able to generate is peanuts compared with what foreign tourists generated.

In 1996, foreign tourists with fewer numbers generated about K£1.28 billion whereas the Kenyans who were moving about generated only K£47 million. The critical issue here is not so much about improving or

promoting domestic tourism, it is promoting the quality of domestic tourism. Even those with money do not go to these hotels, they would rather leave Nairobi and go to Mombasa and live in "back streets" or very cheap hotels because they would like to save. That particular culture has invaded many of our tourist facilities. If you go to Mombasa and you would like to be generous to spend money and you walk into a hotel, immediately the waiter sees you, because he is not used to seeing black people there, he would like to discourage you. From my own experience as a Cabinet Minister, I walked into a hotel on an official tour and as I sat down expecting service, a hotel waiter came in and told me that the whole place was booked. I looked at him on his face and I saw that he did not want to see me. So, I had to insist and told him that I needed to stay there and I had a right to be served. That is the character of the perceptions in that part. It is not so much to do with what these particular waiters think, it is because they are not used to seeing black people there.

Let me support the Ministry by encouraging many of us, those who are able to, please, go and spend because probably you will live longer. Some of us cannot afford the opportunity to go and relax. It is no wonder that we die after a short illness. It is no wonder that the life expectancy in this country is lower. Let us provide opportunities for ourselves to go and relax so that we can enjoy.

Coming back to the Vote of the Ministry; I know they are asking for about K£7.6 million in Recurrent Budget and K£382,000 in Development Budget. This is an overall decline. For instance, with respect to the Recurrent Budget, the decline is by 14 per cent as compared to last year and 61 per cent for Development Budget respectively. That means resources are not available and the real challenge is on the private sector to offer alternative resources and investment. We call upon them to invest more so that we can have more tourists coming.

With those few words, I beg to support.

**Mr. Kariuki:** Thank you very much, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to comment on the proposals made by the Minister for Tourism. It is unfortunate that the once thought foreign exchange earner has now gone down so badly that the tourist industry has nearly collapsed. I think we should be addressing the causes of this decline so that we can revive this major industry. A lot has been said about security and I think that needs no emphasis that one of the major causes of the decline has been insecurity. Maybe, when the clashes were perpetuated in Likoni nobody knew the effect that they would have on tourism. I think it is important that the Government addresses the issue of security on a continuous basis and not on piecemeal basis so that we can all together work towards restoring confidence that has been badly shattered and lost as a result of insecurity. Although we are blaming the Press for misreporting and distortions, I think the Press has a right to talk about the truth. If people die at Likoni, there is no way we can say that they are not dying. I think the issue we should address is what caused the clashes and how can we stop that type of occurrence, otherwise there will be a repeat of this type of problem. We have all sat on our laurels and assumed that all is well when we ourselves are the cause of this problem. I think security does not only touch on Likoni, because when we hear of Julie Ward or other people being beaten up in Maasai Mara or other parks; we should be addressing this as a continuous problem rather than just sticking to the issue of Likoni in isolation. The issue of security ought to be discussed in totality and there ought to be continuous and perpetual police surveillance in all areas where tourists go so that we can then thereafter reinforce the confidence that has been badly shattered.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, something has been said about marketing and it is important for us to note that civil servants are not marketers. We should leave business to business people. That is why we have idle offices all over the world calling themselves tourists offices. A civil servant is essentially trained to administer, collect taxes, police and do that type of thing, but not to sit in an office talking about tourism. Some of them have are very ill-equipped. In fact, some of them who talk in Toronto or London about Maasai Mara, have never been there. I think the first thing we ought to do is to train our own officers, if at all they have to go there. We should take them round the country and let them see all the game parks. Let them have total orientation on the products they are offering. Some of them are very badly equipped, because, if at all you talking about a product, you must know it very well. That is why I said, maybe, what we should be looking at is how we can give incentives to our tour agents and operators to help them sell the country more.

The potential is not only in Europe and America. The other day I went to South East Asia. The Japanese, Koreans, Taiwanese and Singaporeans know nothing about Kenya; they know more about South Africa than they know about Kenya. They think that there are better game parks in Zimbabwe than there are in Kenya because South Africa is doing a lot of marketing. They sell their country continuously, we do not do it. I think we believe so much in Kenya being the best country in Africa and the most successful and so forth. I think somebody has been flattering us and telling us all those things about Kenya whereas we are hopeless as far as marketing is concerned. I think we should be more shrewd in going out there, looking at potential areas and maybe spending a lot of money on marketing. We are not spending enough. In business you have to invest in order to get profits. Here, we wait for profits without working for them. I think it is unfortunate. The Ministry here should be talking

about a huge budget in advertising not just the peanuts you are talking about in the budget because, if at all we expect the tourist industry to pick up and become the major foreign exchange earner, we must put in a lot in advertising. I think we are becoming shy in this respect. Mr. Minister, you should be addressing the issue of coming up with a realistic budget on marketing, advertising and public relations so that you can have enough money to sell Kenya out there. Plus, of course, provision of materials. If you go into those tourist offices in London, they have scant information. They have no brochures, no printed materials that can help people know about the country. If you ask about pricing, they do not know, they have to ring Nairobi. They are ill-equipped, to say the least.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, it is true that the Government had poached Dr. Richard Leakey from Safina party. Maybe he will help the KWS to come back to sanity and contribute something towards anti-poaching exercises, and ensuring security of the tourists in other parts and preservation of Wildlife. We wish him well. But, of course, when you look at privatisation, one is left in total disgust. Look at a company like African Tours and Hotel which was one of the top listed companies on the Stock Exchange. It went under as a result of mismanagement and corruption. Officers there had been perpetuating corruption over the years. They were not even preparing accounts for over five years. That is a disaster! If at all we would have a good Ministry, with able officers in KTDC, then we ought to do continuous accounting and auditing of various institutions that fall under your Ministry. You are not doing enough auditing and follow-up, and as a result, these hotels are collapsing. Ultimately, you want to privatise them when they are collapsing. Nobody will buy a dying company. People want to buy companies which are profitable. Therefore, you should feed your cows before you sell them in a market place. Otherwise, a dying cow will have nobody in the market to buy it. It is important, therefore, that those institutions that fall under the Ministry are revived and continuously monitored and controlled and that proper accounting of funds takes place.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the other aspect is, of course, the issue of the downturn we have right now, whereby we are talking about the collapse in the tourism industry. This is the right time for you to do planning; address issues like electricity shortages in beach hotels in the Coast. Talk to the Kenya Power and Lighting Company and get them to increase the supply of power within those areas. This is the time for you to ask yourself why do we have water shortages in beach hotels and how that water can be increased so that there is water supply in all the beach hotels, and this kind of thing.

We should not just sit back and wait. We in Kenya are very good at managing by crisis. You wait until there is a shortage and then you address issues. This is the time to do all these things, including of course, addressing the issue of infrastructure. When we have a low season, like now, this is the time to address those issues rather than wait until the industry picks up again.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, as far as domestic tourism is concerned, I am ashamed to hear from the Minister, who had just spoken just before me, talking about people dying because of short illness caused by lack of domestic tourism. I think people cannot afford it! There is no money! Our purchasing power has gone down. Inflation has eaten into our money so much. There are no investment funds. We have no savings. People are poorer than they were ten years ago. So, what do you expect them to spend? What we should be addressing is how we can make the Kenyan people richer and make them more productive so that they can have something to save and spend in luxuries like tourism because certainly tourism is a luxury. Only the rich can afford it, and we are not rich. Our people have become poorer. This Government should address the issue of how to help Kenyan people become richer because we have only a few millionaires and very many millions of beggars in this country. Therefore, the potential in the domestic tourism is zero to say the least. So, really, the issue here is; how do we help the Kenyan people to become richer? We have to create a conducive environment through which Kenyan people can make money, and not being negative, and holding back certain people because you do not want them to run very fast. Otherwise, you may end up governing a country of paupers which is very sad.

Mr. Temporary deputy Speaker, Sir, something was mentioned about the collapse of coastal hotels. It is important that the Government should address the issue of subsidizing those hotels during this period when the industry is facing collapse. Maybe banks should be appealed to, to waive interest that would eventually kill them. If only the banks could waive interest during this period, until the tourism industry recovers, it will be good.

The other aspect is to request banks to withhold the payments at least for some time so that these hotels can be able to pick up. I think this should be a positive action on the side of the Government. Maybe it can also include the Government chipping in to see that none of those hotels goes under or is put under receivership. This is very important because we would like to see the tourist industry pick up in due course. Of importance also, is the issue of the local people sharing the benefits accruing from tourism. The coast people would feel offended if at all they do not partake in the benefits that accrue from the tourism industry. It is important---

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, with those few words, I support the Motion.



**The Minister for Home Affairs, National Heritage, Culture and Social Services** (Mr. Nassir): Asante Bw. Naibu Spika wa muda kwa kunipa nafasi hii ili na mimi nizungumze juu ya mashamba yetu katika Coast Province kwani mahoteli ni moja katika mashamba yetu. Wengine wana mashamba ya kahawa, majani chai na sisi yetu ni haya---

*(An hon. Member interjected)*

Bw. Kaimu Naibu Spika nataka kidogo unisaidie kwa sababu rafiki yangu Mhe. Munyao ana tabia ya kuniingilia nikesema. Nataka kuwaeleza ya kuwa waendeleo kusema. Lakini, nikiwaingilia watalia.

Bw. Naibu Spika wa muda, yangu ni haya. Wenzangu wanasema---

**Mr. Munyao:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Ni kweli kuwa Waziri ni rafiki yangu. Lakini, kama hakuona aliyemkatiza nampa hii miwani ili aone vizuri kwa sababu sio mimi. Ni mhe. Mwenje.

*(Mr. Munyao gave his spectacles to Mr. Nassir)*

But it is also true that he is smaller than me.

**The Minister for Home Affairs, National Heritage, Culture and Social Service** (Mr. Nassir): Bw. Kaimu Naibu Spika, huyu Mbunge mwenzangu na Bw. Mwenje, hii ni tabia yao tangu zamani. Ni ugonjwa wao kuchokoza watu.

*(Laughter)*

**Mr. Mwenje:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Is it really in order for the Minister to impute bad motives on me when he did not even hear who spoke? I do not know whether it was hon. Munyao or any other person. Now, he is imputing bad motives on me? Can he withdraw that before he continues? I cannot allow that kind of insinuation about me.

**The Minister for Home Affairs, National Heritage, Culture and Social Services** (Mr. Nassir): Bw. Naibu Spika wa muda, Mhe. Mwenje hawachi mtu yeyote kusema lolote kwa sababu anafikiria kuwa Bunge hili ni yeye peke yake tu!

**Mr. Mwenje:** On a Point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker Sir. That is even more serious. It is adding insult to injury. He did impute bad motives on me, and now he has insulted me! I demand that he now withdraws; I did not say anything as I am just seated here. He did not hear anything from me and he goes on to insult me. I demand that he withdraws, otherwise I will name him! I will move that he be named.

*(Laughter)*

**Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker** (Mr. Imanyara): Order, Members! Hon. Nassir, I think it is only fair and proper to be told that hon. Mwenje did not speak. So, please withdraw the allegations against him. He did not speak at all.

**Mr. Nguire:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the hon. Minister referred to Nyanja, not Mwenje.

**The Minister for Home Affairs, National Heritage, Culture and Social Services** (Mr. Nassir): Bw. Naibu Spika wa muda, kwa sababu nataka kuzungumza juu ya Hoja iliyo mbele ya Bunge, nakubali na yeye aendele na ujeuri wake.

*(Laughter)*

I apologise, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Nilikuwa nataka kuzungumzia juu ya hii Hoja kwa sababu wengi wamesema juu ya habari ya utangazaji wa shuguli za utalii. Ukienda nchi zote katika ulimwengu na ufunguwe runinga, kwanza utaonyeshwa mahoteli yao na ngoma za kitamaduni zao kwa muda wa dakika kumi hadi kumi na tano. Ukija hapa, maboloji wao wote huleta vitabu kwetu kwa kila ofisi ili kuonyesha nchi zao zinaendelea namna gani. Lakini kule kwa ofisi za mabalozi wetu hawafanyi haya. Lazima Wizara ipewe pesa zaidi kwa sababu kuna njia nyingine inayotumiwa na hao watalii. Kama sasa, hata kama watalii watakuja, na watumie barabara ya Mombasa ambayo hali yake ni mbaya, wengine hawawezi kurudi nchini baada ya kuitumia mara moja kusafiri. Ni lazima barabara zitengenezwe kwani watalii huenda wanaenda kuangalia wanyama katika

mito.

Bw. Naibu Spika wa Muda pia chuo cha Utalii yafaa kianze kufundisha watu chakula chetu cha Kenya. Mimi nikienda kokote nala chakula cha China, Malaysia na chakula--- Hawanipi chakula chetu tunachokula. Mzungu akija hapa hataki kupewa viazi, kabeji, na nyama ya nguruwe. Mzungu anataka kujua sisi twala kitu gani hapa. Ni vizuri sana watu wafunzwe, kwani watu wengine hawajakula hapa samaki wa kupaka, wali wa nazi, mhogo--- Wazungu wakila hivi vyakula, wataambiana huko ya kuwa "Kama utafika Coast Province, huko Kenya, utakula chakula kizuri ambacho hujala."

Bw. Naibu Spika wa Muda, inafaa Wizara ipewe pesa ili istawishe mambo ya utalii kwa sababu hatuwezi kungojea watu wa hoteli wafanye vile wanataka. Kama tunataka utalii uwe wa maana katika uchumi wetu, ni lazima tuwapatie watu vitu ambavyo wanavipenda. Kama ni muziki ama mambo ya kale yafaa tuwapatie. Ningependa kumuoma Waziri mwenzangu aje tushirikiane kwa sababu kuna vitu vingi ambavyo watalii wanataka kuona lakini museum iko mbali. Tunaweza kupeleka vitu hivi katika hoteli za watalii ili waweze kuviona.

Pia, ningependa Wizara ya Utalii idumishe usawa katika kuajiri wafanyakazi. Isiwe kwamba kama mkurugenzi wa hoteli ni Bw. Nassir, ni lazima aajiri watu wa kwao tu. Haya ndiyo maneno yanayotuletea madhara mwishoni. Wakenya wanapendana lakini ikifika mambo ya tumbo, kama mwenzako anakula na wewe unalala njaa, kunakuwa na taabu. Yafaa tupendane, tusaidiane na pia tusaidie nchi yetu kwa kuleta usawa kwa wafanyakazi. Tukifanya hivyo, mambo yatanyooka vizuri na watalii wengi watatembelea nchi yetu. Watalii wanapenda sehemu za Pwani na hali sisi hatupati faida yoyote. Inafaa sisi watu wa Pwani turuhusiwe kudai kiasi fulani cha pesa kutoka kwa watalii kama vile majani chai na kahawa hutozwa cess. Tukifanya hivyo, kutakuwako na usawa katika mambo ya maendeleo. Nimatumaini yangu kwamba mambo ya usawa yatazingatiwa katika Katiba mpya itakayoandikwa. Kulemeana ni kubaya! Siku moja tutainua guu. Hata ndugu zangu Wakristo, Wataita, zamani kama ungewakanyaga, hawangeweza kukukanyaga lakini leo, watakukanyaga pao hapo. Kwa hivyo, nia yetu katika utalii ni kuweza kueleza watu, ili wafahamu.

Mambo ya utamaduni yafaa yawe katika Wizara. Tusiwangoje watu wa hoteli watufanyie kazi. Kuna ngoma nyingine tukiwapigia ndugu zetu kutoka huko juu kwenye kahawa, itawafanya kuwa wazimu. Kuna ngoma kule Pwani ambayo ikipigiwa watu katika hoteli, badala ya kukaa siku tano, wanakaa siku kumi. Ukweli wa mambo ni kwamba ni sisi ambao tutatengeneza mambo ya utalii yawe mazuri. Ni lazima chakula katika hoteli kiwe cha kila aina. Tuwapikie vyakula vya kikwetu na si vyakula vya kikwao.

Mimi naunga mkono kwamba Wizara ya Utalii ipewe pesa nyingi ili ifanye kazi nzuri.

**Mr. Wambua:** Thank you very much, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me the opportunity to contribute to this Motion. I would like to say that this is one of the most vital Ministries which we should consider because the tourism industry is bringing a lot of foreign exchange and we should take very keen interest in it. I appeal to my friend, the Minister for Tourism, to be keen on the contributions of hon. Members in this House because there is no way any hon. Member can come up to oppose the activities of the tourism industry. It is only that there are some areas which we would like to see rectified. For instance, in the local promotion of the tourism industry, we should consider some of the local promoters. Some of these things which, of course, you do not consider very seriously, are the ones which make tourists visit our country. Every country has got its culture and most of the tourists would like to go to different countries to see their cultures and their ways of life.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to say something on curio business. The curio industry makes many tourists come to this country. Sometimes when they visit our national parks and they see, for instance, an elephant, a lion or a giraffe, since they would like to take the message home to their fellow countrymen, they go to the curio industry and buy curios of the same animals which were of interest to them to take to their families at home. They use such curios to tell their families and friends the type of animals that are found in Kenya. The curio industry should be given an opportunity, because most of the tourists come to see the woodcarvers and they are surprised how Kenyans carve these woods because they have tried with machines and they cannot make it. But if they go to an industry like Mombasa Curio Industry, they see the real carving being done by hand. So, the Ministry of Tourism should consider these people and if there are some plots like the one at Kigali Market they should be considered. That is why I said, as the Chairman of the Kigali Market Curio Traders, we see no reason for any person to be given a plot while about 300 curio traders who earn this country over Kshs400 million in foreign exchange are ignored. They should be considered for this. Although these people are earning their living out of it, still they are contributing to the national coffers. So, I would like the Minister for Tourism to support me when I raise be raising this matter because it is still on.

I would like to say something on security. It has been very shameful because tourists cannot walk freely in the City and other towns like Mombasa and elsewhere. There are these street children who are grown-ups and they snatch handbags from tourists in the streets. The Government should secure the tourists who come to our country. If they come here and they are robbed, they send a very bad message to their countrymen.

The security issue should be addressed very seriously because this is the only way we can promote and develop our tourist industry.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the other thing is about high rates in our national parks. I understand the Ministry of Tourism is taking this into consideration. But there are certain local authorities in this county that charge other rates apart from the ones recommended by the Government so that they can generate revenue. For example, in Maasai Mara Game Reserve, tourists are charged high rates so that Narok County Council can generate revenue. If we charge high rates in our national parks and game reserves, then the tourists will go to other countries where they are charged less because they are not ready to pay more. So, I would like the Minister for Tourism, in collaboration with the local authorities, to charge reasonable rates so that the tourists do not get discouraged and go to other countries where they are not charged as much as we do.

The other thing is about promotion of tourism by airlines. Last week, when I was coming back from the USA, at Frankfurt, I learned that Lufthansa are withdrawing their aircraft from Kenya, with effect from next year.

This is very serious because if this company re-routes its aircraft to South Africa, then the tourists who have been using Air Lufthansa will go to South African and other countries. I hope the Minister will intervene so that they can retain their flights to Kenya even if they do not earn a lot of money. But during the months of August, September and November, which is the peak period for tourists, they get enough money which can make them retain their flights to Kenya.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like also touch on our roads. Our roads are in a pathetic condition. I agree with the Minister that roads leading to national parks are really terrible. For example, in Tsavo National Park, even the local tourist companies which runs the vehicles in this area have grounded their vehicles because of the poor state of road. I would suggest that the Minister should solicit for some funds from the donors in order to maintain roads in our national parks and game reserves. If our roads are good, more tourists will come to our country. This is the only way we can promote the tourism industry locally and abroad. But if our roads are in a sorry state, then tourists will run away from Kenya because they cannot access our national parks. I would request the Minister to utilise this money well in order to improve our roads and promote tourism industry. I also feel that the tour operators should be requested to assist in maintaining our roads. For instance, tourist hotels earn a lot of money when there are more tourists coming to our country. So, they should allocate part of their profits for the promotion of tourism and maintenance of roads leading to our national parks and game reserves. We know that the Government does not have enough money to maintain roads and other development projects, but we should involve tour operators and other stakeholders in the industry in the promotion of tourism in this country.

With these few remarks, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I do support the Vote of the Ministry of Tourism.

**The Minister for Energy** (Mr. Okemo): Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker Sir, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to contribute on this vote. I would like to make a few observations as far as tourism is concerned in this country. At one time the tourism industry was very vibrant and a high profile income earning sector of the Kenyan economy. Today, we are in a completely different scenario. I think what we should be asking ourselves is what happened to bring us from that situation to where we are today. I think quite a number of hon. Members who have spoken before me have articulated reasons for this. These are insecurity, poor infrastructure and high exchange rates. Today, many of these issues are being addressed, but it is unfortunate that these efforts are not being recognised by some hon. Members in the House.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I think the question of insecurity has been spoken about by everybody. We do know that insecurity falls into various categories. Many hon. Members have talked about clannism, ethnic clashes and so on. But there is insecurity that is related to ordinary banditry, gangsterism and thuggery. I think these are generally related, not just to the tourism sector, but to the general security situation in the country. In the past, we have heard comments to the effect that efforts to improve security have been inadequate because of lack of funds. For the arms of security to be able to do their job properly, they must have the equipment, the weaponry and freedom to move from one point to another. I think this is the problem that is related to the overall problem of budgetary constraints. So, I do not foresee us being able to solve the security problem in the short-run. It has to be a gradual process; until the funds are available that can be adequately used towards this particular aspect.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, the question of infrastructure is very vital. I think when we talk specifically about the tourism industry, we are talking about water, roads and electricity. The problem of roads, as we know, has been a combination of both inaction and natural calamities. As a result, we have roads that are in a horrible state and, therefore, inaccessibility is an automatic eventuality.

On the question of electricity, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, in my Ministry, for example, we have

very definite and firm plans to increase electricity generation and supply to all parts of the country so that lack of electricity does not become a bottle neck in the tourism industry.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, these steps are being taken to revive our tourism industry. They may not be apparent tomorrow or next year, but with time, what we ought to be looking at is whether we are making progress in the right direction, and not whether we shall be able to solve the problem facing tourism next month. That is not possible, because it is a long term problem. The next thing that we should really bear in mind is that tourism is a very sensitive sector. It is very sensitive to the signals that are sent as far as the stability or instability of the political system is concerned. The confidence which may have been built over many years can be eroded overnight simply because there is a sensational story in the newspapers, saying that there is a Motion of no confidence in the Government and it is falling tomorrow. That can send very dangerous signals. It did send dangerous signals prior to the Motion of no confidence in the Government that we had in this House recently. That is a fact and we cannot deny it. Having gone over that hurdle, the confidence has come back again since both the local and the international communities are convinced that the Government is in place, strong and in control.

These are the signals that we want to send out, so that foreign investors can know that Kenya is a safe place where they can do business. The tourists will also know that Kenya is a safe place to visit. Certain signals, as I said earlier, can be very dangerous. Sometimes we should not send them out in a frivolous and adventurous manner. We must know that everything that we say has a repercussion on our country and the price we will pay for it can be very high.

Hon. Members have spoken in this House about domestic tourism and how we should try and promote it. An hon. Member rightly said that one cannot go for a holiday to Mombasa when he cannot pay school fees, loans or rent. However, as we all know, Kenya does not live in isolation. It is part of the global community, and the economic situation throughout the world today is one where we have recession. All those countries in South-East Asia, including Japan, are undergoing a difficult time. Russia, Philippines and Great Britain are also good examples. When you look at the projections they had made on economic growth--- It has turned out that the rate of growth of their economies has gone down by almost a half. So, Kenya is not alone and we need to recognise that fact. Sometimes when we are passing judgement on ourselves, let us not be too harsh and set standards that are too high for ourselves.

When it comes to domestic tourism, we should try to make it attractive. We should also make it affordable for the local people so that they can enjoy the facilities that exist in this country. We know that the facilities do exist. In fact, we have some of the best beach hotels and game parks in the world. When an hon. Member tells us that the local tourists should go and see wild animals in zoos, that is a ridiculous proposal. This is because an animal in a zoo is completely different from that one which is walking freely in the game park. Therefore, domestic tourism should be encouraged as it is being done at the moment; by making it affordable and attractive to the local people. We should be talking about volume when we talk about domestic tourism. When we talk about foreign tourists, we should talk about quality tourism. Some statistics were given which indicate that the foreign tourists who visit this country are about the same number as the domestic tourists. But the amount of money or revenue that we generate from foreign tourists is about four or five times what the domestic sector generates. Therefore, we should continue to increase the number of local tourists so that in the overall we can get more revenue from the domestic sector.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would also like to mention something about the East African Community. The question of whether tourists should come to Kenya should be harmonised with what happens in Uganda and Tanzania. I think this is being addressed through the harmonisation of national plans of each country, so that what happens in Kenya and Tanzania, or between Kenya and Uganda, should be harmonised. Tourists who visit this country should leave some money here and proceed on to Uganda and vice versa, so that we can optimise the number of tourists that come to East Africa.

An hon. Member also mentioned the question of advertising and the quality of manpower that we have in our tourist offices. We should have people with the marketing knowledge, and who know about Kenya's tourism industry, stationed in the right areas.

With those few remarks I support the Vote.

**Mr. Mwenje:** Thank you, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to say a few words about the tourism industry. After all, most of the tourists who visit other parts of this country start from Nairobi City. Even those who go to Mombasa start from this City. One of the things that worry me is that we seem to be crying wolf, because we all know that tourism was at its height sometime ago. I can remember the Minister for Tourism saying in the past: "In the year 2000, we will have hit the figure of one or two million tourists coming to this country." Instead of going forward, we are going backward. If we continue the way we are doing, by the year 2000, the number of tourists who will visit this county will drop to 300,000 or 400,000. Who caused this

problem? We caused the problem for ourselves. The major reason, as every hon. Member has said here, is insecurity. I was worried the other day when we went to Mombasa, Intercontinental Hotel. I was surprised to be told by those fellows who operate in beaches that they hardly get enough money even for their own food, although some years ago they used to make a lot of money. In fact, they earned their living from the beaches. Today, those people are almost beggars. Who created this problem? We created the problem for ourselves. The main reason why the number of tourists has dropped is---- When I say "we" I am talking of Kenyans, including hon. Members, and I will be more specific when I go a little bit beyond that.

**Mr. Ndicho:** With an exception of me!

**Mr. Mwenje:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I mean that the problem was created by those people who are in charge of security. That is why we have lost all the business. There was a time when one could compare the agricultural sector with the tourism sector. In fact, I can recall that at one stage the tourism industry was ahead of the agricultural sector as an income earner. Today, it is far behind when you compare it with the agricultural sector. It is high time the Government addressed the issue of insecurity, because it has caused a lot of untold suffering to Kenyans who can no longer get jobs as a result of closure of some hotels in Mombasa Town. This is an issue that needs to be addressed urgently.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to support the previous hon. Member who said that parking boys are a nuisance to tourists who visit our country. When one is driving along the streets of Nairobi, one sees a parking boy running after a tourist. The tourist does not know whether the street boy is running after him to beg for money, rob him of his money or beat him up. We also ought to address ourselves to this problem. They get confused. We need to address ourselves to these problems. These street boys are a nuisance even to Nairobians and Kenyans at large. They need to be put in a place where they can be rehabilitated or trained. But we must remove them from our roads. The initiative can come from the Ministry of Tourism, or the Ministry of Local Authorities. But we must remove them from the streets. I expected the Minister to complain that unless these boys are removed, there is no way tourism can flourish in this country. This needs to be done urgently. It is not difficult to do it. We can put them in a big land somewhere, along one of the arable lands and make a big institute for them. That way, we will be able to assist the tourism industry.

This organisation called the KATO is very important. I am surprised to hear somebody attacking it. It is this organisation which is marketing this country in tourism. It is not our officers. We have travelled abroad and seen tourist offices there. They are not effective at all. It is up to the Minister to use these offices to allow KATO members to use them to market our tourism. The biggest thing we can do is to advertise. We do not advertise this country. Outside, it is not known what we can offer here. We need to use the offices outside. By so doing, the Minister should be very close to KATO. It is a very nice organisation and has helped a lot of their members. I think it is time the Ministry of Tourism operated very closely with KATO to achieve their goals. It is them who can market tourism and not our officers. I tend to agree with one Member who said that these officers should be purely there for administrative purposes, but not for marketing. For marketing, we should advertise and use KATO which has money. They are in business. They can raise a lot of money.

One other area which the Minister needs to address is language. I have noticed that a German coming from Germany will want to go and be served by a waiter who can speak the German language. The French tourists go to where French is spoken. You have noticed that even tourists here in Kenya have sub-divided themselves into different areas. Italians will go to Malindi. Germans will go to the South Coast. The British will go to the North Coast, and fortunately for Nairobi, all of them are here. I think we need to train more people in foreign languages. We should start teaching foreign languages in our ordinary schools. It costs extra funds for somebody to train in these languages. They have to go to a German school, or to a school which is teaching German, so that one can learn that language. I think the Minister has got to address himself to the language problem because most of the tourists are proud enough. We like them the way they are because they are tourists. But they would like to talk to somebody who can understand their language.

There is a lot of money which we pay every time we eat in a hotel. There is a training levy. We need the Minister to tell us how this money is used. If it is used by the Utalii College, then I do not see why in the Estimates, we are told that provisions must be made for the development of the College. They should be giving money to the Exchequer rather than asking for money from the Government. It is a lot of money. Every time I eat, I find that I pay Kshs2 or some amount towards the training levy. This money goes to the Utalii College. What is it being used for? Why do we have to provide more money for the same college and, yet, it is earning a lot of money? I know we have a very nice Principal in the name of Mr. Sio. He is a man that I respect. I like the way he is running that institution. He is attracting students from all over Africa. So, he is doing a good job. But we also need to be told what is being done with this money.

There is that Board, but is money being used properly from the Exchequer so that we can maintain this

college? It should be self-sufficient. I am glad it has improved a lot, but still we need to know how much of this money is being used.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, everybody has talked about roads and it is true that the condition of these roads are hampering the tourism industry. I suggest that the roads leading to national parks be maintained by the Ministry of Tourism. They should be taken over from the Ministry of Public Works and Housing which keeps on telling us that it is going to repair the roads tomorrow. We have been promised year in-year-out and it has become a very nice song that the Ministry of Public Works and Housing comes here and says, "we will construct that road tomorrow". We have seen that it does not happen, they only answer questions here. If tourism has to be promoted, these roads must be improved. Maybe, the Ministry of Tourism should take over the roads now, especially those inside and outside the parks.

The question of security inside the parks is also very important. We read every time that tourists were attacked inside the parks while we know that there is a police unit looking after the parks. What are they doing? Why are they not taking care of these tourists?

Most airlines do a lot of marketing. We have our National Carrier here, the Kenya Airways. The Kenya Airways needs to do tourism marketing in this country. Wherever they go they need to do it. I always read that when you are going to a place like Dubai where there is a lot of business, you find the airlines that fly to Dubai always advertise in the Press; that they have reduced the fare for those who are boarding their planes. Kenya Airways needs to be used by the Ministry of Tourism so that they can advertise on-and-off journeys. They should provide some cheaper transport to this country so that we can advertise our tourism. We have lost a lot of business through negligence in advertising and I think we can make use of Kenya Airways which can advertise outside this country.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, we have a duty now to create jobs through this Ministry of Tourism which has failed and has made so many of our people jobless.

With that, I support the Vote.

**Mr. Munyasia:** Thank you very much, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to this Motion. I want to state, at the outset, that I will support this particular Vote so that our friend, hon. Kosgey, can put into effect his tourism masterplan which he has promised to lay on the Table of this House before long. There is little that is being done about tourism at the moment, in Western Province, or in what they call the Western Circuit. So, I would have been naturally inclined to say: I withhold my vote for this one. But because of that promise, I want to say that the Minister had better pay attention to what I would like to say now, since I have promised to support the Vote.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to start with the question of adverse publicity which has hurt the tourism industry. We cannot exonerate ourselves from responsibility for such adverse publicity.

Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, this afternoon, I witnessed, for instance, a small matter being turned against a whole community. If anyone is guilty or not guilty of any particular offence, or an allegation of an offence, let him deal with that particular person who has brought that particular allegation. But when, we, who would otherwise have been inclined to support that Minister, whom we thought was being wronged; find that we are being banded together that, this is a Luhya conspiracy, we say, "So is it a Kisii theft"? Or something like that. We cannot exonerate ourselves from responsibility when we are making irresponsible statements.

**Mr. Obwocha:** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Are you satisfied that what hon. Munyasia is raising is matter to be revisited; A matter that has been closed by the substantive Speaker?

**The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Mr. Imanyara):** Mr. Obwocha, I do not think he is re-opening any matter. He is just illustrating the point he is making. That is all. Continue, Mr. Munyasia.

**Mr. Munyasia:** Thank you very much, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. I was talking about wild conjectures which later turn a small thing into a very big issue.

**The Assistant Minister for Transport and Communications (Mr. Obure):** On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir. Are you satisfied that what hon. Munyasia is raising right now has some bearing on the Vote of the Ministry of Tourism?

**The Temporary Deputy Speaker (Mr. Imanyara):** I am satisfied that what he is doing is in order. Continue, hon. Munyasia.

**Mr. Munyasia:** Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir, now you can see that, already, we are getting two hon. Members from one tribe standing up against me. That is why I said that we must be responsible in our utterances.

I sympathise with the Minister because I think what is hurting tourism most is the issue of security and yet security is not under his Ministry. So, he has to look to other people in other Ministries to ensure that there is security.

The Office of the President should do everything possible in the tourism sector to ensure that there is security. You must not give credit where it is not deserved. The Office of the President should be urged to take the issue of security more seriously. I am worried about what is happening, for instance, in Western Province. We thought these things you call "tribal clashes" and which I call "tribal terrorism" against the more peace loving groups were now a matter of history. But what is happening now, is that, small constituencies that have been turned into districts want to expand; and they want to expand at the expense of other districts; I can see Teso on one side. They have been given a district and they want to expand their boundaries into Bungoma.

*(Mr. Ekirapa stood up in his place)*

And my friend who is standing is the one who is doing it! Then we have Mt. Elgon which wants to expand its boundaries into Bungoma. This is what excites these clashes.

**The Assistant Minister for Information and Broadcasting** (Mr. Ekirapa): On a point of order, Mr. Temporary Deputy Speaker, Sir.

Is the hon. Member speaking in order to raise the issue of districts that are neighbouring him wanting to expand when he should be concentrating on the issue of improving tourism?

#### ADJOURNMENT

**The Temporary Deputy Speaker** (Mr. Imanyara): I am afraid this brings us to the end of today's proceedings.

Hon. Members, it is now time for the interruption of business. The House is, therefore, adjourned until tomorrow, Thursday, 29th October, 1998, at 2.30 p.m.

The House rose at 7.05 p.m.